CURRICULUM STUDIES IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP

RUGG

UNIVERSITY OF
CHARLESTON LIBRARY
1700036252

MORRIS HARVEY COLLEGE
CHARLESTON, WEST VIRGINIA

ANDREW S. THOMAS
MEMORIAL LIBRARY

CALL NUMBER
375.3
R843c

ACCESSION
6334

Date Due

DEC 20 1928			
1/8/29 Reserve			
APR 8 1929			
NOV 7 1930			
DEC 15 1930			
FEB 2 1934			
AUG 20 1934			
APR 23 1938			
JUL 15 1941			
JUN 30 '55			
MAR 9 '64 Pd			

Colorado Teachers College Education Series, No. 3

Curriculum Studies in the Social Sciences and Citizenship

(An Investigation Into Educational Values)

Do not return to library.

by
EARLE U. RUGG, PH.D. (Columbia)
Head of the Department of Education
Colorado State Teachers College
Greeley

COLORADO STATE TEACHERS COLLEGE
Greeley, Colo.
1928

515.5
R843c

Copyright, 1928, by Colorado State Teachers College

Printed in the United States of America
by
TRIBUNE-REPUBLICAN PUBLISHING CO.
Greeley, Colo.
1928

FOREWORD

This monograph is an attempt to use the semi-scientific studies of pioneer students and research workers in the field of the social sciences and citizenship education as criteria in evaluating the present program of materials in these subjects in the secondary school. The writer has made detailed analyses of the social science textbooks in common use in secondary schools. From these analyses he believes that he can set forth rather definitely, though necessarily within the limits of this monograph only in concise and summary form, the essential characteristics of what is taught pupils in order to meet the commonly claimed value of such studies—citizenship training. By using the semi-scientific studies as criteria in evaluating the present secondary social science-citizenship curriculum the writer believes he has some impersonal bases for partially answering the following questions: (1) To what extent does the present social science curriculum meet the social needs of secondary school pupils; (2) to what extent does it meet learning needs; and (3) to what extent does it provide for relative values?

The writer has sincerely endeavored to discover every impersonal or objective study of the value of the social science-citizenship curriculum. To this end, besides much detailed research of his own included herewith, he has searched the centers of research for additional material, both in published and unpublished form. His one regret is that only rather inadequate summaries of these studies can be given because of the lack of space.

The writer desires to acknowledge the courtesy of many college librarians for their cooperation in lending him copies of unpublished investigations on file in their libraries and his indebtedness to the individual authors of the studies he has made use of in his evaluation. For the interpretations set forth in this monograph he assumes full respon-

6334

sibility. He further acknowledges his indebtedness for many of the questions that he raises to the critical students of the curriculum with whom it has been his good fortune to have studied and worked—particularly to Professor Franklin Bobbitt, Professor F. G. Bonser, Professor W. W. Charters, Professor Ernest Horn, and his brother, Professor Harold Rugg.

This study is one of the reseach studies essential to the reorganization of the social science-citizenship curriculum made by Harold Rugg, Emma Schweppe, and the writer, and others, as embodied for several years in the trial editions of *The Social Science Pamphlets—Essentials in Geography, History, and Civics for the Junior High School.*

For this study as originally formulated and accepted as a doctor's dissertation in Teachers College, Columbia University, the author is under deepest obligation for the critical and friendly counsel and direction of Professor William Chandler Bagley, with whom the writer got his introduction to educational values in his first Education course at the University of Illinois in 1913, and under whose direction the original dissertation was written at Teachers College, 1921-23.

EARLE U. RUGG

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		PAGE
	FOREWORD	iii
I.	THE NEED FOR OBJECTIVE EVALUATION OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL SCIENCE-CITIZENSHIP CURRICULUM	1
II.	THEORY OF OBJECTIVE STUDY IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP	7
III.	OBJECTIVE STUDIES IN CITIZENSHIP PROBLEMS	13
IV.	OBJECTIVE STUDIES OF THE SOCIALLY VALUABLE FACTS IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES	30
V.	OBJECTIVE STUDIES OF THE ACTIVITIES, ABILITIES, AND TRAITS DEMANDED OF CITIZENS	69
VI.	THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP TRAINING IN SECONDARY SCHOOLS TODAY	110
VII.	AN EVALUATION OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL SCIENCE-CITIZENSHIP CURRICULUM	154
VIII.	CONCLUSIONS	191
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	204

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2026

https://archive.org/details/curriculumstudie0000earl

TABLES

PAGE

I. The Twenty Most Frequently Mentioned Problems in Periodicals 16

II. The Problems Discussed in Newspapers, the Number of Articles and Linear Inches of Space Devoted to Each of Them 16

III. Space Devoted to Problems of Labor in Ten Widely Used Books and Seven Periodicals 17

IV. Attention Given International Affairs in Seven Periodicals 17

V. General Topics of International Interest Found in Study of Editorials and Cartoons 18

VI. The Ten Most Frequently and Ten Least Frequently Mentioned Problems or Topics of 247 Problems Suggested by Laymen 19

VII. The Rank of the Major Problems Mentioned by All Parties, by the Democratic Party, by the Republican Party, by the Democratic and Republican Parties Together, and Five Highest Ranking Topics 20

VIII. A Partial List of the Books of "Frontier Thinkers" Used to Determine Problems of Citizenship 22

IX. The Space Allotment in Number of Pages to Any One Question Selected at Random Under Six Major Problems Presented by the Writers of Twelve Books on American Community Life 24

X. The Percentage of 2237 References to Various Types of Geographical and Historical Material in Eighteen Journals 32

XI. Frequency of Mention of Continents in Selected Issues of the Literary Digest 35

XII. Frequency of Mention of Countries in Selected Issues of the Literary Digest 35

XIII. Rank of Chief Cities of the United States 36

XIV. Comparison of Bagley's Results with Thomas' for the Most Frequently Mentioned Continents 37

XV. Frequency of Mention of Various Countries 37

PAGE

XVI. Frequency of Mention of the Largest European Cities 38

XVII. Per Cent of References to Various Types of Geography 38

XVIII. Frequency Ranks of 40 Most Common Historical and Geographical Allusions 40

XIX. The Eleven Most Frequently Mentioned Out of 115 Economic Topics Arranged to Show the Number of Articles Under Each in Seven Periodicals by Years and for the Entire Ten Years, 1912-21 42

XX. The Ten Most Frequently Mentioned Out of a Total of 33 Economic Topics Derived in the Main from the Grouping of Topics of a Similar Type from Table 19, and Ranked According to the Total Number of Articles Under Each Topic 42

XXI. The Ten Most Frequently Mentioned Economic Terms Out of 146 Tabulated According to the Number of Paragraph References Under Each Topic, Found in the Reading of 169 Magazine Articles 43

XXII. The Ranks in Each Table of Terms Common to Table 19 and Table 21 44

XXIII. Percentage of Historical References Devoted to Various Periods 46

XXIV. The Frequency of Mention to the Persons in the Books and Encyclopedia Articles Combined Is as Follows 46

XXV. Distribution of References to Political, Military, and Social and Economic History 46

XXVI. The Twenty Most Frequently Mentioned Persons Out of 463 in Books and Cyclopedia Articles 48

XXVII. Dates Most Frequently Mentioned in Books and Cyclopedia Articles 49

XXVIII. Comparison of Per Cent of Space Given Various Periods of History in Textbooks and by Writers of Contemporary Problems 49

XXIX. Historical and Geographical Topics in Contemporary Literature 51

XXX. Rankings of Persons Where Two or More Studies Mention A Given Person 53

PAGE

XXXI. Dates, Ranked as to Importance for Memorizing in the Elementary School 56

XXXII. The 50 Countries Ranked as to Relative Importance 58

XXXIII. The First 30 Cities of the United States Ranked in Order of Importance 60

XXXIV. Rank Order List of 50 Most Important Foreign Cities 61

XXXV. The First 30 Countries of the World in Order of Importance 61

XXXVI. The 40 Most Important Sections and Regions of the World Arranged in Order of Importance 61

XXXVII. The Twenty Rivers of Greatest Importance in Order of Rank 62

XXXVIII. The Ten Most Important Mountains in Order of Rank 62

XXXIX. The 25 Most Important Bodies of Water in Order of Rank 62

XL. The 21 Most Important Island Groups in Order of Rank 62

XLI. Typical Lists of the Characters Representing Twelve Different Nationalities 64

XLII. The Combined Ranks of the Major Categories of Man's Activities, in Terms of Space Allotted Each in Three Sources 71

XLIII. Rank of Activities According to the Per Cent of Frequencies Found in The New York Times and The Readers' Guide, Compared with the Rank of the Activities According to the Per Cent of Space Found in 105 Newspapers 74

XLIV. Major Classes of Activities Treated in the Literary Digest 75

XLV. Samples of Particularized Items of One Major Class of Activities and Persistency Index of Each Item 76

XLVI. The Ten Most Frequently Mentioned Civic Duties, Difficulties, and Qualities Cited by 80 Persons Interviewed 78

XLVII. Classes of Civic and Social Deficiences 78

Tables

PAGE

XLVIII. General Classification of Deficiencies of the Private Citizen 79

XLIX. Deficiencies in the Performance of Cooperative Governmental Functions 80

L. Civic Traits and Activities 81

LI. A Few Illustrations of Bobbitt's Citizenship "Abilities" 83

LII. Types of Litigation in Johnson County, Iowa 87

LIII. The Kind of Topics Concerning Which Harap Collected Quantitative Data 90

LIV. The Relation of the Quantity of Vegetables Consumed to the Food Value and the Price 92

LV. The Relation of Quantity of Fruits Consumed to Food Value 93

LVI. The Objectives Drawn up by Harap from His Study That Are Concerned with the Consumption of Vegetables and Fruits as Illustrated by Tables 54 and 55 94

LVII. The Five Most Frequently Mentioned Traits and the Five Less Frequently Mentioned Citizenship Traits 96

LVIII. The Ten Most Frequently Mentioned Civic Qualities Cited by 80 Persons Interviewed 96

LIX. Frequency of Mention of 51 Approved Qualities of Action and Aspects of Character in Eighteen Books of Essays 98

LX. Comparison of Distributions of Emphasis to Fundamental Social Attitudes and Activities in Books of Conduct and the American Magazine 99

LXI. The Opinions of the Librarians of Seventeen Public Libraries Who Replied Concerning the Above Three Questions 103

LXII. The Median Value Given Each School Subject or Activity as Those Graduates Assert That It Contributes to the Sum Total of These Five Major Activities in Adult Life 104

LXIII. The Recommendations of the Various Committies, 1892-1921 112

PAGE

LXIV. The Average Percentage of Space Devoted to Each Period by the Following Classes of Books: I. 1865-1874; II. 1881-1888; III. 1890-1904; IV. 1906-1912 121

LXV. The Topics for the Plymouth and Massachusetts Bay Colonies as Illustrative, and the Average Per Cent of the Book Space Given to the Topic 121

LXVI. The Persons Most Prominent in Civil and Military Affairs During the Century, 1765 and 1865 122

LXVII. The Percentage of Space Allotted to the Periods of American History as Given by the Committee of Eight Report, the Study of W. C. Bagley and H. O. Rugg, and the Studies of Earle Rugg of the Early American History Textbooks Published Before 1860 and Recent American History Textbooks Published Since 1912 125

LXVIII. The Percentage of Space That Various Textbooks Give to Political, Military, and Social and Economic History With Proportion of Space to These Three Classes of Subject Matter 126

LXIX. The Relative Emphasis in Per Cent Given to Various Periods in Recent American History Textbooks 126

LXX. The Number of Pages Devoted to Certain Selected Social and Economic Topics in American History Textbooks as Reported by Bobbitt and Earle Rugg 127

LXXI. Rank Order of the Most Frequently Mentioned Dates in Current American History Textbooks Upon the Criteria of Total Mention and at Least Five Mentions by Each Author With Detailed Mention of Each Author to Show Variety of Use of Dates 129

LXXII. Rank Order of 20 Most Frequently Mentioned Persons in Current American History Textbooks Upon the Criteria of Total Mention and at Least 5 Mentions by Each Author With Detailed Mentions of Each Author to Show Variety of Use of Persons 130

LXXIII. Relative Emphasis in Per Cent to Various Periods in Ancient History Textbooks 131

LXXIV. Relative Emphasis in Per Cent to Various Periods in Ancient and Medieval History Textbooks 131

PAGE

LXXV. Relative Emphasis in Per Cent to Periods in Modern History Textbooks 132

LXXVI. The General Characteristics of These History Texts 133

LXXVII. The Average Per Cent of Word Space Devoted to Subject Matter by Periods by Elementary and High School American History Textbooks 134

LXXVIII. The Average Distribution of Subject Matter According to Classification Below 135

LXXIX. The Type of Content and the Sequence of Topics in Five Representative Advanced Geographies 137

LXXX. The Average Per Cent of Space Devoted to the Continents in Five Elementary and Five Advanced Geography Texts 138

LXXXI. The Average Number of Words Devoted to Climate, Temperature, Wind, and Rain in the Elementary and Advanced Textbooks 138

LXXXII. The Average Number of Words Devoted to Surface Features Such as General Surface Features, Mountains, Lakes, Plains, Rivers, Glaciers, Deserts 139

LXXXIV. The Per Cent of the Entire Book Space Devoted to Physical Geography 140

LXXXV. The Relative Amount of Emphasis in Per Cent of Space Given to Political, Industrial, Civilization in General in Average Per Cent of Lines of Elementary and Advanced Textbooks 140

LXXXVI. The Total Number of Names, Including Repetitions, and Number of Different Names in Each Book, Without Repetitions 141

LXXXVII. The Twenty Most Frequently Mentioned Place Names by All Texts and Frequency of Mention by One Textbook 141

LXXXVIII. Emphasis in Per Cents to Various Features 141

LXXXIX. Relative Emphasis in Per Cent to Topics in Eight Current Civics Textbooks 142

XC. Relative Emphasis in Per Cent to Topics in Current Textbooks in Economics and Sociology 143

XCI. Summary Table Showing the Average Per Cent of Space Devoted to Each Main Topic in All Texts 145

PAGE

XCII. The Percentage of Space Devoted to Certain Topics in Seven Widely Used Social Science Textbooks 146

XCIII. The Percentage of Space Devoted to the Same Topics by Four Current High School Texts in Economics 147

XCIV. The Average Frequency of Reference to the Various Geographical Features in Five Senior High School American History Textbooks, and Five Senior High School General Social Science Textbooks 148

XCV. The Per Cent of the References to Each of the Geographical Features in These Ten Social Science Textbooks 148

XCVI. The Average Distribution of the References in These Ten Textbooks According to the Nature of the Material—Political, Economic, and Social 149

XCVII. The Relative Rank Value of the Twenty Most Frequently Mentioned Countries in These Social Science Textbooks, England Being Given the Arbitary Value of 100 150

XCVIII. The Distribution of References to the Twenty Most Frequently Mentioned States in These Ten Social Science Textbooks 150

XCIX. The Distribution of References to the Twenty Out of Ninety-One Most Frequently Mentioned Cities in These Social Science Textbooks 151

C. Ten Most Frequently Mentioned Out of 59 Rivers 151

CI. The Amount of Space in Pages Given by the Authors of Social Science Texts to Certain Illustrative Questions and Problems That Experts or "Frontier Thinkers" on Those Topics Agree are Important 156

CII. Provision of Representative Textbooks for Social Concepts 157

CIII. The Amount of Space in Per Cent in Magazines and in High School Textbooks in Economics 159

CIV. The Amount of Space in Pages (or Lines Where Less Than One-Fourth of a Page is Given) That Five Representative Social Science Textbooks Give to the Discussion of Four Housing Standards Presented in Harap's Study 159

PAGE

CV. Comparison of 20 Dates Judged Most Important by Historians and Actual Rank (Frequency of Mention) in Representative Textbooks 160

CVI. Comparison of 20 Ranking Persons Referred to on Varying Criteria of Life Values and Actual Rank (Frequency of Mention) in Representative Textbooks 161

CVII. Comparison of 20 Ranking Place Location Facts Referred to in Investigation of Use in Books and Periodicals and Actual Rank (Frequency of Mention) in Representative Textbooks 161

CVIII. Comparison of 20 Topics Judged Most Important on Criteria of Life Values and Actual Rank (Proportionate Emphasis) in Representative Textbooks 162

CIX. Comparison of Types of Material as to Degree of Comprehension (Medians Expressed in Per Cent)—Mathews' Investigation 172

CX. The Per Cent of Words Under 4,000, the Per Cent Between 4,000 and 10,000, and the Per Cent of Words Over 10,000 in a Sample of Four Pages of Each of Four Social Science Texts 174

CXI. Number of Different and Most Emphasized Meanings Attached to Social Concepts by Pupils Tested by Meltzer 178

CXII. The Per Cent of Elementary and High School Pupils Who Knew One Event Connected With Each Date Given Herein and the Rank of the Dates According to Judgments of Historians and the Frequency of Mention in Current Histories 179

CXIII. The Per Cent of Elementary and High School Pupils Who Knew an Event Connected With the Personages Given Herein and the Rank of These Personages According to Frequency of Mention in Current Histories 180

CXIV. The Number of Subordinate Topics Discussed in Chapters V, X, and XV of Four Representative Social Science Textbooks 180

CXV. The Per Cent of Space Devoted to Civic Textbooks to Civic Transactions Dealing With International, National, State, and Local Government 188

Curriculum Studies in the Social Sciences and Citizenship

Curriculum Studies in the Social Sciences and Citizenship

CHAPTER I

THE NEED FOR OBJECTIVE EVALUATION OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL SCIENCE-CITIZENSHIP CURRICULUM

Textbooks Represent the Present Social Science Curriculum

The purpose of this study is to survey as objectively as possible the present social science and citizenship courses in junior and senior high schools in order to determine, in part at least, whether such courses meet the social and learning needs of secondary students—the young citizens of America.

The most marked characteristic of these courses dealing with history, geography, economics, sociology, and civics is that they emphasize almost exclusively factual materials organized in textbooks. The study of textbooks in these subjects is assumed to be the medium by which citizenship training is to be promoted in secondary schools. Two quotations will illustrate this condition.

"The earlier study of this subject (history) is largely based upon either oral instruction by the teacher (instruction which is very variable in both quantity and quality) or upon very elementary texts which are usually written in story form, which emphasize primarily biographical materials, and which often lack sequential organization. With the degree of maturity attained by seventh and eighth grade pupils, however, the systematic study can be profitably undertaken, and the textbook in history with materials fairly well standardized and fairly uniform

throughout the country becomes the dominant agency of instruction."[1]

"In the majority of American schools it (the textbook) determines the facts to be taught and the manner of teaching them. A teacher called upon to instruct any grade above the third is almost certain to demand a textbook for use by the children. From this point on to the end of the high school course the study of history, in most of our schools, means at bottom the preparation of textbook lessons and the teaching of history means at bottom the discussion of textbook lessons."[2]

Thus a survey of history teaching and the opinion of a scholar of first rank in the field of the teaching of history indicate the common use of textbooks above the elementary school. These quotations concerning the dependence of history teachers upon textbooks apply to the other social sciences because these same teachers are also called upon to teach the other social sciences—geography, civics, economics, elementary sociology, and "problems of democracy." Indeed, the use of textbooks is a typical feature of many other secondary school subjects.

Furthermore, the training of high school social science teachers or their lack of proper training helps to explain the reliance of these instructors upon textbooks. It must be borne in mind that the teaching of the social sciences is a comparatively recent development in the history of public education.[3] The training of secondary social science teachers is also a new development and is still in a chaotic condition. A survey by Dawson[4] of this training shows that less than half of the colleges have definite requirements for training teachers for secondary social science and of those setting up requirements the usual demand is that the prospective teachers take, without particularizing

[1]Bagley, W. C. and Rugg, H. O., *The Content of American History as Taught in the Seventh and Eighth Grades—An Analysis of Typical School Textbooks*, Bulletin 16, School of Education, University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill., 1916.

[2]Johnson, Henry, *The Teaching of History in Elementary and Secondary Schools*, p. 269, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1916.

[3]Rugg, Earle, "How the Current Courses in History, Geography, and Civics Came to be What They Are," *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, Chapter IV, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923 (Included in the original manuscript copy of the dissertation).

[4]Dawson, Edgar, *Preparation of Teachers of the Social Studies for Secondary Schools*, Bulletin 3, 1922, United States Bureau of Education, Washington, D. C., 1922.

specific courses, six to thirty-six semester hours of history. Yet the evidence of courses offered in high schools given in Chapter VI shows that teachers have to teach the other social sciences. Other surveys[5] of the requirements of teachers colleges and normal schools indicate that these teacher-training institutions are not requiring prospective teachers to study professionalized courses designed to equip such persons to teach secondary social science. Is it any wonder that teachers with a few hours of history—in some cases, ancient and medieval only—rely upon textbooks when their pre-service training has given them scarcely the minimum content—not to mention real professionalized courses—for teaching in this field? Moreover, convention implies that the teaching of the social sciences should consist largely of the reading, study, and supposed mastery of the facts embraced in a textbook. Whereas the administration—the superintendent, principal, and the school board—supply without question equipment for the teachers of science, commercial subjects, industrial arts, and home economics, it has been niggardly in the provision for supplementary materials for the teachers of the social sciences.[6] Is it any wonder that these teachers, hampered in provision for supplementary materials, fall back upon the reading and study of a textbook?

Still another condition helps to explain the reliance of teachers of secondary social science upon textbooks. For over thirty years college social science professors, chiefly the historians, have been outlining what social science should be taught on the secondary level. These specialists in subject matter are predominantly the authors of our secondary social science textbooks. It is a well-known fact that college entrance requirements shape rather largely the course offerings of the high school. The increase in the number of students entering college classes with an ap-

[5]"Report of the Relation of Normal Schools and Teachers Colleges to High School Teaching," Mississippi Valley Historical Association, *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 7, pp. 244-248 (September, 1926). Confirmed by a recent study financed by the Commonwealth Fund. See also Rugg, E. U., and Dearborn, N. H., *The Social Studies in Teachers Colleges and Normal Schools*, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colo., 1928.

[6]See "The Report of the Committee on Standardizing Library Work and Library Equipment," of the Mississippi Valley Historical Association, *The School Review*, Vol. 29, pp. 135-150 (February, 1921).

parent lack of knowledge of history and government "alarmed" these specialists. As early as 1892, then, the college specialists in the subject matter of the social sciences began to organize committees to outline through syllabi what should be taught in high schools. And since that date several committees, composed largely of the above scholars, have made reports and published syllabi dealing with the social science curriculum for secondary schools.[7] Again, as noted above, these same scholars have amplified these recommended syllabi by publishing textbooks dealing with history and civics.[8] Is it any wonder, then, that the textbook has become almost the sole vehicle for imparting the materials deemed necessary to contribute to citizenship training?

Hence any evaluation must deal largely with the examination and analysis of commonly used textbooks dealing with the social sciences. The textbooks are, for purposes of our present study, the citizenship curriculum.[9]

THE METHOD OF EVALUATION

The method of evaluation to be used in this monograph was first suggested to the writer in the winter of 1918-19, when he was studying the late Professor Parker's *Methods of Teaching in the High School,* in a graduate class in the University of Chicago. For a term paper each student in this class was asked to make an analysis of some high school textbooks in order to answer the following questions raised by Professor Parker: (1) To what extent do the

---

[7]See reports of (1) the Committee of Ten, 1892-1894; (2) the Committee of Seven, 1896-1899 (3) the Committee of Eight, 1905-1909; (4) the Committee of Five, 1910-1912; (5) the Social Studies Committee, 1914-1916; and (6) the Committee on History and Education for Citizenship, 1918-1921. The program of social studies in secondary schools since 1892 reflects in content and grade placement the recommendations of one or more of these "subject-matter" committees. See *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, Chapter IV. National Society for the Study of Education, *Op. cit.*, for detailed discussion of curriculum making by national committees in the social studies.

[8]A check of the names of the members of these committees reveals that sixteen of the twenty-six college specialists who have served on one or more of the above committees have written textbooks for the schools. See Chapter IV, *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II.

[9]In a subsequent publication the present writer intends to discuss the thesis that much of the training for citizenship will be found in the so-called extra curricular activities or in the activities of the general social organization of the school. A rather comprehensive discussion of the present status of extra-curricular activities will be found in the *Twenty-fifth Yearbook*, Part II, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926.

textbooks meet the social needs of pupils? (2) To what extent do these textbooks meet the learning needs of pupils? and (3) To what extent do the textbooks provide for relative values? The writer selected for analysis certain commonly used textbooks in history, a subject he was then teaching in the Oak Park and River Forest (Illinois) Township High School. An analysis of space allotment to various periods of history, and to various types of topics —political, military, and social and economic—was made. But, then, a difficulty arose: How could Professor Parker's questions be answered on any *objective* basis? The writer could subjectively discuss *his* opinion concerning the relative values and the social and learning needs of pupils, but to say from investigation whether these books met the three chief criteria suggested above caused a search for investigations of these criteria.

A careful canvass of the literature dealing with the teaching of the social sciences revealed the fact that little attention had been given to this aspect of the teaching of history, geography, and civics. The writer next analyzed 60 books and articles that discussed the aims and values of the social sciences.[10] Running through these tentative or theoretical values, one finds the assumption current that if pupils study and presumably master the facts embraced in social science textbooks, they will become good citizens. A tacit transfer is implied—read, study, and master the facts summarized in the textbooks, and the requisite citizenship habits, attitudes, and ideals will miraculously appear. Worship of *knowledge*[11] for its own sake is apparently almost a fetish. In scarcely an article is there any question raised whether the traditional factual materials are suited to the social or learning needs of pupils, nor is there any particular inquiry concerning the relative worth of subject matter now taught.

---

[10]See Rugg, Earle, "Evaluating the Aims and Outcomes of History," *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 14, p. 325 (November, 1923).

[11]For a recent confirmation of this statement, see evidence in (1) Osburn, W. J., *Are We Making Good at Teaching History*, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926; (2) Meltzer, Hyman, *Children's Social Concepts*, Contributions to Education, No. 192, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1925; and (3) Ayer, A. M., *Some Difficulties in Elementary School History*, Contributions to Education, No. 212, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

Not finding the specialist in subject matter studying and investigating the problems above the writer turned to the research in education to discover if such questions were yet the concern of the "educationist." His graduate study in education had revealed to him the technic of the research worker in this field. He had become aware of the use of quantitative methods in solving administrative problems in the schools. He had canvassed the literature dealing with attempts to measure the capacities and achievements of pupils. He found in the literature dealing with how children learn his first suggestions for answering question 2 of Professor Parker's list—to what extent do the textbooks meet learning needs? Then in graduate courses dealing with the curriculum he discovered impersonal studies of social needs. He now had available some objective evidence concerning question 1—to what extent do the textbooks meet social needs? So in the results of the research of educational science much evidence was secured to answer rather impersonally Professor Parker's questions. Question 3—to what extent do these textbooks provide for relative values—is, as will subsequently appear, answerable by the study of the objective investigations of social needs.

THE PLAN OF THIS MONOGRAPH

In Chapters III to V the semi-scientific studies that are used by the writer as criteria for evaluating relative values and the social and learning needs of pupils will be presented in summary form.[12] In Chapter VI illustrative analyses of the present secondary social science-citizenship curriculum will be presented. Then Chapter VII will attempt to evaluate relative values and social and learning needs of secondary pupils in terms of the objective criteria set up in Chapters III-V. A summary will be given in Chapter VIII.

[12]With the permission of the Committee on Higher Degrees of Teachers College the writer has attempted to bring down to date all available studies of social and learning needs of pupils in the field of citizenship activities. For convenience of interested students he includes in this monograph summaries of those studies previously discussed by him in the *Third, Fifth, and Sixth Yearbooks* of the Department of Superintendence of the National Education Association, Washington, D. C., 1925, 1927, and 1928.

CHAPTER II

THEORY OF OBJECTIVE STUDY IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP

When one attempts to make a curriculum for training pupil citizens in the schools he may take one of two courses. He may, as we largely have to date, select the content by an *a priori,* haphazard, "guessing" method. He may simply write out what should be taught. Or, he may, as we are tending to do today, set up a program of investigation seeking to discover scientifically what specific information, skills, concepts, generalizations, appreciations, attitudes, and ideals should be provided. By this latter method detailed and careful inventories can be made of the specific things or activities about which one needs information and skill—the problems with which one will be called upon to deal as a citizen in a democracy, and the qualities which best promote one's participating efficiently in the socially desirable aspects of citizenship.

The "guessing" method, although by far the most common method of making courses for the training of citizens, almost inevitably results in the selection and teaching of much content either unrelated or rather remotely related to the actual needs of young citizens. Research workers, school administrators, and teachers interested in the revision of the course of study should make use of relatively objective methods for the selection of the content. Even more important, they should demand that authors of textbooks, used as the basic reading materials of the courses in the social sciences, should select their content from the evidence increasingly becoming available concerning the *socially valuable activities* of greatest relative worth to citizens. This latter statement is crucial because, as noted in Chapter I, "under the conditions that are general in American elementary and secondary schools, it is the textbook that forms the basis of instruction. What goes into the textbook is therefore a matter of vital sig-

nificance. The relative emphasis that is given to various events, the names that are kept alive from generation to generation, the points of view that textbooks reflect, the ideals with which they will tend to indoctrinate their immature readers—all of these factors demand consideration in an adequate study of textbooks."[1]

One of the greatest problems in public education today is the *objective selection of the content of the school course of study.* Writers of textbooks admit that their great problem is to decide *what facts* to include in their books. Traditional practice has apparently attempted to solve the difficulty by including *some* facts about the *entire* field of each school subject.[2] A marked characteristic of textbooks is that they are *comprehensive.* Textbooks in the social sciences tend to be veritable *encyclopedias*; they mention *many* persons, dates, countries, cities, topics, concepts, and problems.

It is obvious that under such an organization textbooks cannot discuss any one fact or topic, however valuable, in great detail. While the mastery of the facts included in the course of study is a learning rather than a curriculum problem, it is, nevertheless, crucial to a revision of the course of study because *the use of the socially desirable facts needed in life is hampered when we attempt to teach too many facts* and *when we do not give sufficient emphasis to the automatization of socially valuable facts.*

In times past the inclusion of much content in the curriculum was justified partly because of a belief in formal discipline. It was asserted that the study of many facts was proper because of the training that this practice gave the various "faculties" of the mind. It was also assumed that because one *might* at sometime meet any given fact it should therefore be taught. The content was largely based upon deferred values; even upon highly improbable uses of much content. Subject matter was, even if not used, of disciplinary value.

---

[1]Bagley, W. C. and Rugg, Harold, *Op. cit.*

[2]The evidence for this statement will be found in Chapter VI.

Research of curriculum makers in various school subjects in recent years has been directed to the study of the most frequent, the most general, and the most crucial content in terms of the actual needs of citizens and in terms of relative values. These students of the course of study, after careful tabulation of the comprehensive curricula used in schools and after analysis of the results of educational achievement tests which show objectively how small is the permanent mastery of the information, skills, and appreciations now taught, have already completed about two score of semi-scientific investigations for the purpose of discovering what facts, topics, and problems are of greatest relative value.

The outstanding values of such impersonal investigations are: (1) That the facts, topics, and problems of greatest relative social value are *only a small part of the sum total of human experience and knowledge in each field; and* (2) *that the socially valuable facts are now insufficiently provided for in the school curriculum.* When it is shown that we do *include too many facts* and that pupils *retain very little of the content* taught them, is it not a sound procedure to experiment by reconstructing curricula and revising teaching procedures so that at least those facts, topics, activities, and problems which appear to be the "common essentials" shall be permanently mastered? This does not imply that other meaningful and needed facts should not be taught or that content aside from that ascertained to be socially valuable for *all* pupils—the common, integrating education essential to efficient participation of citizens in a democracy—shall not be given pupils in various localities and of various abilities, capacities, and interests. But we should insist that the most frequently mentioned, the most generally required, and the most crucial content—the socially valuable information, habits, attitudes, and ideals —be included and mastered, at least first and foremost.

Chapters III, IV, and V contain summaries and interpretations of nearly forty investigations of the social values of history, geography, civics, economics, and sociology in the needs of the citizens in life outside the school—the place

where citizenship training is and must be applied. Some studies endeavor to point out in terms of relative values the permanent and insistent problems and issues of contemporary life confronting the citizen in a democracy—obstacles that can alone be solved by a critical, informed, and tolerant citizenry. Others attempt to list common essential facts useful to the layman in performing efficiently the duties of citizenship and in helping solve the problems of present-day community life. Still other investigations attempt to ascertain commonly needed citizenship abilities and traits demanded in the activities in which citizens engage or might engage.

While the evidence from these studies is even yet exceedingly tentative, it is, nevertheless, suggestive to curriculum makers. It probably constitutes a sounder basis for the selection of the needed facts, topics, and problems to be included in the social science curriculum than the traditional basis reviewed above.

One should not, of course, accept this evidence as final. Much more research is needed. Many of the experiments should be verified by repeating the technic of the authors of the studies reviewed. One great aspect of citizenship training—the chief province of the social sciences—has not been investigated in any high degree. It is frequently asserted that the chief job of the school is to help boys and girls engage efficiently in socially desirable activities that they tend to engage in anyway and also to help them engage efficiently in more desirable activities.[3] Analyses of the major classes of activities show that citizenship training is an important major objective. But the particularized activities of citizenship have not been ascertained except in a small way. The things citizens do and might do, if given conscious direction, should be thoroughly investigated, and the qualities citizens should possess should also be discovered.

[3]Adapted from Briggs, T. H., *The Junior High School*, p. 157, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1920.

Curriculum makers should adopt a wider view of the problem of citizenship training. Up to the present time the assumption has been that citizenship training will be well provided for by the mere organization and teaching of what might be termed "reading" courses in the social sciences—courses in which instruction chiefly emphasizes persons, dates, and events in history; place location facts, and data concerning climate, resources, and industries in geography; and the machinery of government, the powers and duties of governmental officials in civics. A "transfer" has been assumed—namely, that knowledge of such facts will make pupils behave as good citizens. One may well doubt this "transfer" by merely observing the behavior of citizens.

An important next step in curriculum making in the social sciences, then, is to discover the duties, difficulties, and traits of good citizens and the situations in which such aspects of citizenship are found and best promoted. In the social situations of life one will probably find many opportunities for training citizens in school in the things that good citizens should do. In the duties, problems, and situations in life outside the school one constantly will make use of the social heritage summarized in the present "reading" courses in the social sciences. The former—the duties, problems, and situations—constitutes the reality of contemporary citizenship; the latter— the social heritage —represents the materials of service or contributory value to pupils learning how to carry on efficiently the responsibilities attendant to effective social relationships in a democracy.

School administrators and teachers are trying to make school life like life outside the school—to make the school a *miniature society*. In the so-called extra-curricular activities may perhaps be found many analogous opportunities in school life to afford pupils practice in performing duties of school citizenship and in meeting social problems of their concern and responsibility. Every individual lives and should live a social life. A large part of one's day is filled with social contacts. To make these contribute most

fully to the proper fulfillment of one's duties as a citizen in a democracy, where the obligations for efficient government rest upon everyone, is perhaps the pre-eminent task in citizenship training, both in school and out.

CHAPTER III

OBJECTIVE STUDIES OF CITIZENSHIP PROBLEMS

A problem is a matter involving a difficulty or an obstacle. It implies that *one must think*: What shall I do? What will happen if I follow this path or if I make this decision?

Life is made up of countless choices or decisions concerning difficulties; some of them are personal and relate chiefly to one's own behavior and happiness. But many, many others are social and vitally affect the life and happiness of others. It is with the latter type that one needs be concerned in curriculum making in the social sciences.

From the very nature of the modern world the choices and decisions one makes when confronted with the problems and difficulties of social life are crucial. And many of them are so intricate and complex that one should not and cannot afford to rely upon incidental or haphazard training to equip people to meet their problems efficiently. Formal and protracted school training is apparently required.

At least two things should be done by curriculum makers to provide for problem solving in the school:[1] (1) They should attempt to discover impersonally the problems or types of problems that citizens will be called upon to meet; and (2) it is their obligation to organize the problematic materials in such ways that children will at least become acquainted with the technic of problem solving, and also obtain some skill in solving problems.

The major issue before us in this chapter is: Can we determine what the problems of citizenship are with any

[1]At present it is scarcely provided for in secondary social studies as is evident from analyses of textbooks and from objectives sought and tested by means of examinations.

reasonable precision and certainty? This issue involves: (1) What method or methods of research will give one the best statement of problems; and (2) having obtained statements of the problems in relatively reliable ways, whether the present curriculum has made use of the technic for discovering these problems and whether it provides pupils with sufficient opportunities to gain skill in handling and disposing of these problems. This chapter illustrates impersonal methods for determining the problems of American contemporary life. Chapter VII will attempt to evaluate to what extent the present curriculum in the social sciences gives secondary pupils sufficient practice in discussing these problems.

Hence, this chapter will cite relatively objective investigations having as their purpose an impersonal determination of contemporary problems. There are several theories upon which these investigations are based: First, these research studies herein cited indicate an endeavor to utilize relatively impersonal methods for obtaining statements of problems. Better than listing the author's opinion, they utilize the judgments of others or the collective opinion of many persons. Second, these studies illustrate an endeavor to discover *insistent* and *persistent* problems. A search for the problems of citizenship should necessarily postulate a *dynamic* society. Hence, curriculum makers have the added difficulty of attempting to predict the problems of tomorrow, the problems that will continue to persist, say through the active life of the present school generation. The best basis is probably to discover problems that have persisted several decades at least or that have greatest *survival* value.

At least four objective methods for determining important problems have been used: (1) The analysis of topics and problems discussed by newspapers and magazines; (2) the judgment of "lay" citizens concerning problems; (3) the statements of problems found in political

platforms; and (4) the statements of "frontier" thinkers, specialists in the study of society.[2]

CRITERION 1—DISCOVERING PROBLEMS BY ANALYSIS OF PERIODICAL LITERATURE

Studies 1 *and* 2

Davis[3] and Sharon[4] analyzed topics and problems discussed in newspapers and magazines. The former (Davis) analyzed twenty-one periodicals covering six months—October, 1920, to April, 1921 (Study 1) and also analyzed the topics in the *Reader's Guide* for October, 1920 (Study 2). It was assumed that the topics most discussed were the most important. Space permits only the quotation of the twenty most frequently mentioned topics out of the total number of topics—275.

The latter (Sharon) studied two weeks' issues of nine representative newspapers on the assumption that important problems will find a place in our newspapers. His findings are given in Table 2. (p. 16.)

Two investigations (Studies 3 and 4)—those by Bixler[5] and Nason[6]—pertain to special types of problems. The former, Bixler, attempted to discover the social problems of a particular group—labor. She analyzed seven periodicals and ten books for their treatment of labor problems. Table 3 gives in summary form her findings. (p. 17.)

The latter, Nason, investigated problems of international relations by analysis of editorial pages of the five magazines and cartoons in two other magazines. Tables 4 and 5 present his main findings. (pp. 17 and 18.)

---

[2]For reference purposes each study will be numbered in this monograph and with consideration alone to a convenient classification of criteria followed in the treatment of these objective investigations for evaluative purposes.

[3]Davis, M. B., *Topics to be Included in Instruction in Civics as Indicated by Analysis of Current Periodicals*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1921.

[4]Sharon's study summarized by Horn, Ernest, "The Applications of Research to Making a Course of Study in History," *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, pp. 242-243, National Society for the Study of Education, *Op. cit.*

[5]Bixler, G. K., "Social Problems of the Labor Group," (Interpretation found in Bobbitt, Franklin, *Curriculum Investigations*, Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 31, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1926.)

[6]Nason, J. M., *International Relations as Revealed by Editorials, Cartoons, and Textbooks in American History*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

TABLE I

THE TWENTY MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED PROBLEMS IN PERIODICALS (DAVIS)

Topics	Frequencies from Study I	Frequencies from Study II
World State	235	26
Congress	164	1
Immigration	159	12
Bolshevism	129	9
Costs	111	9
Asiatic Exclusion	104	0
Expansion and Imperialism	99	7
Employer's Organizations	97	6
Unemployment	87	2
Taxation	76	5
Socialism	71	7
Regulation and Enforcement of Prohibition	68	7
Housing	66	
Electoral Systems	66	3
Electoral Representation	64	
Party Control	64	5
Conservation of Mines	58	4
Freedom of Speech	58	3
Recreation	56	15
Negro Problem	55	

TABLE II

THE PROBLEMS DISCUSSED IN NEWSPAPERS, THE NUMBER OF ARTICLES AND LINEAR INCHES OF SPACE DEVOTED TO EACH OF THEM (SHARON)

	No. of Articles	Total Length In Linear Inches
1. Taxation	92	1,058.00
2. Foreign relations (not immigration)	30	701.75
3. Suffrage	51	559.75
4. Monopoly and legislation	45	441.75
5. Public service commissions	37	450.50
6. Liquor and prohibition	31	339.50
7. Money and banking	14	186.00
8. Employers and labor	7	102.50
9. Pensions (all kinds)	7	88.00
10. Workmen's compensation	10	78.75
11. Conservation of natural resources	3	42.00
12. Child labor	1	2.80
13. Miscellaneous	50	60.75

TABLE III

SPACE DEVOTED TO PROBLEMS OF LABOR IN THE TEN WIDELY USED BOOKS AND SEVEN PERIODICALS (BIXLER)

Topic	Number of Pages	Percentage of Pages
1. Industrial relations	2,571.8	20.3
2. Standard of living	1,989.0	15.7
3. Physical welfare	1,512.7	12.0
4. Government, politics	1,498.2	11.8
5. Trade-unionism	1,239.8	9.8
6. Wages	667.9	5.3
7. Race problems	580.5	4.6
8. Education	513.8	4.1
9. Women and children in industry	462.0	3.6
10. Radicalism	260.5	2.1
11. Religion, morality	243.3	1.9
12. Cooperative associations	222.2	1.8
13. Recreation, leisure	211.9	1.7
14. Giant power	197.1	1.6
15. Convict labor	143.6	1.1
16. "Big business"	60.0	.5
17. The farmer	48.9	.4
18. Prohibition	47.1	.4
19. Transportation	40.9	.3
20. Great men	34.2	.3
21. Land settlement	16.8	.1
22. Improving personality	12.0	.1
23. Unclassified	64.6	.5

TABLE IV

ATTENTION GIVEN INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS IN SEVEN PERIODICALS (NASON)

Newspapers

Periodical	Number of Editorials Examined	Number Dealing with International Affairs	Percent Dealing with International Affairs
Saturday Evening Post	62	33	53.2
London Times	94	45	47.8
New York Times	179	78	43.5
Chicago Evening Post	135	43	31.8
Collier's Weekly	234	45	19.2

Cartoons

Periodical	Number of Editorials Examined	Number Dealing with International Affairs	Percent Dealing with International Affairs
Current Opinion	257	119	46.3
Literary Digest	800	370	46.2

TABLE V

GENERAL TOPICS OF INTERNATIONAL INTEREST FOUND IN STUDY OF EDITORIALS AND CARTOONS (NASON)

General International Topics	Frequencies of Mention	Percents that the Frequencies Are of Total for All Topics
Commercial and industrial matters	452	26.4
Diplomatic	351	20.5
War	321	18.8
International attitudes	265	15.5
Financial	260	15.2
Racial	13	.76
Education	12	.70
Religion	10	.58
Science	8	.46
Travel	6	.35
Communication	5	.29
Sport	4	.23
Intercommunication	3	.18
Total	1710	99.95

CRITERION 2—DISCOVERING PROBLEMS BY MEANS OF THE JUDGMENTS OF REPRESENTATIVE CITIZENS

Study 5

Cocking[7] attempted to show what laymen regard as important problems or topics to be emphasized in the teaching of citizenship. A cross section of the public opinion in one state (Iowa) was sought by asking representative clergymen, lawyers, businessmen, farmers, editors, common laborers, government officials, and home makers to suggest problems.

Of the 955 laymen who signified that they would cooperate, 593 suggested topics. "The 593 people in their replies as to what, in their judgment, should be emphasized in the teaching of citizenship offered 4728 definite suggestions, or an average of 7.97 suggestions per person. It was found that the 4728 suggestions fell in 247 separate and distinct classifications." Space permits the reproduction of but one summary table (of the many tables) in this study.

[7]Cocking, W. D., *The Attitude of the Public to the Teaching of Citizenship*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Ia., 1923.

TABLE VI

THE TEN MOST FREQUENTLY AND TEN LEAST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED PROBLEMS OR TOPICS OF 247 PROBLEMS SUGGESTED BY LAYMEN (COCKING)

	Number of Times Mentioned
1. Individual duties, responsibilities, and privileges as a citizen	224
2. Duty to vote	221
3. Respect and obedience for law	213
4. Responsibility of the individual to the community	143
5. Cooperation in community affairs	126
6. Public health	125
7. Honesty	122
8. Government, its purpose, importance, growth, benefits and principles	116
9. Payment of taxes willingly	102
10. Respect for the rights of others	101
1. Confidence in men	1
2. Symbolic meaning of our national capitol	1
3. Tolerance	1
4. Memorizing orations	1
5. Boy Scouts	1
6. Respect for war veterans	1
7. Memorizing oath of allegiance	1
8. Efforts toward advancement	1
9. Pride in local state	1
10. Work a cure for idleness	1

CRITERION 3—DISCOVERING PROBLEMS BY ANALYSIS OF POLITICAL PLATFORMS

Study 6

Bassett[8] aimed to determine by analysis of political platforms "what are the most significant and most persistent problems of the American people which seek solution through the machinery of government."

[8]Bassett, B. B., *Civic Instruction of the American Electorate,* Ph.D. Dissertation, State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Ia., 1918.

Bassett analyzed the national platforms of all political parties since the first national convention in 1832; state platforms in non-presidential years from 1889 in so far as they dealt with national issues; all the platforms of major parties for 1910; platforms of major parties in certain selected pivotal states—namely, California, Indiana, and New York—since 1850; all platforms of the parties in Iowa since 1889; and the platforms of parties in one southern state.

Three units of measurement were used: (1) The linear inch; (2) frequency of mention—that is the number of platforms in which a given topic occurs; and (3) single platform proposals, i.e., the number of distinct proposals under each topic. Space permits the reproduction of but Table 7.

TABLE VII

THE RANK OF THE MAJOR PROBLEMS MENTIONED BY ALL PARTIES, BY THE DEMOCRATIC PARTY, BY THE REPUBLICAN PARTY, BY THE DEMOCRATIC AND REPUBLICAN PARTIES TOGETHER, AND FIVE HIGHEST RANKING TOPICS (BASSETT)

Ranks	All Parties	Dem. Party	Rep. Party	Dem. & Rep.	Using only Highest Five
I	Finance	Finance	Finance	Finance	Finance
II	Office	For. Relat.	For. Relat.	For. Relat.	Mor. Ref.
III	Foreign Relat.	Office	Office	Office	For. Relat.
IV	Moral Reform	State Rights	Commerce	Nat. Res.	Office
V	Immigration	Territories	Nat. Res.	Works	Corporat.
VI	Natural Res.	Legislation	Corporation	Labor	Labor
VII	Labor	Corporations	Immigration	Territories	Mon. Sys.
VIII	Monetary System	Natural Res.	Justice	Defense	Parties
IX	Defense	Works	Mon. Sys.	Immigration	Constit.
X	Works	Defense	Defense	Commerce	State R.
XI	Legislation	Moral Reform	Labor	Mor. Ref.	Territ.
XII	Commerce	Immigration	Territories	Mon. Sys.	Nat. Res.
XIII	Territories	Constitution	Mor. Reform	Pensions	Legislat.
XIV	Personal Rights	Per. Rights	Suffrage	State R.	Immigrat.
XV	Suffrage	Pensions	Postal Sys.	Constitut.	Pensions
XVI	Constitution	Mon. System	Constitution	Justice	Pers. Rights
XVII	Pensions	Commerce	Parties	Pers. Rights	Industry
XVIII	Parties	Parties	Pers. Rights	Legislat.	
XIX	State Rights	Education	State Rights	Parties	
XX	Education	Suffrage	Education	Suffrage	
XXI	Postal System	Health	Health	Post. Syst.	
XXII	Justice	Industry	Industry	Education	
XXIII	Industry	Postal Syst.	Pensions	Health	
XXIV	Health	Justice		Industry	

CRITERION 4—DISCOVERING PROBLEMS BY ANALYSIS OF THE PUBLISHED WRITINGS OF FRONTIER THINKERS OR SPECIALISTS IN THE STUDY OF SOCIETY

Study 7

Harold Rugg[9] and his research associates in the Lincoln School of Teachers College analyzed the published writings of "frontier" thinkers on the assumption that these works represent the best source for statements of insistent and persistent problems of citizenship.

To determine who were the competent specialists in each field, first, the books in the social science field were listed that appeared in the *Book Review Digest* for the years 1915-22, and only those books which were rated by competent reviewers as of distinct merit were taken for analysis. Second, more than 200 specialists in the fields of history, government, economics, and sociology and some representative editorial writers were asked to name books from which one might be able to find statements of problems. Each of the specialists was asked only for lists of books within his own special field. Third, these lists were further increased by a critical study of the book reviews in six weekly and several monthly journals over a period of five years following the World War.[10] Fourth, a careful canvass of several thousand books in the field of the social sciences on the shelves of the Columbia University Library was made.

From these four lists over 200 selected books have been analyzed carefully for statements of contemporary problems. Over 300 such problems having to do with issues concerning land, industry and business, population, community life in the American city, education, governmental problems, and world affairs have been listed.

---

[9]Rugg, Harold, "Problems of Contemporary Life as the Basis for Curriculum Making in the Social Studies," *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, *Op. cit.*, pp. 260-273. (A more detailed analysis has just been published by one of Dr. Rugg's research associates.) See Hockett, John, *A Determination of the Major Social Problems of American Life*, Contributions to Education, No. 281, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1927.

[10]As a rule, book reviews are written by men competent in the field of the books that they are reviewing. Many of these reviewers possess as high, if not higher, rating as specialists in the field than the writers of the books setting forth the problems.

Besides these major types of problems within each major class of contemporary issues, the investigation was concerned with the detailed questions discussed by these writers in connection with their treatment of the problems in their field.

The books of "frontier" thinkers listed below are typical of those upon which statements of contemporary problems and issues have been based. The authors of these books were selected as competent specialists on the basis of the criteria for selection mentioned above.

TABLE VIII

A Partial List of the Books of "Frontier Thinkers" Used to Determine Problems of Citizenship[11]

A. Problems of Immigration:
Jenks, J. W. and Lauck, J. *The Immigration Problem.* Funk and Wagnalls, New York.

B. Problems Which Deal with Natural Resources:
Van Hise, C. R. *Conservation of Natural Resources.* The Macmillan Company, New York.

C. Problems of Industry and Business:
Marshall, L. C. *Readings in Industrial Society.* University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill.

D. Problems Involved in Developing and Maintaining an Adequate and Efficient Transportation System in America:
Johnson, E. R. and Van Metrie, T. W. *Principles of Transportation.* D. Appleton & Company, New York.

E. Problems of the American City:
Howe, F. C. *The Modern City and Its Problems.* Charles Scribner's Sons, New York.

F. Problems of Education and the Formation of Intelligent Public Opinion:
Lippmann, W. *Public Opinion.* Harcourt Brace & Company, New York.

G. Problems of Government in the American Democracy:
Beard, C. A. *American Government and Politics.* The Macmillan Company, New York.

H. Problems of World Affairs:
Gibbons, H. A. *Introduction to World Politics. New Map of Asia, New Map of Africa, New Map of Europe.* Century Company, New York.

[11]Reprinted from Harold Rugg's Table, National Society for the Study of Education, *Op. cit.*

Space permits the reproduction of but a small part of one detailed tabulation of problems and questions raised by "frontier" thinkers.[12] (See Table 9, pp. 24 and 25.)

INTERPRETATIONS

Four relatively objective methods for determining major problems and topics have been illustrated. Each type of investigation has both advantages and limitations.

An analysis of periodicals (Studies 1-4) assumes that publishers are critical of issues of contemporary life, and that such periodicals reflect what man is thinking about and dealing with. But the content of the most widely circulated periodicals does not support entirely this contention. The "pressure" of dividends and advertising income forces many periodicals to avoid treatment of issues that demand "educational backgrounds" of readers beyond present comprehension of many citizens[13] or that are likely to alienate large segments of potential subscribers on the grounds of raising political, social, racial, or religious controversies. Furthermore, the tables do not sufficiently particularize broad topics (that by the nature of contemporary life are bound to be reported continually) into specific questions and issues to give curriculum makers detailed evidence of the relative values of the many subordinate questions at issue. Still another disadvantage (but one that can be remedied by additional study) is that there is an inadequate measurement of persistency in the analysis of periodicals reported thus far; each limited its sampling to issues of the periodicals published within a year or two. The "survival" value of content is very significant in curriculum making. A proper selection of critical periodicals (newspapers and magazines that frankly discuss

[12]This table represents part of the detailed tabulations of 221 questions raised by "frontier" thinkers concerning problems of community life made by the present writer as Research Associate on *The Social Science Pamphlets* and used as the source of evaluation of secondary civics books in my original dissertation. See Chapter VII.

[13]It should be recalled that the average number of days of formal school instruction received by pupils in 1890 was 770 (roughly approximating fourth grade education); in 1916 this average was but 1192 days (roughly representing the completion of but the common knowledges and skills of elementary education). See Cubberley, E. P. *Public Education in the United States*, p. 253. Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1918.

TABLE IX

THE SPACE ALLOTMENT IN NUMBER OF PAGES TO ANY ONE QUESTION WRITERS OF TWELVE BOOKS ON AMERICAN COMMUNITY LIFE (SAMPLE ANALYSIS OF 221 QUESTIONS DEALING

General Problems and Illustrations	Bruere, H. *The New City Government* 1912	Cooke, M. *Our Cities Awake* 1918	Howe, F. *The City, the Hope of Democracy* 1905	Howe, F. *The Modern City* 1915	Wilcox *Great Cities of America* 1910
I. Problem of organizing and maintaining the best form of municipal government. 10. To what extent are corrupt or self-seeking interests responsible for poor government?	11-12 (1)	234-236 (2	1-8 (7-¾) 43-60 (17) 61-91 (30)	50-51 (1) 59-61 (1½) 92-95 (3¼) 149-163 (15)	180 (x) 244-272 (28¾) 308-309 (1¼) 311-312 (1¼) 381-388 (6¼)
II. Problem of wise city planning. 9. To what extent does the city plan and the general "layout" of the city take into account provision for parks and playgrounds? (Why imp't)		279 (6 lines)	245-247 (2)	199-200 (1)	53-54 (1) 55 (½) 213-216 (2¼)
III. Problem of providing and maintaining efficient public works in the community. 8. How is sewage collected and disposed of?	245 (x) 248 (x)		57 (x)	35 (x) 36 (x)	56 (½) 522 (½) 295 (¼) 359-360 (1)
IV. Problem of getting the community to organize and properly maintain educational opportunities for all citizens. 7. How and why should communities make wider use of the school plant?				311-312 (1¼) 313 (¼) 314-316 (2)	
V. Problem of developing adequate and maintaining proper health agencies in the community. 6. Why are health standards low in the community?	88 (x) 314-315 (1½) 319 (½) 401-413 (12½)		188 (½)	265-266 (1¾)	44 (½) 278 (1)
VI. Problem of adequately providing for and improving leisure and recreation by means of directed community opportunities for play and for social opportunities. 5. Is municipal provision for play and social opportunities adequate?	2 (x) 21 (x) 22 (¼) 289 (¼) 240-241 (½) 242-243 (¼)	91 (½)		316-317 (1) 375 (x)	

TABLE IX (Continued)

SELECTED AT RANDOM UNDER SIX MAJOR PROBLEMS PRESENTED BY THE QUESTIONS AND PROBLEMS TAKEN FROM LARGE CHARTS CONTAINING ORIGINAL WITH COMMUNITY LIFE) (EARLE RUGG)

H. James *Municipal Functions* 1917	Munro, W. *Municipal Administration* 1916	Righter, C. *City M'g'r in Dayton* 1919	Taylor, G. *Satellite Cities* 1915	Wilcox *The American City* 1904	Wilcox *The Study of City Gov't* 1897	Zueblin *American Municip. Progress* 1902
276 (x)			149-151 (1½) 195-196 (½) 213-218 (5½)	20 (½) 93 (x)	19-21 (2)	
206-207 (1¼)	57-58 (1)		53-54 (1) 59-60 (1) 121-122 (1)			19 (½) 246-275 (29)
5 (¼) 10 (x) 12 (¼) 22 ¼ 56 (x) 84 (¼) 227-237 (10¼)	183-206 (23¼)	129-131 (2) 133 (½)	183(¼) 30(x) 234 (x) 240 (x) 138 (x) 166 (x)	53-54 (½)	29-30 (½)	105-107 (2¾)
106-107 (1¼)	399-402 (2¾)		218-222 (2) 220 (½) 122 (½)	236-238 (1½)		149-155 (6) 159-166 (6¾)
68-70 (1¼)		75-78 (3¼)	56-58 (1¼) 123 (¼)	191-192 (½) 193-194 (1) 144 (¼) 192 (¼) 192 (¼) 205-206 (1)		131 (½)
163 (¼) 169-170 (1¼)	401-402 (¾)	84 (¾) 237 (¼) 448 (x)	19-20 (¼) 144 (x) 181-182 (½) 220 (½) 223-224 (1¼)	111-114 (3½) 158-159 (1)		341-346 (4½)

contemporary issues without reference to circulation demands and whose dominant ideal is to set standards for thinking citizen-leaders); an adequate sampling (at least covering a period of 20 or 30 years); and a detailed analysis of the many main questions and issues within broad major classes of topics should produce much data of value because, in the judgment of the present writer, language is a primary instrument for learning what critical leaders are thinking about.[14] Analysis of periodical literature, even if restricted to critical magazines with small circulation, is probably one important criterion for determining objectively questions of public policy that citizens are most likely to face.

In theory the opinion of laymen (Study 5) is an important means of determining the problems that all citizens are called upon to meet in a democracy. But in practice many problems are technical and complicated. The educational attainment of many citizens is at present too low to secure from this source a sufficiently representative list of crucial problems. It is the writer's conviction that dispassionate experts, each stating issues in his particular field, can best enumerate the significant problems of society. This does not gainsay that citizens are competent to state what citizens should do. The summary table from Cocking's study indicates that citizens do not grasp sufficiently the question at issue: *What particular problems of contemporary society are of greatest relative worth?*

Bassett's assumptions (Study 6), namely, (1) that "platforms" of major political parties reflect the issues of society and (2) that statements in these platforms are addressed to a potential majority of the citizens, are sound in theory. Democracy in practice, however, (in the formulation of party platforms) does not always permit important issues

[14]Some object to the use of periodicals as a source for problems because the widely circulated magazines give comparatively little space to critical problems, for reasons noted earlier. It is the writer's conviction that large circulation (implying a large reading public) is not the criterion for selection of periodicals to be analyzed. Rather the criterion should be what magazines are "alive" to critical issues or what magazines are trying to stimulate at least the better educated and more critical and tolerant citizens to undertake the responsibilities of leadership in solving these problems. Problems are solved by leaders, not by mass action. Furthermore, the rapid expansion of prolonged formal education for all citizens should decidely increase the educational background of America's next generation of adult citizens.

to be included, or if they are included they are stated in such a way as not to alienate segments of the potential majority of citizens to whom they are addressed. Hence, they tend to lose their value for purposes of curriculum making.

Bassett did obtain a measure of persistency, for he analyzed political platforms over a period of several decades. His study, therefore, has distinct value in indicating major topics of persistent or survival value. Of course, some topics are persistent by virtue of the organization of government —for example, public finance and foreign relations; others survive because of the economic structure of society—for example, labor and business life; still others persist because there are always people (humanitarians) who attempt to reform the supposed "ills" of society.

Furthermore, his measures of persistency indicate shifts in emphasis at various periods in our history. If he had particularized his broad major topics or classes of activities into specific questions, it might even be evident that while problems in general survive, adjustments are required because of changed conditions. Prohibition of the manufacture and distribution of intoxicating liquor has long been a problem as has also its regulation when legalized. But prohibition today is fundamentally a different matter than it was prior to the adoption of the Eighteenth Amendment.

While political platforms do not yield a complete critical inventory of problems at issue, yet they do give the curriculum maker a crude check upon types of activities to be canvassed in detail for specific questions at issue.

The theory of Harold Rugg and his associates in the Lincoln School of Teachers College (Study 7) is that the best source for statements of crucial problems is the published works of specialists in the study and practice of government, economics, industry, international relations, etc. This group of research workers in the Lincoln School believes that men and women who have devoted years to both theoretical and practical study of the detailed problems

and questions within a restricted field[15] are most competent to tell curriculum makers the outstanding, persistent problems of present-day life.

Society relies upon specialists to build and manage its railroads, industries, and bridges (engineers), to safeguard physical welfare (doctors), and to advise on legal matters (lawyers) because these persons are equipped from long training and experience to solve the problems entailed in these fields. The men and women who have trained themselves in the study of economic life, government, and the like are equally competent specialists in societal needs.

Persistency is also evident in the published works of these experts in the study of society. Analyses of books published between 1897 and 1918 (See Table 9) indicate many important issues throughout this period. The permanent value of these problems for curriculum purposes for children who will be called upon in the next two or three decades to meet these problems can only be predicted by this fact—they have been before the American people for at least a generation. Curriculum makers in a dynamic contemporary community life cannot be obligated to predict the problems beyond the needs of children being educated in formal school today.

These specialists, carefully selected as noted above, can and do, in the judgment of the writer, state specifically not only the major problems, each in his own field, but also many of the basic subordinate questions at issue. Furthermore, their conclusions or generalizations are available in their critical published analyses and seemingly constitute crucial data for the curriculum in the social sciences and citizenship.

SUMMARY

Available studies, while as yet not meeting all criteria—competency of judgment, persistency, and relative values—are, nevertheless, probably more objective bases for the

[15]Psychologically, specialization is inevitable.

selection of questions about which pupils need to be informed than chance selection and individual opinion of the authors of textbooks in the social sciences. While all sources should be further explored and checked, one against another, it is the writer's conviction that the judgment of "frontier" thinkers—specialists in the study of society—must be chiefly relied upon for statements of America's most insistent, crucial, and permanent problems.

CHAPTER IV

OBJECTIVE STUDIES OF SOCIALLY VALUABLE FACTS IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

Our present curriculum in the social sciences assumes, as noted earlier, the value of systematized, comprehensive courses in history, geography, and civics. Literally hundreds[1] of specific facts are mentioned. Obviously little attention in the condensed texts (at most 500 or 600 pages) can be given to particular place locations, dates, persons, events, topics, etc. Indeed, the criterion of relative values is inadequately provided for in the organization of social science textbooks.

The measurement movement within the past decade has focused attention nationally on defects in organization of curriculum materials. Objective tests of even a simple, factual type given to pupils revealed serious deficiencies in mastery of such facts.[2] Naturally the cause of such deficiencies was sought. Could it be the pupil's fault? Could it be the teacher's fault? Could it be the fault of the course of study—in reality, the textbooks used?

Investigations of all three possible sources were begun. In this chapter we are concerned to present the studies made when research workers attempted to discover if the *most common* facts and of greatest social value could be ascertained. Analyses of textbooks[3] showed that *too many facts* are taught at present and without reference to the facts needed in life's activities and difficulties. Several criteria are evident when one analyzes the investigations made in recent years to discover the common essential facts of greatest value to the average citizen in meeting the duties and responsibilities of community life.

---

[1]See Chapter VI for evidence.

[2]See Rugg, Earle, "Evaluating the Aims and Outcomes of History," *Op. cit.*

[3]See Chapter VI for evidence concerning the analysis of textbooks in the social sciences.

CRITERION 1—THE FACTS ONE IS MOST LIKELY TO MEET IN THE READING OF PERIODICALS, PROBABLY FOR MOST CITIZENS THEIR MAIN READING ACTIVITY

Study 8

Bagley,[4] in the pioneer study in the field,[5] used newspapers and magazines as a standard for determining the kind of geographical information that the school should teach. His theory was that people may use geographical information to enable them to interpret adequately references to geographical material in their reading of periodical literature. Specifically, the problem was to find by "samplings" of newspapers and magazines the types of references and the frequencies of mention to geographical material.

Samplings of such magazines as the *Outlook* and the *Literary Digest* for a period of seven years ending with 1913 were taken. Two methods of counting the references were tried: (1) Counting one for each term such as the name of a place or each statement with a geographical or historical content; and (2) taking each article as a unit in which the reference occurs in so far as it concerns a certain type of reference. Dr. Bagley says that actual investigations show the latter method to be preferred.

---

[4]Bagley, W. C., "The Determination of Minimum Essentials in Elementary Geography and History," *Fourteenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 131-139, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1915.

[5]The origin of relatively objective curriculum investigation is to be found in the efforts of a few research workers in education who attempted to study the education values of the common school subjects. Many earlier studies, including Bagley's, were stimulated by the organization of a new type of committee procedure. Instead of "arm-chair" procedures each member of this Committee on Economy of Time in Education of the National Society for the Study of Education sought to discover by means of objective investigations the most frequent and universal needs in the various common branches. See particularly the *Fourteenth, Sixteenth, and Seventeenth Yearbooks*, Part I, and the *Eighteenth Yearbook*, Part II, of the National Society for the Study of Education. Many of the subsequent studies cited in this monograph show clearly the influence of criteria and technics developed by this committee. Hence, we make distinct acknowledgment to the activities of these pioneers in the objective study of educational values.

TABLE X

THE PERCENTAGE OF 2237 REFERENCES TO VARIOUS TYPES OF GEOGRAPHICAL AND HISTORICAL MATERIAL IN EIGHTEEN JOURNALS (BAGLEY)

Topics	Per cent
References to facts of location, size, direction, etc., which may be assumed to require for their understanding a knowledge of "place location" geography	53.5
References to political divisions and facts of government which may be assumed to require a knowledge of "political" geography	25.1
References to industries, commerce, products, etc., which may be assumed to require a knowledge of "commercial" geography	5.8
References to people, customs, religion, education, etc., which may be assumed to require a knowledge of "social" geography	4.8
References to places as scenes of historical events, which may be assumed to require a knowledge of "historical" geography	1.7
Other references primarily of local or transitory interest	8.9

The relative emphasis to continents with North America arbitrarily assigned 100 was:

North America	100	Africa	4
Europe	73	South America	3
Asia	13	Australia	1

The relative frequency of mention to principal European countries, England being given the arbitrary value of 100, was:

England	100	Italy	32
France	80	Turkey	30
Germany	70	Austria-Hungary	24
Russia	35	Spain	22

The relative ratings in cities, New York being assigned arbitrarily 100, were:

New York	100	Philadelphia	20
London	31	Berlin	15
Boston	27	Constantinople	12
Washington	26	Rome	12
Chicago	26	St. Petersburg	7
Paris	26	Vienna	7

The relative importance of rivers, seas and gulfs, and straits in order of rank was as follows:

Rivers		*Seas and Gulfs*	*Straits*
Mississippi	Seine	Mediterranean	Dardanelles
Hudson	Niagara	Aegean	Bosporus
Ohio	Rio Grande	Mexico	Magellan
Missouri	Columbia	Black	Bering
Rhine	Amazon	Adriatic	
Nile	Congo	Marmora	
Danube		Red	
St. Lawrence		Caspian	
Potomac			
La Plata			

In a similar way historical references were tabulated, although they were mentioned much less frequently than geographical references.

The frequency of reference to persons in American history, Lincoln being given the arbitrary value of 100, was as follows:

Lincoln	100	Cleveland	17
Washington	66	McKinley	17
Jefferson	51	Webster	13
Jackson	24	Franklin	10
Grant	20	J. Q. Adams	10
Clay	20	Buchanan	10

References to wars were more frequent than to any other type of historical events, the Civil War holding first place.

References to civic material in periodicals in order of frequency of reference were as follows: (1) The Constitution; (2) amendments to the Constitution; and (3) the Constitutional Convention.

The departments in order of frequency of reference were as follows: state, interior, attorney-general's office, treasury, war, post-office, commerce, and agriculture.

In one rather "popular" magazine a sampling of ten years showed that Napoleon was most frequently mentioned, but other historical characters such as Caesar, Louis XIV, Jeanne d'Arc, and Luther were also frequently mentioned. Dr. Bagley comments that in this magazine analysis, Caesar is referred to more frequently than any American character besides Lincoln, Washington, Roosevelt; Jeanne

d'Arc as often as Cleveland; and Napoleon more frequently than any living political or military character.

The writer of this study ventures to suggest that certain aspects of European history are mentioned with sufficient frequency to cause one to consider their inclusion in the socially valuable history to be taught in the schools. The most important, in order of frequency of reference, are: the Renaissance, the French Revolution, the Middle Ages, and the Elizabethan period.

This is a pioneer study attempting to "sample" periodical literature in order to obtain data concerning the facts in history and geography that one is likely to encounter in what is probably the pre-eminent sources of information of the average adult layman—namely, newspapers and magazines.

Study 9

Charters[6] attempted to determine items of place geography to be taught by an analysis of random samplings of newspapers and magazines. The first number for October of the *Literary Digest* in alternate years from 1899 to 1913, inclusive, was examined for items in place geography. Advertisements, maps, and lists of places were omitted, but cartoons were included "because they are essential parts of reading matter widely used to make ideas clear."

In the analysis, geographic names, such as England, were included and also the names of people as English; "to obtain a gauge of the importance of the country, mention of the activities of the inhabitants was as important as mention of the country."

"Every reference was tabulated, in contra-distinction to one reference per paragraph or article as is the rule in some studies. This was done because of the effort to obtain a complete analysis. Places of the most minute sort, as the Arc de Triomphe in Paris, were included. Rivers,

[6]Charters, W. W., "A Short Cut in Tabulation," Summarized in his *Curriculum Construction*, The MacMillan Company, New York, 1923.

mountain ranges, lakes, bays, channels, gulfs, seas, and oceans were not included."

TABLE XI

FREQUENCY OF MENTION OF CONTINENTS IN SELECTED ISSUES OF THE LITERARY DIGEST (CHARTERS)

Continent	Frequency of Mention	Continent	Frequency of Mention	Continent	Frequency of Mention
North America	3,112	Europe	1,835	Asia	597
Africa	190	South America	38	Australia	28

TABLE XII

FREQUENCY OF MENTION OF COUNTRIES IN SELECTED ISSUES OF THE LITERARY DIGEST (CHARTERS)

Country	Frequency of Mention	Country	Frequency of Mention	Country	Frequency of Mention
United States	2,712	British Isles	725	Germany	257
France	205	Japan	202	China	136
Russia	121	Italy	108	Turkey	82
Canada	78	India	73	Mexico	61
Orange Free States	34	Transvaal	54	Turkey	43
Congo Free States	23	Spain	33	Austria-Hungary	32
		Greece	23		

One notes by comparing the samplings of Bagley and Charters a marked resemblance in the relative frequencies of mention of the principal continents and countries of the world. Such studies with other studies listed in this section contribute rather impersonal evidence concerning the crucial problem of relative emphasis to minimal essential facts.

Study 10

Thomas[7] studied periodicals to determine a list of minimal essentials in elementary geography. After a review of other studies that attempt to state minimal essential facts, Mr. Thomas made a comparative study with the Bagley investigation by the reference method of the allusions in a sampling of the following periodicals: *The Indianapolis News, The Danville Gazette,* and *The Youth's*

[7]Thomas, J. B., *A Study in Minimal Essentials of Geography for the Elementary Schools,* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Indiana, Bloomington, Ind., 1919.

Companion. Four editions of the first two and six of the latter were selected at random from the period, 1911-1918.

One hundred and eighty-eight pages of printed matter were found to contain 5027 geographical references. The following tables (13-17, pp. 36-38) are given herewith for comparative purposes.

Mr. Thomas says, "The striking difference in the figures for the unclassified references is due to the large number of local references in the metropolitan and county newspapers. The large per cent of local references in the newspapers is an indication of the relative importance of home geography." One notes that there is a rather marked resemblance between the percentage of distributions for the other types of geography.

TABLE XIII

RANK OF CHIEF CITIES OF THE UNITED STATES (THOMAS)

	Branom & Reavis—Rank	Thomas Frequency	Thomas Rank
New York	1	93	2
Chicago	2	86	3
Philadelphia	3	20	9
St. Louis	4	23	7.5
Boston	5	28	5
Cleveland	6	26	6
Baltimore	7	14	12
Pittsburgh	8	21	8
Detroit	9	16	11
Buffalo	10	9	15.5
San Francisco	11	23	7.5
Milwaukee	12	9	15.5
Cincinnati	13	25	7
Newark	14	2	21
New Orleans	15	10	14
Washington	16	111	1
Los Angeles	17	17	10
Minneapolis	18	2	21
Jersey City	19	1	22
Kansas City	20	10	14
Seattle	21	7	18
Indianapolis	22	61	4
Providence	23	0	0
Rochester	24	5	20
St. Paul	25	8	16
Portland, Oregon	26	2	21
Louisville	27	12	13
Denver	28	10	14
Columbus, Ohio	29	6	19

TABLE XIV

COMPARISON OF BAGLEY'S RESULTS WITH THOMAS' FOR THE MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED CONTINENTS (THOMAS)

Continent	Thomas	Bagley	Actual Frequency
North America	100	100	11
Europe	172	73	19
Asia	18	13	2
Africa	90	4	10
South America	63	3	7
Australia	18	1	2

TABLE XV

FREQUENCY OF MENTION OF VARIOUS COUNTRIES (THOMAS)

Country	Thomas Frequency	Branom & Reavis Score
United States	90	30
France	71	28
Germany	70	28
Great Britain	53	28
Austria-Hungary	23	28
Belgium	22	23
Russia	20	27
China	14	26
Italy	14	27
Canada	14	27
Turkey	11	20
Holland	10	24
India	10	28
Brazil	9	25
Mexico	9	24
Siberia	9	0
Japan	8	27
Spain	7	21
Sweden	7	21
Switzerland	5	0
Bulgaria	5	0
Argentine	4	25
Egypt	3	20
Australia	2	23

Study 11

Washburne[8] attempted to select basic facts in history and geography by an impersonal standard for the elemen-

[8]Washburne, C. W., "Basic Facts Needed in History and Geography; a Statistical-Investigation," *The Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, pp. 216-233, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923.

TABLE XVI

FREQUENCY OF MENTION OF THE LARGEST EUROPEAN CITIES (THOMAS)

City	Branom & Reavis—Rank	Thomas Frequency
London	1	43
Paris	2	26
Berlin	3	23
Vienna	4	4
Petrograd	5	5
Moscow	6	2
Constantinople	7	1
Hamburg	8	2
Glasgow	9	1
Liverpool	10	5
Warsaw	11	0
Budapest	12	3
Manchester	13	0
Brussells	14	0
Naples	15	1
Madrid	16	1
Amsterdam	17	3
Stockholm	18	4

TABLE XVII

PER CENT OF REFERENCES TO VARIOUS TYPES OF GEOGRAPHY (THOMAS)

Types of Geography	Thomas Per Cent	Bagley Per Cent
Place geography	45.8	53.5
Political geography	18.1	25.1
Commercial geography	3.2	5.8
Social geography	8.6	4.8
Historical geography	0.9	1.7
Unclassified	22.8	8.9

tary school course of study in Winnetka, Illinois. Dr. Washburne assumed that an important function in the teaching of geography and history was to make children familiar with the facts that are commonly known to intelligent people. The facts frequently alluded to in periodicals must be taught if our children are to read intelligently. The type of subject matter, generality of distribution, and period of time covered guided the investigator in this study.

Four literary periodicals were selected: *Atlantic, Bookman, Century, Scribner's;* five popular fiction periodicals: *American, Cosmopolitan, Saturday Evening Post, Ladies' Home Journal, Good Housekeeping;* five news periodicals: *World's Work, Literary Digest, Outlook, New Republic, Nation;* and four newspapers: *New York Times, Chicago Tribune, Chicago Herald-Examiner,* and *Christian Science Monitor.*

Dr. Washburne says in respect to samplings of these periodicals: "We chose about fifteen issues of each of these periodicals, three every third year, in such a way that one periodical or another covered almost every month of every year from 1905 to May, 1922. In this way we avoided seasonal weighting of items, and secured information over a wide enough range of years to avoid the danger of overemphasis of purely transitory material." Every allusion to a person, place, date, or event was recorded. Altogether there were over 81,000 allusions.

The frequency of ranks was determined on the basis of: (1) The number of periodical-years in order to weigh the number of periodicals containing allusions year by year; (2) the range of years—that is, the lapse of time from the first year in which an allusion was found to the last; (3) the number of articles containing allusions to the item in question; and (4) the gross number of allusions.

Periodical-years gave an almost perfect index as to the probability of meeting allusions to the item. Therefore, items were ranked according to their periodical-years. Table 18 on p. 40 shows a few of the most frequently mentioned allusions.

Before such lists are accepted with any great degree of finality, it is probable that other samplings should be taken. Dr. Washburne's list is significant for the range of the sample—namely over eighteen years—from 1905 to 1922.

TABLE XVIII

FREQUENCY RANKS OF 40 MOST COMMON HISTORICAL AND GEOGRAPHICAL ALLUSIONS (WASHBURNE)

Allusion	Number of Periodical Years	Number of Years Between First and Last Allusion	Number of Articles in Which Allusions Occur	Gross Number of Allusions
1	2	3	4	5
America (meaning U. S.)	103	18	1,211	5,903
England	103	18	1,155	3,315
France	100	18	1,390	3,848
New York City	100	18	911	2,386
China	98	18	353	750
London	95	18	629	1,303
Germany	92	18	674	3,015
Boston	92	18	297	564
New York State	86	18	594	1,090
Paris	86	18	516	1,494
Italy	86	18	428	1,140
Japan	86	18	267	902
Great Britain	83	18	400	1,539
Europe	81	18	837	1,994
United States	81	18	659	1,725
Rome	81	18	202	604
California	81	18	193	269
Russia	78	18	362	1,730
Ireland	78	18	288	674
Spain	78	18	279	649
Greece	78	18	264	761
Washington, D. C.	75	18	457	899
Chicago	75	18	350	618
Indians (American)	75	18	240	814
Africa (including North and South Africa, etc)	75	18	216	441
Roosevelt, Theodore	74	18	257	617
Congress	72	18	255	632
Scotch, Scotland	72	18	216	337
Canada	72	18	216	199
Philadelphia	72	18	213	354
Lincoln, Abraham	72	18	142	160
Harvard	70	18	137	236
Switzerland	69	18	124	176
Atlantic	66	18	172	193
Holland	66	18	169	460
Wilson, Woodrow	65	18	380	789
India	63	18	151	255
Egypt	63	18	130	286
Hudson River	63	18	124	121
Jew, Jewish	63	18	109	460

Study 12

The specific purpose of Bowman's[9] investigation was to throw some light upon what should be the most important topics in the teaching of high school economics.

Bowman assumed that economic topics most frequently discussed in current periodicals were sufficiently important to be considered in the formulation of content of courses in high school economics. But he also noted that other topics which perhaps have not yet come to the point of where they are discussed widely may also be important.

Bowman first studied the *Readers Guide to Periodical Literature* and made a count of the number of articles in seven periodicals that discussed various economic topics over the period, 1912-21. Second, he took every thirtieth article from among the articles listed under all these economic topics in the *Reader's Guide* which had under them 30 or more topics and read them for specific references to economic terms.

The magazines he selected were the *Atlantic Monthly,* a representative magazine of the more educated class of people; *Collier's Weekly,* a magazine with a wide circulation; the *Independent,* the *Literary Digest,* and the *Outlook,* because they are already in common use in social science classes in American high schools. The *American Review of Reviews* and the *World's Work* were also selected "because it was desired to have in the list a representative monthly or two, of the kind which deals largely with current problems."

Space will not permit the detailed reproduction of his conclusions; only samples in tabular form can be given for illustrative purposes. (See Tables 19-21, pp. 42-43.)

From the detailed table that could not be entirely quoted one may determine not only the number of articles in each

[9]Bowman, E. C., *A Study in the Objectives in the Teaching of High School Economics,* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1922.

TABLE XIX

THE ELEVEN MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED OUT OF 115 ECONOMIC TOPICS ARRANGED TO SHOW THE NUMBER OF ARTICLES UNDER EACH IN SEVEN PERIODICALS BY YEARS AND FOR THE ENTIRE TEN YEARS, 1912-21 (BOWMAN)

Rank	Topics	1912	1913	1914	1915	1916	1917	1918	1919	1920	1921	Total
1	Railroads	32	159	100	74	77	63	59	64	47	42	767
2	Taxation including tariff	36	93	33	15	15	25	24	8	13	44	306
3	Strikes	32	38	43	17	34	4	4	71	33	11	287
4	Trusts	63	27	47	23	4	1	2	6	10	8	191
5	Taxation not including tariff	11	31	23	11	14	24	24	7	13	28	186
6	Canals	45	40	39	12	11	3	6	1	1	13	176
7	Prices	8	15	9	3	9	21	14	43	26	24	172
8	Finance	1	4	17	36	11	41	12	20	16	12	170
9	Motor busses and trucks	19	39	13	10	8	9	32	16	16	8	170
10	Banks and banking	20	38	37	15	11	10	7	7	14	9	168
11	Immigration	22	26	18	15	11	7	3	12	12	30	156

year but the trends as to whether the topic is decreasingly or increasingly receiving attention. Also from the detailed table one can obtain some information of what seems to be in the minds of editorial writers concerning important economic topics to present to the American people.

Paragraph references were counted as follows: Each term was counted but once for each paragraph in which

TABLE XX

THE TEN MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED OUT OF A TOTAL OF 33 ECONOMIC TOPICS DERIVED IN THE MAIN FROM THE GROUPING OF TOPICS OF A SIMILAR TYPE FROM TABLE 19, AND RANKED ACCORDING TO THE TOTAL NUMBER OF ARTICLES UNDER EACH TOPIC, (*sub-topics under each of these are omitted because of lack of space*) (BOWMAN)

Rank	Topic	Number of Articles
1	Transportation	1,492
2	Labor	1,358
3	Finance	719
4	Investments	518
5	Large-scale Industry	446
6	Monetary System	360
7	Prices	319
8	Business, general	209
9	Food Supply (Farm Produce; Famines; Food, Distribution of)	193
10	Immigration	156

TABLE XXI

THE TEN MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED ECONOMIC TERMS OUT OF 146 TABULATED ACCORDING TO THE NUMBER OF PARAGRAPH REFERENCES UNDER EACH TOPIC, FOUND IN THE READING OF 169 MAGAZINE ARTICLES[10] (BOWMAN)

Rank	Terms	Total Number of References
1	Prices	260
2	Railroads	196
3	Workers	177
4	Money	176
5	Cost or Costs	152
6	Wages	145
7	Employees	125
8	Markets	108
9	Bonds	104
10	Production	104
11	Corporations	90

it occurs; terms were counted only when they were used as nouns; equivalent terms were taken under the head of the term under which they may be reasonably regarded as equivalent. For example, "living cost" was counted under the head "cost of living." In order that the relationship of the ranking of the topics listed as a result of the work in the *Reader's Guide* to the ranking of the terms discovered in the reading may stand out as clearly as possible, Table 22, p. 44 is presented.

CRITERION 2—THE FACTS NEEDED FOR INTELLIGENT UNDERSTANDING OF BOOKS AND ENCYCLOPEDIA ARTICLES DEALING WITH MODERN PROBLEMS

Study 13

Horn[11] studied this value of history—namely, that the chief purpose of teaching history in the elementary school is to make pupils more intelligent with respect to crucial activities and problems of present-day life, or to quote Dr.

[10]This is the final result of the reading of every thirtieth article under each topic that is credited with at least 30 articles in Table 19.

[11]Horn, Ernest, "Possible Defects in the Present Content of American History as Taught in the Schools," *The Sixteenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 156-172, The National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1917.

TABLE XXII

THE RANKS IN EACH TABLE OF TERMS COMMON TO TABLE 19 AND TO TABLE 21 (BOWMAN)

Rank in Table 19	Topics	Rank in Table 21
1	Railroads	2
2	Strikes	14
3	Trusts	39
4	Taxation, not including tariff	18
5	Canals	39
6	Prices	1
7	Finance	59
8	Motor Busses and Trucks	24
9	Banks and Banking	15
10	Immigration	46
11	Investments	13
12	Panama Canal	35
13	Insurance	41
14	Labor and Laboring classes	12
14	Ships and Shipping	18
14	Food Supply	61
15	Roads	31
16	Bolshevism	51
17	Bonds	9
18	Tariff	28
20	Trade Unions	21
21	Money	4
23	Socialism	42
26	Stocks	27
27	Corporations	10
28	Cost of Living	19
29	Wages	6
30	Panama Canals Tolls	53
31	Export Trade	62
32	Railroad and Freight Rates	25
33	Cooperation	61
34	Income Tax	55
38	I. W. W.	37
39	Unemployment	51
40	Advertising	50
43	Credit	32
44	Debts, Public	43
45	Population	31
45	Sherman Anti-Trust Law	47
46	Securities	17
49	Salaries	45
50	Government Regulation	60
52	Arbitration and Conciliation, Industrial	59
53	Budgets	58
54	Mortgages	53
56	American Federation of Labor	46
56	Commerce	40
58	Efficiency, Industrial	58
58	Workmen's Compensation	61
59	Gold (as money)	26
59	Prosperity	26
59	Saving and Savings	59
61	Savings Bank	52
62	Transportation	29
65	Waste	52
65	Wealth	23
66	Competition	30

Horn, "this study is planned to determine what the content of the course of study in history would be if all history which is not essential to such intelligence were eliminated and if items which are essential but which do not at present appear in the course of study were added."

Dr. Horn's hypothesis was that he could secure by analysis of books dealing with more crucial modern problems at least the sort of history or reference to historical material which these authors deemed essential to the understanding of modern problems. He attacked the problem from a "service" point of view—that is, to determine what historical facts contemporary historians made use of in their discussion of present-day affairs.

He, therefore, asked the heads of the departments of political science, sociology, and economics of the State

University of Iowa to make out a list of such problems and to list the books. A total of 27 books were listed and analyzed, among them being such books as: Adams, *Science of Finance;* Adams and Sumner, *Labor Problems;* Johnson, *American Railway Transportation;* and Seager, *Social Insurance.*

The 27 books were then analyzed for the six following things according to the outline used by Langlois and Seignobos, in their *Introduction of the Study of History,* pp. 234-235.

1. Percentage of historical material in each book
2. The specific and approximate dates referred to
3. The historical characters referred to
4. The frequency of reference to each period of history. The periods in this study were made to correspond to the study made by W. C. Bagley and Harold O. Rugg *The Content of American History as Taught in the Seventh and Eighth Grades*
5. Frequency of reference to each of the more important phases of history
6. Movements, events, conditions, problems, etc.

A total of 38 topics similar to the content of the 27 books was also used in the analysis of articles in the *International Encyclopedia;* 142 such articles were analyzed.

The topics examined in this study were:

Accident insurance
Ballot
Bank, Banking
Child Labor
Crime
Civil-Service reform
Conservation
Coast defense
Democracy
Divorce
Education
Fire insurance
Family
Efficiency
Feminism
Hygiene
Initiative, Referendum, etc.
Interstate Commerce
Life insurance
Labor
Merchant marine
Monroe Doctrine
Milk
Negro
Regulation of public utilities
Pauperism
Philippines
Pure food
Prisons
Roads
Rural credits
Railways
Socialism
Tariff
Temperance
Transportation
Tax
Woman's suffrage

Tables 23-25, p. 46, give Horn's chief findings.

TABLE XXIII

PERCENTAGE OF HISTORICAL REFERENCES DEVOTED TO VARIOUS PERIODS (HORN)

Period	Books	International Encyclopedia	Elementary Texts
Unclassified	—	3.7	—
Discovery and Exploration	0.1	0.67	8.27
Colonization to 1764	2.5	2.0	19.62
1764-1783	3.8	3.5	13.60
1784-1812	1.8	6.0	14.17
1812-1861	4.7	11.0	21.00
1861-1916	85.7	74.0	24.67

The study does not indicate the per cent of historical material in each book.

TABLE XXIV

THE FREQUENCY OF MENTION TO THE PERSONS IN THE BOOKS AND ENCYCLOPEDIA ARTICLES COMBINED IS AS FOLLOWS (HORN)

Roosevelt	284	Grant, U. S.	18
Smith, Adam	214	Pitt, Wm.	16
Mill, J. S.	174	Wells, H. G.	16
Malthus	74	Gladstone	16
Napoleon	64	Wagner, A.	15
Marx, Karl	59	Webb	14
Owen, Robert	44	LaSalle	14
Gompers	41	Napoleon III	12
Ricardo	38	William III	10
Wilson	30	Gallatin	10
Washington	29	Jackson, Andrew	10
Louis XIV	29	Montaigne	10
Rousseau	26	Hamilton, Alexander	9
George, Henry	25	Wright, C. D.	7
Jefferson, Thomas	24	Shaw, Bernard	6

TABLE XXV

DISTRIBUTION OF REFERENCES TO POLITICAL, MILITARY AND SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC HISTORY (HORN)

Source	Political	Military	Social and Economic
Committee of Eight	33.0	30.0	37
Modern history textbooks	42.0	40.0	18
Books on modern problems	18.7	4.7	78
Encyclopedia articles	37.0	1.7	60

Dr. Horn does not attempt to answer the question as to the complete content of the course, but he does say that he has attempted to investigate the implications of the following assertion: namely, "that history should render pupils more intelligent with regard to modern conditions, problems, and activities. If one assumes (1) that this is the function of history, (2) that the method of research here followed is satisfactory, (3) that sufficient data have been collected, then there seems no escape from the conclusion that present elementary and high school courses of study in history are in very serious need of reconstruction."

Obviously, this does not imply that there are not other functions of history from which one could justify the inclusion of certain material that does not seem to be justified from the examination of the data in this study. Dr. Horn, himself, says that while the data suggest emphases to various items, they do not indicate what the organization of the course should be. Hence, we should keep in mind the need to utilize other technics in order to determine additional values of the material taught in American history.

Study 14

Swisher[12] studied what history is most necessary to the intelligent understanding of modern *political* problems, conditions, and activities, on the theory "that if a representative list of the more crucial modern problems could be secured, and if among the books dealing with such problems, those be selected which give the clearest statement of that problem, it might be expected that these books would contain at least the sort of history, or amount of historical reference which, in the judgment of the authors, is essential to a proper understanding of the modern problems that are discussed." Members of the Department of Political Science at the State University of Iowa were asked to list books which deal in a representative way with modern problems.

---

[12]Swisher, J. A., "The Historical Information Essential for the Intelligent Understanding of Civic Problems," *Seventeenth Yearbook*, Part 1, pp. 81-89, The National Society for the study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1918.

Twenty-two books were given and were used as a basis for Swisher's study. Examples of these books are the following: Adams, *Science of Finance;* Fairchild, *Immigration;* Haynes, *Child Labor;* and Jenks, *The Trust Problem.* Also 22 articles of similar material were checked in the *Cyclopedia of American Government.*

TABLE XXVI

THE TWENTY MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED PERSONS OUT OF 463 IN BOOKS AND CYCLOPEDIA ARTICLES (SWISHER)

Person	Different Problems	Number of Times Mentioned	Product
Books			
Roosevelt	10	25	250
Cleveland, President	7	9	63
McKinley, President	5	9	45
Smith, Adam	5	11	55
Taft, President	4	11	44
Jackson, President	4	11	44
Grant, President	5	8	40
Mill, John Stuart	5	8	40
Wilson, President	6	6	36
Garfield, President	4	8	32
Malthus	4	8	32
Montesquieu	3	7	21
Eliot, Charles W.	4	4	16
Hamilton, Alexander	4	4	16
Harrison, President W. H.	3	5	15
Walker, Francis	3	5	15
Hughes, Charles Evans	3	4	12
Lincoln, Abraham	3	4	12
Bryce, James	3	3	9
Clay, Henry	3	3	9
Cobden, Richard	3	3	9
List, Frederick	3	3	9
Washington, President	3	3	9
Cyclopedia Articles			
Cleveland	4	6	24
Taft	4	6	24
Roosevelt	3	4	12
Wilson	2	5	10.
Wright, Francis	2	2	4

The material was analyzed for four types of data: (1) Historical persons referred to in each book; (2) specific dates and frequency of reference to various periods in history; (3) the frequency of reference to the leading

foreign countries; and (4) historical movements, events, conditions, and problems. (See Tables 26-28, pp. 48-49.)

TABLE XXVII

DATES MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED IN BOOKS AND CYCLOPEDIA ARTICLES (SWISHER)

Date	Different Problems	Times Mentioned
1882	9	34
1887	14	34
1890	20	66
1893	14	33
1894	14	54
1896	13	43
1897	17	53
1898	16	41
1899	11	35
1900	18	73
1901	21	41
1903	15	36
1904	11	37
1906	10	33
1907	18	61
1908	13	71
1909	12	45
1910	17	78
1911	14	35
1912	19	69

TABLE XXVIII

COMPARISON OF PER CENT OF SPACE GIVEN VARIOUS PERIODS OF HISTORY IN TEXTBOOKS AND BY WRITERS OF CONTEMPORARY PROBLEMS (SWISHER)

Period	Books	International Cyclopedia	Elementary Texts	Present Work
Unclassified	———	3.7	———	———
Discovery and exploration	0.1	0.67	8.27	0.93
Colonial to 1764	2.5	2.0	19.62	2.46
1764-1783	3.8	3.5	13.69	1.72
1783-1812	1.8	6.0	14.17	4.38
1812-1861	4.7	11.0	21.00	16.39
1861-1916	85.7	74.0	24.67	74.12

The outstanding feature of the historical information essential for the understanding of political problems (studies 13 and 14) is that this historical information made

use of by specialists writing about *contemporary* problems deals chiefly with materials in relatively recent times, particularly since the Civil War. One should note (Table 28) that whereas most attenion by the writers of contemporary problems is given to the history since 1861, 74.12 per cent for example, that elementary textbooks give only 24.67 per cent of the allotment of space to the same period. Such a discrepancy between the history used by writers on contemporary problems and the history set forth in textbooks calls, at least, for more serious study of the bases upon which crucial materials of the past are selected for inclusion in the present social science curriculum.

Study 15

Peters[13] sought to determine what information is necessary for the following item of culture: *At least superficial acquaintance with a wide variety of matters, so as not to be entirely ignorant of practically anything met with in reading or heard about, but also to "place" them at least roughly in their setting.* Peters asserts that this ability to place references and to get satisfaction from it is an important element of culture. The study is included here because it is another check upon the informational facts involving history and geography in popular literature.

Classes of Professor Peters searched through the most widely read contemporary literature to discover references to history, geography, and the like, because "It is in connection with such literature that the typical person will have occasion to get the satisfactions and questions."

A study of Mr. H. F. Jenkins, of Little, Brown and Company, involving what books have been most widely read within recent years, was used. Twenty-six "best sellers," including such books as *Main Street, Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse, The Shepherd of the Hills, Great Heart, The River's End, Heart of the West,* and *The Inside of the Cup,* were therefore analyzed for allusions in which information

[13]Peters, C. C., "Detailed Analysis of One Objective of Cultural Education," Published in Peters' *Foundations of Educational Sociology,* pp. 419-424, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1924.

concerning history, geography, and literature was called for. Local references were excluded and duplicates counted only if they occurred in a new setting.

"Besides these twenty-six novels there were covered in the same way twenty-five short stories, four thousand jokes, two thousand comic pictures in the newspapers, and the legends of ten moving picture shows. These lists were then telescoped and the number of times each item occurred thus determined. The most frequently mentioned item—New York City—had occurred ninety-six times and the others ranged from that down to one time. Motion picture shows and short stories were added until the highest one stood at exactly one hundred." This tends to give a fair sampling of the reading that the rank and file of people do, and hence indicates rather reliably the background of information needed for the maximum appreciation of this reading.

The most frequently mentioned items are listed in Table 29.

TABLE XXIX

HISTORICAL AND GEOGRAPHICAL TOPICS IN CONTEMPORARY LITERATURE (PETERS)

Topic	Times Mentioned	Topic	Times Mentioned
New York City	100	Shakespeare	19
Germany	55	George Washington	19
France	54	Henry Ford	18
England	50	Caesar	18
The Bible	44	New England	17
London	43	Lincoln	16
Paris	30	Congress	16
Chicago	29	Greece	16
Europe	28	Italy	15
Ireland	24	Russia	15
China	23	Scotland	15
Boston	21	California	15
Rome	20		

Dr. Peters' study is further substantiation of the basic common facts that one encounters in another source of reading—namely, most widely read contemporary litera-

ture. With the other studies in this field, it should be used to amplify and check attempts to obtain as complete a list as possible of socially valuable minimal essential facts in geography and history.

Study 16

Williams[14] combined several studies to discover objectively the persons to emphasize in the social studies—in other words, the common persons to include in the course of study. The investigator emphasizes the fact that biography has been found to be an important reading activity—ranking seventh in the 23 classes of books published in 1924. The studies included are all reviewed in this monograph except Cattell's *Statistical Study of Eminent Men* and can be identified in the key to Table 30, p. 54.

The rankings in Table 30 tend to avoid "chance" mention, but are subject at least to the following limitations: (1) The criteria on some studies are similar and hence persons mentioned in one investigation tend to appear in other studies with similar technics—for example, the criteria in the Horn and Swisher studies are similar; (2) the number of persons ranked in various studies varies; (3) studies using textbooks as a criterion tend to include many persons because textbooks are systematic, comprehensive "manuals"; and (4) several investigations perhaps tend to overweight the present. (See Table 30, p. 53.)

There is need for a more comprehensive study of the great personages of history.

CRITERION 3—STUDIES THAT ENDEAVOR TO USE THE JUDGMENT OF EXPERTS CONCERNING SOCIALLY VALUABLE FACTS

Study 17

Whitbeck[15] attempted to prepare a list of locational facts

[14]Williams, B. M., *A Critical Study of Possible Methods of Evaluating Biographies for the Purpose of Curriculums in the Social Studies,* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa, 1926.

[15]Whitbeck, R. H., "Where Shall We Lay the Emphasis in Teaching Geography?" *Education,* Vol. 31, pp. 108-116 (October, 1910).

to be thoroughly taught and permanently learned in the field of geography. Some 75 teachers, principals, and superintendents from twenty or more states, representing all kinds of schools, acted as judges to prepare the list of lo-

TABLE XXX

RANKING OF PERSONS WHERE TWO OR MORE STUDIES MENTION A GIVEN PERSON (WILLIAMS)

Person	W 100	H-1 24	H-2 25	H-3 30	H-4 24	H-5 5	BR-1 25	BR-2 25	S-1 23	S-2 5	B 12	M,MCK and B 25	C 100
Adams, J.							5					9	
Adams, J. Q.	11						9				11	10	
Adams, Sam							16					19	
Aristotle	88		14		15								6
Bismarck	35	13											
Buchanan							18				12	16	
Burr							23					23	
Bryan	70												30
Caesar, J.	13												8
Caesar, A.		13											20
Calhoun							14					13	
Carnegie	18	10											
Clay, H.					16		8		20		6	7	
Cleveland	23				17				2	1	7		
Dante	57												42
Davis, Jeff							20					14	
Douglas, S.							17					15	
Eliot, C. W.	71								13				
Elizabeth, Queen	22				18								
Franklin	44	20	15		11		11				10	4	45
Gladstone	30			19	20								
Gompers	87	11		8		3							
Grant	19		24	16	10			3	7			5	
Hamilton				28			7		14			6	
Harrison							25	23	15			24	
Henry, P.							12					18	
Homer	81												13
Hughes, C. E.	14								17				
Jackson, A.			25	26	21		4	24	6		4	5	
Jay, J.							24					22	
Jefferson	28		9	15	8		3				3	3	79
Lee, R. E.	77							2					
Lincoln	2						1		18		1	1	40
Lloyd-George	10	5											
Louis XIV	47		5	12	4								66
Madison								6				11	
Malthus		6		4	6				11				
McKinley	26								3			8	
Mill, J. S.		3	3	3	1				8				
Monroe							10					12	
Napoleon I	7	8	8	5	2								1
Napoleon III				23	24								4
Pitt, Wm.			12	17				11					18
Plato	73		11										10
Roosevelt	1	1	1	1		1			1	3			
Rousseau			4	13	7								43
Shakespeare	9												2
Shaw	12			30									
Scott, Sir W.	51												27
Smith, A.		2	7	2	3				4				
Taft	4								5	2			
Taylor							25	14				25	
Tyler							19					20	
Van Buren							13					17	
Vergil	98												57
Washington			18	11	5		2	1	23		2	2	19
Wells, H. G.	65			18		4							
Wilson	3	24	20	10		2			9	4			
Wordsworth	37												67

cational facts. Committees were chosen to decide upon the cities in a given continent to be included. No city was to be included unless it stood for more than one important thing. The lists of these cities were then passed over to a group of textbook writers in the field of geography consisting of Professors Tarr, Brigham, C. A. McMurry, Emerson, Hubbard, and Whitbeck.

The list (See p. 55) shows the cities that the committee deemed important enough to be thoroughly taught and permanently mastered on each continent; the numeral after the name of each city indicates the number of votes out of six "faculty" votes that the city received.

The significant conclusion to be drawn from this study is that only a relatively small number of place location facts out of a rather large total list[16] found in geographies are endorsed by even specialists in geography.

Study 18

A study by Wooters[17] attempted to ascertain a standard list of dates to be memorized in American history. A long list of dates and events rather commonly presented in elementary school histories was included in a questionnaire sent to 150 members of the American Historical Association. These included high school, normal, and college teachers of history, city superintendents, and authors of leading school histories. These people were asked to rank the twenty most important dates out of the list suggested,

[16]For evidence, See Study 45, Chapter VI.

[17]Wooters, J. E., "Elementary American History Standards; Results of an Investigation Carried on to Determine the Most Important Dates for Memorizing in the Elementary School," *School and Home Education*, Vol. 34, pp. 152-155 (December, 1914).

KEY TO TABLE 30, P. 53.

BR-1—Bagley-Harold Rugg list—prominent in civil life (25 persons ranked.)
BR-2—Bagley-Harold Rugg list—prominent in military life (25 persons ranked.)
S-1—Swisher references to persons in 22 books (23 persons ranked.)
S-2—Swisher references to persons in 22 encyclopedia articles (23 persons ranked.)
B—Bagley list (12 persons ranked.)
M, MCK and B—Marston, McKown and Bagley list (25 persons ranked.)
C—Cattell list (100 persons ranked.)
W—Washburne's study (100 persons ranked.)
H-3—Horn's references to persons in 27 books (24 persons ranked.)
H-2—Horn's references to persons in encyclopedia 25 persons ranked.)
H-3—Horn's references to persons in books and encylclopedias combined (30 persons ranked.)
H-4—Horn's references to persons not now living of list 3 (24 persons ranked.)
H-5—Horn's references to persons now living of list 3 (5 persons ranked.)

marking the most important date first, the next important, second, and so on. Provision was made for omission or addition of dates. Seventy-three replies were used in the final summary.

In tabulating the ranks, the following arbitrary scheme was adopted for evaluating dates: Each rank of one was valued at twenty points, rank two was given nineteen points; down to rank twenty, valued at one point; for each zero vote, ten points were deducted.

THE UNITED STATES (25)

New York (6)
Chicago (6)
Philadelphia (6)
St. Louis (6)
Boston (6)
Baltimore (2)
Cleveland (3)
Buffalo (3)
Pittsburgh (6)
San Francisco (6)
Cincinnati (2)
New Orleans (6)
Milwaukee (2)
Washington (6)
Denver (6)
Louisville (2)
Minneapolis-St. Paul (6)
Kansas City (2)
Indianapolis (2)
Duluth-Superior (5)
Salt Lake City (3)
Puget Sound Cities (4)
Scranton-Wilkes Barre (3)
Galveston (4)
Lowell (3)

EUROPE (16)

London (6)
Liverpool-Manchester (6)
Edinburgh (6)
Glasgow (6)
Madrid (4)
Berlin (6)
Hamburg (6)
Vienna (4)
Rome (6)
Naples (3)
Athens (6)
Constantinople (6)
St. Petersburg (6)
Paris (6)
Marseilles (3)
Venice (4)

ASIA (18)

Bombay (6)
Calcutta (6)
Canton (5)
Pekin-Tien-tsin (6)
Hongkong (5)
Jerusalem (6)
Tokio-Yokohama (6)
Mecca-Medina (3)

WESTERN CONTINENT—EXCLUSIVE OF U. S. (6)

Montreal (6)
Quebec (5)
Rio de Janerio (6)
Buenos Aires
Havana (6)
Mexico

AFRICA, AUSTRALIA, AND SCATTERED ISLANDS (8)

Cairo (5)
Cape Town (5)
Johannesburg (3)
Melbourne (4)
Sydney (3)
Manila (6)
Batavia (3)
Honolulu (6)

Only five dates—1492, 1607, 1776, 1789, 1812—received no votes for elimination. The "experts" were also asked to add dates to the lists submitted. Five hundred thirty-nine additions were suggested, but only six—1618, 1828, 1860, 1890, 1898, 1902—received four or more votes.

"The most striking conclusion to be drawn from the investigation is the lack of agreement among those who may be considered specialists in history as to what constitutes the fundamentals of elementary work." (See Table below.)

TABLE XXXI

DATES, RANKED AS TO IMPORTANCE FOR MEMORIZING IN THE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL (WOOTERS)

Rank	Date	Evaluation Index	Rank	Date	Evaluation Index
1	1776	1,323	11	1812	752
2	1492	1,261	12	1765	629
3	1607	1,163	13	1783	618
4	1789	1,100	14	(Apr. 9)	
5	1620	961		1865	601
6	1803	955	15	1850	591
7	(Apr. 14)		16	1854	590
	1861	901	17	1775	585
8	1787	821	18	1781	584
9	(Jan. 1)		19	1823	526
	1863	808	20	1846	470
10	1820	793			

CRITERION 4—STUDIES THAT SUGGEST COMMON ESSENTIAL FACTS UPON OTHER STANDARDS OR CRITERIA

Study 19

Branom and Reavis used certain objective criteria for the selection of a list[18] of the minimal essentials in the field of geography. The writers stated that the list should emphasize relational facts as well as facts of place. The following standards or criteria were employed: (1) The area of the country in square miles; (2) population; (3) total value of imports; (4) total value of imports from the

[18]Branom, M. E., and Reavis, W. C., "The Determination and Measurement of the Minimal Essentials of Elementary School Geography," *Seventeeth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 37-39, The National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1918.

United States; (5) total value of exports; and (6) total value of exports to the United States. The writers assert that "these criteria not only offer objective data of great significance in the study of particular countries, but also afford a means of measuring the relations of the United States to other countries."

Using as their source of data the *Statistical Abstract of the United States*, 1915, 50 countries were ranked according to their relative importance with respect to each of the six criteria above. The 50 countries were then divided into quintiles, and the rank in the first quintile was given five points; in the second, four points; etc., for each of the six criteria. The total score of a country on the six criteria indicates the relative importance of that country among the countries of the world.

Table 32 indicates the total score of each country and its rank in the quintile on the six standards. (See p. 58.)

These rankings should tend to make one critical of the relative importance of certain countries to be studied. Without sufficient time to cover all countries adequately, the teacher using this and other criteria, such as the criteria of Washburne, Thomas, and Harold Rugg and Hockett, in their investigations, may make more certain of covering what is likely to be the most socially valuable subject matter in the field of geography.

Study 20

Harold Rugg and Hockett[19] attempted to determine the relative importance in contemporary life of map (geographical) locations of all kinds. Many objective measures of importance were combined to determine rank order lists of cities, regions, rivers, mountains, countries, islands, etc. Map locations were grouped in the following classes: (1) Cities of the United States; (2) cities of the world; (3) countries; (4) sections and regions within or over-

[19]Rugg, Harold, and Hockett, John, *Objective Studies in Map Location*, Social Science Monographs, No. 1, The Lincoln School of Teachers College, New York, 1924.

TABLE XXXII

THE 50 COUNTRIES RANKED AS TO RELATIVE IMPORTANCE

Country	Area	Population	Total Imports	Imports from U. S.	Total Exports	Exports to U. S.	Total*
1. United States	5	5	5	5	5	5	30
2. Great Britain	3	5	5	5	5	5	28
3. Germany	3	5	5	5	5	5	28
4. France	3	5	5	5	5	5	28
5. India	5	5	5	3	5	5	28
6. Austria-Hungary	4	5	5	5	5	4	28
7. Russia	5	5	5	4	5	3	27
8. Canada	5	4	4	5	4	5	27
9. Italy	2	5	5	5	5	5	27
10. Japan	3	5	4	5	4	5	26
11. China	5	5	4	4	4	4	26
12. Brazil	5	4	3	4	4	5	25
13. Argentina	5	4	4	4	4	4	25
14. Netherlands	1	3	5	5	5	5	24
15. Mexico	5	4	3	4	3	5	24
16. Belgium	1	3	5	5	5	4	23
17. Australia	5	2	4	5	4	3	23
18. Spain	3	4	4	4	3	3	21
19. Sweden	3	3	4	4	4	3	21
20. Egypt	4	4	3	2	3	4	20
21. Turkey	4	4	3	2	3	4	20
22. Switzerland	1	2	4	4	4	4	19
23. Chile	4	2	3	3	3	4	19
24. So. African Union	4	3	3	3	4	2	19
25. Philippine Is.	2	4	2	4	2	4	18
26. Peru	4	3	2	3	2	4	18
27. Cuba	4	3	1	3	2	4	17
28. Denmark	1	2	4	4	4	2	17
29. Norway	3	2	3	3	3	3	17
30. Algeria	4	3	3	2	3	1	16
31. New Zealand	2	1	3	3	3	3	15
32. Persia	4	4	2	1	2	2	15
33. Portugal	1	3	3	3	2	2	14
34. Roumania	2	3	3	2	2	3	14
35. Venezuela	4	2	1	3	1	3	14
36. Bolivia	5	2	1	2	2	1	13
37. Uruguay	2	1	2	2	3	3	13
38. Siam	3	4	2	1	2	1	13
39. Greece	2	2	2	1	2	2	11
40. Morocco	3	3	2	1	1	1	11
41. Serbia	1	2	2	1	2	2	10
42. Bulgaria	2	2	2	1	2	1	10
43. Equador	3	1	1	2	1	2	10
44. Haiti	1	2	1	3	1	1	9
45. Tunis	2	1	2	1	2	1	9
46. Honduras	2	1	1	2	1	1	9
47. Costa Rica	1	1	1	2	1	3	9
48. Guatemala	2	1	1	2	1	2	9
49. Panama	1	1	1	2	1	2	8
50. Salvador	1	1	1	1	1	2	7

*An arbitrary perfect score of 30 points has been assigned to the United States because it is the home country of the pupils.

lapping countries; (5) rivers; (6) mountains; (7) islands; (8) bodies of water; (9) states of the United States; and (10) railroads, steamship routes, industrial areas, agricultural areas.

The following are the criteria which were used to determine the relative importance of many map locations within each class listed above.

1. Population. Used as one criterion for determining relative importance of cities, both of the United States and foreign countries.

2. Foreign trade. Total exports and imports averaged for several years. Used as a measure for the commercial importance of countries.

3. Bank clearings. A measure of the commercial importance of the cities of the United States. Not found to be applicable to foreign cities.

4. Area. Used as a minor measure of importance of countries.

5. Frequency of use by "frontier thinkers" in critical magazines. A tabulation was made of every reference to a map location in 100 issues of the following critical magazines during the period, November, 1918, to April, 1924: *Our World, International Interpreter, New Republic, Nation, Outlook, Living Age, Manchester Guardian Weekly.* This criterion was applicable to all classes of locations. The analysis gave two measures of relative importance of locations. First, all locations in each class were ranked on the basis of the per cent of the total number of issues in which they were mentioned. Second, the gross frequency of mention of places was used as a less important measure. A total of over 28,000 references to map locations was found.

6. Frequency of use by "frontier thinkers" in critical books. A tabulation was made of every reference to map location in fifteen recent outstanding books dealing with world affairs and problems. Such books as the following

were used: Bryce, *International Relations;* Angell, *The Fruits of Victory;* Feuter, *World History,* 1815-1920; Keynes, *Economic Consequences of the Peace;* Eckel, *Coal, Iron and War;* and Bowman, *The New World.* The frequency of mention and the space devoted to map locations were used to determine the relative importance of locations. This criterion was found to be applicable to all classes of locations but with varying significance.

7. Number of articles in all important magazines. The number of articles dealing with map locations in four volumes of the *Reader's Guide* and *International Index* was tabulated, and the various locations were ranked in order of importance on this criterion. The years, 1919, 1920, 1922, and 1923, were covered in this analysis. This measure applied to all classes of location. A total of 20,000 articles dealt with 1086 different map locations.

8. Washburne's rank order list. Use was made of the investigation of reference to historical and geographical facts found in popular magazines and newspapers, made by Superintendent Washburne, summarized elsewhere in this chapter (Study 11). All map locations were selected from the Washburne rank order list and re-ranked for use in this study.

After weights were assigned to each criterion in each class of locations, final rank order lists were determined for each class of locations, examples of which are given in the following tables.

TABLE XXXIII

THE FIRST 30 CITIES OF THE UNITED STATES RANKED IN ORDER OF IMPORTANCE (HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

1. New York City, N. Y.	11. Cleveland, Ohio	21. Indianapolis, Ind.
2. Chicago, Ill.	12. New Orleans, La.	22. Denver, Colo.
3. Philadelphia, Pa.	13. Baltimore, Md.	23. Portland, Oregon.
4. Boston, Mass.	14. Kansas City, Mo.	24. Omaha, Nebr.
5. San Francisco, Calif.	15. Brooklyn, N. Y.	25. Atlanta, Ga.
6. Detroit, Mich.	16. Seattle, Wash.	26. Newark, N. J.
7. St. Louis, Mo.	17. Minneapolis, Minn.	27. Memphis, Tenn.
8. Washington, D. C.	18. Cincinnati, Ohio	28. Columbus, Ohio
9. Pittsburgh, Pa.	19. Buffalo, N. Y.	29. Toledo, Ohio
10. Los Angeles, Calif.	20. Milwaukee, Wisc.	30. Louisville, Ky.

TABLE XXXIV

RANK ORDER LIST OF 50 MOST IMPORTANT FOREIGN CITIES (HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

1. Paris
2. London
3. Berlin
4. Vienna
5. Rome
6. Moscow
7. Constantinople
8. Petrograd
9. Tokio
10. Peking
11. Brussels
12. Manchester
13. Versailles
14. Athens
15. Budapest
16. Warsaw
17. Shanghai
18. Liverpool
19. Hamburg
20. Madrid
21. Smyrna
22. Munich
23. Dublin
24. Buenos Aires
25. The Hague
26. Bagdad
27. Milan
28. Mexico City
29. Geneva
30. Leipsig
31. Genoa
32. Toronto
33. Copenhagen
34. Vilna
35. Prague
36. Venice
37. Glasgow
38. Belfast
39. Stockholm
40. Vladivostok
41. Frankfort
42. Angora
43. Mosul
44. Jerusalem
45. Riga
46. Montreal
47. Singapore
48. Hongkong
49. Barcelona
50. Calcutta

TABLE XXXV

THE FIRST 30 COUNTRIES OF THE WORLD IN ORDER OF IMPORTANCE (HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

(Only countries which are members of the League of Nations or eligible to membership are included.)

1. United States
2. France
3. Germany
4. China
5. Great Britain
6. Russia
7. Japan
8. Italy
9. India
10. Turkey
11. Canada
12. Poland
13. Egypt
14. Greece
15. Spain
16. Belgium
17. Ireland
18. Mexico
19. Rumania
20. Hungary
21. Austria
22. Czecho-Slovakia
23. Australia
24. Netherlands
25. Jugoslavia
26. Bulgaria
27. Switzerland
28. Persia
29. Brazil
30. Sweden

TABLE XXXVI

THE 40 MOST IMPORTANT SECTIONS AND REGIONS OF THE WORLD ARRANGED IN ORDER OF IMPORTANCE (HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

(Countries which are not independent political units are not included.)

1. Europe
2. England
3. America
4. Africa
5. Asia
6. South America
7. Balkan States
8. Prussia
9. Morocco
10. Siberia
11. Mesopotamia
12. Far East
13. Armenia
14. Near East
15. Alsace-Lorraine
16. Serbia
17. Macedonia
18. Asia Minor
19. Arabia
20. Manchuria
21. Albania
22. Central America
23. Korea
24. Algeria
25. Syria
26. Ukraine
27. South Africa
28. Palestine
29. Shantung
30. North America
31. Galacia
32. Silesia
33. Bavaria
34. Lorraine
35. Bosnia
36. Latin America
37. Soudan
38. Ulster
39. East Africa
40. Bohemia

TABLE XXXVII

THE TWENTY RIVERS OF GREATEST IMPORTANCE IN ORDER OF RANK
(HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

1. Rhine
2. Nile
3. Danube
4. Mississippi
5. Hudson
6. Volga
7. Euphrates
8. Yangtse
9. Saar
10. Jordan
11. Thames
12. Tigris
13. Scheldt
14. St. Lawrence
15. Amazon
16. Congo
17. Somme
18. Colorado
19. Clyde
20. Amur

TABLE XXXVIII

THE TEN MOST IMPORTANT MOUNTAINS IN ORDER OF RANK
(HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

1. Alps
2. Caucasus
3. Rocky
4. Ural
5. Carpathian
6. Andes
7. Everest
8. Appalachian
9. Himalaya
10. Mt. Blanc

TABLE XXXIX

THE 25 MOST IMPORTANT BODIES OF WATER IN ORDER OF RANK
(HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

1. Pacific Ocean
2. Atlantic
3. Mediterranean
4. Dardanelles
5. Black Sea
6. Adriatic
7. Baltic
8. Arctic
9. Bosphorus
10. Suez Canal
11. Panama Canal
12. Great Lakes
13. North Sea
14. Caribbean Sea
15. "The Straits"
16. Aegean Sea
17. Red Sea
18. Kiel Canal
19. Niagara Falls
20. Caspian Sea
21. Persian Gulf
22. Hudson Bay
23. Indian Ocean
24. Lake Superior
25. Gulf of Finland

TABLE XL

THE 21 MOST IMPORTANT ISLAND GROUPS IN ORDER OF RANK
(HAROLD RUGG AND HOCKETT)

1. Philippines
2. West Indies
3. Hawaiian
4. East Indian
5. Porto Rico
6. Sicily
7. Samoan Islands
8. Long Island
9. Sakhalin
10. New Guinea
11. Cyprus
12. Malta
13. Formosa
14. Manhattan
15. Crete
16. Sardinia
17. Virgin Islands
18. Heligoland
19. Guam
20. Aland Islands
21. Madagascar

Study 21

The problem studied by Miss Dodd[20] was to determine specific historical references contained in the 118 English poems required for entrance to the University of Illinois

[20]Dodd, S. H., "History of Poetry," *Journal of Educational Research*, Vol. 4., pp. 294-300 (November, 1921).

in 1918. Specific references to dates, institutions, persons, places, and written productions were tabulated. Her method was to collect the specific references concerning that portion of history "included in the thoughts, feelings, resolutions, beliefs, and customs of the individual characters, and of the people treated in the selections." The scoring plan finally adopted was "to score characters, places, dates, institutions, and written productions only once for each selection."

One hundred twenty-seven different characters appear in the 118 poems. Alexander, Caesar, Cromwell, and Shakespeare rank highest in frequency.

"Only twelve dates appeared in 118 poems. These were *Marathon Day 490 B. C.,* in 'Browning's Pheidippides'; *St. Cecelia's Day, Nov. 22, 1687,* in Browning's 'A Song of St. Celia's Day'; *Drummossie Day, April 16, 1746,* in Burns' 'Lament for Culloden'; *1692* and *May 31, 1692,* in Browning's 'Herve Riel'; *1746* in Collins' 'Ode written in MDCCXLVI'; *1802* in Wordsworth's 'England and Switzerland, 1802'; *1802* in Wordsworth's 'London MDCCII'; *September 3, 1802* in Wordsworth's 'Upon Westminister Bridge, Sept. 3, 1802'; *1803* in Wordsworth's 'Yarrow Unvisited, 1803'; *1803* in Wordsworth's 'Composed at Neidpath Castle, 1803'; and *September, 1814* in Wordsworth's 'Yarrow Unvisited.' "

Obviously the number of historical references in these poems is relatively small. The author of the study, however, says, "A list of the historical findings in English poetry is of practical value to both the teacher of English and the teacher of history. While a history curriculum cannot, of course, be worked out on the basis of historical references in poetry alone nor even on the basis of such references in both the poetry and prose read in the High School, a study of these references will aid in coordinating more satisfactorily the history curriculum with other things which the student is expected to learn in his High School course." (See Table 41, pp. 64-65.)

TABLE XLI

TYPICAL LISTS OF THE CHARACTERS REPRESENTING TWELVE DIFFERENT NATIONALITIES (DODD)

English	*American (including Indian) 23*
Bariffe	John Alden
Sir George Beaumont	Aspinet
Princess Charlotte	Chalkley
George Chapman	Corbitant
Oliver Cromwell	George Haskell
John Dryden	Stephen Hopkins
Queen Elizabeth	Merdy E. Hussey
King Edward	Harriet Livermore
Thomas Ellwood	Priscilla Mullins
Arthur Golding	Sanroset
John Hampden	Wm. Sewel
Childe Harold (Lord Byron)	Squanto
Samuel Johnson	Miles Standish
Kempenfelt	Rose Standish
Milton	Tohamahamon
Thomas Otway	Mrs. Mercy Warren
Henry Hotspur Percy	Richard Warren
Lord Queensberry	George Washington
Radcliffe	Mrs. Whittier
Shakespeare	Moses Whittier
Shelley	Elizabeth Whittier
Siward	Miss Whittier
Hugh Standish	Gilbert Winslow
Ralph Standish	
Thurston de Standish	
Wat Tayler	
Wordsworth	

Scotch, 17	*Roman, 17*
Jean Armour	Mark Anthony
Burns	Brutus
Mary Campbell	Caesar
William Douglas	Saint Cecilia
Ellen Douglas	Cicero
James Douglas	Cornelia
King Duncan	Hadrian
James V. Lisley	Horace
Macbeth	St. Jerome
Lady Macbeth	Livy
Macdonald	Cecilia Metella
Malcolm	Pompey
Queen Mary	Publius Scipio
Mary Morrison	Lucius Sulla
Walter Scott	Titus
Earl of Douglas III	Trojan
	Virgil

TABLE XLI (Continued)

Greek, 5
Apollonius
Homer
Miltiades
Pheidippides
Plato

Bible characters (without reference to frequency of mention)

Abraham	Eve
Amun	God
Ataroth	Goliath
Baal	Isaac
Bathsheba	John
Beelzebub	Mary
Boaz	Og
Cain	Paul
Christ	Rebecca
David	Satan

INTERPRETATIONS

The studies summarized in this chapter frankly imply that the common essential facts in the social sciences are chiefly of *service* value. In other words, these impersonal studies imply that if one can discover from analyses of the ways citizens use these facts, the particular facts most likely to occur, these items will "serve" as the *contributory* materials for intelligent reading of citizens. Several criteria were set up to discover in particular what facts are most frequent and universal.

One of the chief hypotheses followed is that an analysis of periodical literature will reflect the minimal essential facts demanded for intelligent reading of newspapers and magazines that are perhaps the chief informal agency of adult education. Analysis of textbooks[21] shows hundreds of facts mentioned. As noted earlier, textbooks are organized on the theory that they should be comprehensive. Students of educational values naturally question the use of all facts presented. Studies 8 to 12 illustrate specific persons, place location facts, and topics most frequently mentioned in periodicals. Combined, they probably constitute a better objective list of socially valuable facts than the present assumption that a comprehensive list should be mastered.

[21]See Chapter VI.

One writer, Bagley, points out[22] what he regards as a fundamental limitation to this type of study; namely, that common standards cannot be found in periodicals with large circulation because the widely read newspapers and magazines contain relatively few allusions to political, social, and industrial materials; whereas, those newspapers and magazines that relate and discuss the events and problems of the day on a broad and comprehensive plane, with interpretations and references involving for their understanding a certain capacity for formal knowledge, appeal in general to a smaller clientele and have in consequence a limited circulation. In other words, he contends that one may argue that the level upon which newspapers make their appeal depends as much upon the extent to which formal education has benefited their readers as upon the extent that periodicals will lift the reading levels of comprehension of the people.

The present writer, while cognizant of this limitation, feels that the data revealed by analysis of periodicals of limited circulation, if selected carefully on the criterion of critical discussion of current problems, are significant, nevertheless. The facts referred to in critical magazines, even if of limited circulation, may be regarded as standard items of knowledge that at least citizen leaders require. If critical students of societal needs use such facts frequently and universally, then the school might well concentrate upon such items as the core of knowledge that everyone needs as a basis for engaging efficiently in citizenship activities and difficulties.

Facts needed by critical writers of books dealing with modern problems are illustrated in studies 13 and 14. Here the criterion is again one of standards: What common facts do these writers have to make use of in order to give one the necessary data to comprehend current problems? This technic does not preclude the determination of facts of value for other purposes. The criterion followed by Horn and Swisher was frankly to regard the historical facts

[22]Bagley, W. C., "Principles Underlying Common Elements in the School Program," *School and Home Education*, Vol. 30, pp. 119-131 (December, 1914).

made use of by these writers of books on contemporary problems as "service" materials. This criterion would not exclude the teaching of historical facts found to be necessary by objective investigation of other criteria. For example, one might investigate what facts of a given period seemed important to critical students living at the time the events in question were present politics rather than past history.

Studies 17 and 18 attempt to list common facts of greatest utility by employing the judgment of experts. This method is analogous to the use of "frontier thinkers" in discovering problems. As the results of these studies show, one obtains a *restricted* list of facts. Care must be taken, however, to secure a sufficient number of judges to obtain an adequate measure of agreement.

Studies 19 and 20 reflect the use of several criteria. For example, both Branom and Reavis and Rugg and Hockett in attempting to list place location facts of greatest relative value used data available concerning trade statistics, population, and area. The latter also employed the criterion of place-location facts used by writers of critical articles and books. From such lists one again probably tends to obtain better objective bases for determining what knowledge is of most worth than by the traditional selection of material by textbook authors.

One further study—No. 21—should be noted as a pioneer investigation of another problem. Authors of textbooks dealing with related subject matter—English, mathematics, science, arts, and music—also use the facts of the social sciences. Miss Dodd's study suggests the facts one needs in order to understand poetry. If the life value of the materials in other related subjects is objectively determined, the results of analysis of facts of the social sciences used in such related studies should be of distinct value for curriculum purposes in two or more fields—the social studies and the related study demanded intelligent understanding of social facts.[23]

[23]Investigations of the history, government, economics, etc., used in science, mathematical, literary, art, and music activities should be made.

SUMMARY

The race experience embraces literally thousands of specific facts. The presumption is that we need to use the results of race experience in performing the duties and meeting the difficulties of life activities.[24] The present curriculum attempts to give pupils a "bird's-eye" view of the social heritage; it implies a transfer, namely, that one having studied a summary of *all* of the subject matter will apply each item as called for in life situations. Results of tests on subject matter show, however, but partial retention of these facts, even when retention of facts is the predominant objective of teachers.

Students of educational values have recently assumed that: (1) All facts cannot be of use in life; and (2) it is possible to discover objectively which facts are commonly needed.

These studies do show that some facts recur frequently in life and others scarcely at all. The facts of greatest utility are apparently but a small part of the sum total of knowledge even now embraced in the social science curriculum. With objective evidence of what facts are of greatest worth and with these but relatively few in number, it should be possible to organize materials in the social sciences in such manner as to make certain that pupils permanently master the content revealed by impersonal study to be probably *most* needed by them throughout life.

One other issue should be commented upon. Any analysis of common facts must assure curriculum makers that such facts are persistent. While some of the investigations do give one an index of persistency there is as yet insufficient evidence from analysis over at least 30 years to indicate accurately the permanent value of common facts.

---

[24]The writer doubts the assumption of value of subject matter for its own sake as common material; for elective courses one may perhaps justify any content socially approved and that the school can afford to teach.

CHAPTER V

OBJECTIVE STUDIES OF ACTIVITIES, ABILITIES, AND TRAITS DEMANDED OF CITIZENS

We have asserted earlier our belief that the chief task of the school is to help boys and girls do well the things they are going to do anyway and to help them to do well more desirable things.[1] The best method of determining the things one does and should do is probably analysis. By complete, detailed inventories following the analysis technic, one will tend to obtain with some certainty the particularized objectives that are crucial to a complete curriculum, fitted to the best needs of the citizens of today and tomorrow.

It has been unfortunately true, until recently, that the school curriculum has tended to ignore many of the significant activities of life. Rather has the school curriculum been thought of as compartments of subject matter which, when mastered, would enable one to perform the activities needed. The results of this assumption are manifest from the fact that the school makes little or no provision for many things that people do and, on the contrary, teaches many things which one rarely or never uses.

Consequently, if the school is to offer directed training and is to impart the facts, skills, and appreciations that require formal teaching—activities by their nature best taught by the school—it should ascertain by analysis exactly what the particularized activities are.

It is evident in a democracy such as ours that a considerable proportion of a person's activities deal with his relationships as a citizen. This chapter summarizes studies that give curriculum makers considerable evidence concerning the activities and modes of living of citizens.

[1]Adapted from Briggs, *Op. cit.*, p. 157.

CRITERION 1—THE MAJOR CLASSES OF READING ACTIVITIES PERTAINING TO CITIZENSHIP

Study 22

Bobbitt[2] has recently published a monograph that presents data from several investigations of the major categories of human activities. The assumption upon which these studies rests is that analysis of reading materials will reveal broad categories which indicate "what man is thinking about, what he is dealing with, and what activities he is performing." In other words, these studies assume that language reflects the major activities of human endeavor.

For periodical literature the latest three-year cumulative volume of the *Reader's Guide to Periodical Literature,* covering the years, 1919-1921, was analyzed; for newspapers the index of the *New York Times,* covering the nine months from April through December, 1924, was used; for encyclopedia evidence a random sample of 7370 pages of the *Encyclopedia Britannica* was taken. In the analysis of materials of the above sources no preconceived classification was used; the classification in each study grew out of an attempt to put together those things that seemed to belong together.

Because of space limitations and because the detailed tables are available in published form, the three main tables in Bobbitt's investigation have been combined in one table which appears herewith as Table 42. (See pp. 71-72.)

One should note first that these three sources tend to represent a variety of "seasoned" judgments concerning what man does, deals with, and thinks about. Newspapers published under pressure are not so reflective as are magazines; and, in turn, magazines are not so reflective as are articles in encyclopedias. Evidence from one source may

---

[2]Bobbitt, Franklin, *Curriculum Investigations,* Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 31, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1926, (Three studies are combined in this summary for comparative purposes); they deal respectively with Major Fields of Human Concern—Chapter II, "The Evidence from Periodical Literature"; Chapter III, "The Evidence from Newspapers"; and Chapter IV, "The Evidence from Encyclopedias."

TABLE XLII

THE COMBINED RANKS OF THE MAJOR CATEGORIES OF MAN'S ACTIVITIES, IN TERMS OF SPACE ALLOTTED EACH IN THREE SOURCES (BOBBITT)

Major Classes of Man's Activities	Periodicals	Newspapers	Encyclopedia Articles
Government	1	1	3[1] and 14[2]
Nations and states (polit. and econ.)	2	2	—
Education	3	11	29
Transportation and travel	4	3	30
Intellectual vision	5	5	—
Geographical	6	—	1
Buildings	17	16	18
Health, sanitation and disease	8	10	9
Food	9	25	32
Labor	10	14	—
Religion	11	13	4
Play, sports, games	12	4	20
Animal world	13	21	5
Commerce	14	6	13
Agriculture	15	28	—
Finance	16	7	—
Matter, substances, chemistry	17	32	6
Family	18	19	33
Music	19	31	31
Races, people	20	29	24
Manufacturing	21	26	—
Plant world	22	35	11
Art	23	22	16
Occupations	24	—	19
Communication	25	12	39[3]
Human association	26	23	12
Heat, fuel	27	27	42
Clothing, textiles	28	—	—
Electricity	29	33	17
Philanthropy	30	24	34
Mining	31	37	—
Light, color	32	42	41
Culture, levels and types	33	—	—
Property	34	15	38
Psychology	35	36	43
Population	36	17	—
Petroleum and products	37	18	—
General business arrangement and man	38	—	—
Biological	39	41	23
Astronomical	40	39	45
Power	41	—	45
Mechanics (Physics)	42	—	28
Decoration	43	38	36
Cleaning	44	—	—
Time	45	—	46
Mathematics	46	43	21
Crime	—	8	—
Accidents	—	9	—

[1]Government includes law, military and international.
[2]Government does not include law, military and international.
[3]Not including language.

TABLE XLII (Continued)

THE COMBINED RANKS OF THE MAJOR CATEGORIES OF MAN'S ACTIVITIES, IN TERMS OF SPACE ALLOTTED EACH IN THREE SOURCES (BOBBITT)

Major Classes of Man's Activities	Periodicals	Newspapers	Encyclopedia Articles
Climatic matters	—	37	—
Personal service	—	40	—
Machinery, tools	—	44	22
Clerical service	—	45	—
Sound	—	46	48
Biographies of persons	—	—	2
Law	—	—	7
Earth science	—	—	8
Literature	—	—	10
Military	—	—	15
Language	—	—	26
Theater	—	—	27
Mythical matters	—	—	35
Philosophy	—	—	37
International adjustment	—	—	40
Aeronautics	—	—	44
Stages of civilization	—	—	47

be "chance"; evidence from two or three sources tends to eliminate this element.

The surprising thing one notes when the main categories of these three classifications are combined is their relative agreement; particularly when it is recalled that no preconceived classification was used. Twenty-eight elements —nearly half—are found to be common to the three sources; a preponderant majority to at least two of these sources. The next important thing to note is the agreement in relative rank of these major topics. While we are not exactly certain of the validity of frequency rank yet, it is significant that on varying criteria some half dozen elements rank within five places on all three elements and twelve within ten places on three elements; also that nearly half of the elements rank within five places on two of the three sources.

The fact that a topic is low in the relative rankings, judged by the amount of space given it, is not necessarily evidence of a lack of importance: (1) It may be a small

field and hence not receive much space; (2) it may be possible to summarize it in more concise form; (3) it may be too technical for the general reader; or (4) it may be a new field and relatively undeveloped.

The significant thing is that analyses of what man is thinking about, dealing with, and doing, as revealed in written records of his activities, indicate that while there are possible duplications and overlappings in any classification, in general man deals with a much greater variety of things than has hitherto been supposed. As Bobbitt says, these investigations are but preliminary. Two important supplementary steps are demanded in the judgment of the present writer: (1) Similar samplings over a range of years—say every five years back to 1890 to obtain a measure of persistency; and (2) a particularization within each major class of the rather specific activities pertaining to government, transportation, intellectual vision, and the like.

Study 23

A study by Wells[3] further explored Bobbitt's assumption that the activities of major concern are reflected in newspapers and periodicals. The following sources were used: (1) Newspapers representing ten different sections of the country, published between December 21, 1923, and February 15, 1925 (105 issues in all); (2) *The Reader's Guide to Periodical Literature,* 1924; and (3) *The New York Times Index,* 1924. (See Table 43, p. 74.)

As in Table 42 one obtains major classes of activities about which citizens in a democracy should be informed. The agreement in rank on the three criteria is even more marked than in Study 22. Tables 42 and 43 give one relatively objective evidence of major activities most likely to be stressed in the reading activities of citizens.

---

[3]Wells, C. O., *The Political Science of Everyday Life, as Revealed by Analysis of Newspapers and Periodicals,* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

TABLE XLIII

RANK OF ACTIVITIES ACCORDING TO THE PER CENT OF FREQUENCIES FOUND IN THE *New York Times Index* AND *The Readers' Guide*, COMPARED WITH THE RANK OF THE ACTIVITIES ACCORDING TO THE PER CENT OF SPACE FOUND IN 105 NEWSPAPERS (WELLS)

Activity	Column 'Space in 105 Newspapers	Frequencies in New York Times	Frequencies in Readers' Guide
1. Finance	1	1	1
2. Defense	6	2	4
3. Foreign affairs	5	5	3
4. Office, public	4	4	9
5. Legislation	2	3	14
6. Commerce	7	7	6
7. Labor	8	8	5
8. Education	11	11	2
9. Justice	3	6	17
10. Industry	9	13	7
11. Political parties	10	12	13
12. Social improvements	15	10	12
13. Natural resources	12	16	10
14. Moral reform	17	15	8
15. Prices	13	9	20
16. Civic participation	14	17	16
17. Postal service	18	23	23
18. Immigration	29	14	11
19. Works, public	19	19	17
20. Pensions	20	17	22
21. Suffrage	23	22	19
22. Public utilities	16	24	26
23. Inspection, civic	24	21	24
24. Constitution	28	26	15
25. Monetary	22	20	28
26. Territories	26	25	20
27. Publicity	25	29	25
28. Corporations	30	21	29
29. Science	27	27	27
30. Public opinion	21	30	30
31. Monopoly	31	28	32
32. Personal rights	32	32	31

Study 24

A study by Palmer[4] provides evidence concerning two supplementary steps noted concerning the data in Bobbitt's three studies combined in Table 42: (1) Sampling to obtain a measure of persistency; and (2) particularization within each major class of activities. *The Literary Digest* was chosen because:

[4]Palmer, P. L., (Interpretation of Bobbitt, Franklin, *Curriculum Investigations*, Chapter VI), "The Evidence from the *Literary Digest*," Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 31.

"For thirty-six years the *Literary Digest* has been going each week to that vast mirror of human interests and activities, the newspaper and periodical press, and selecting and presenting what appear to be the outstanding items. It is, so to speak, the larger mirror reduced to one of workable size. In its several departments there has been an attempt at catholicity in presenting the varied aspects of human affairs.

"With a view to obtaining quantitative evidence as to the things which enter into man's interests and affairs, all the issues of the *Literary Digest* for the past twenty-five years and a random sampling of the issues for the ten years previous to 1900 were analyzed and the topics tabulated. In each case only the major topic of each article was used, the topic being classified in only one place in the tabulation.

TABLE XLIV

MAJOR CLASSES OF ACTIVITIES TREATED IN THE *Literary Digest* (PALMER)

Topic	Frequency	Per Cent
1. Literature, language, and fine arts	4,079	9.6
2. Foreign government and international diplomacy	4,039	9.5
3. Religion and philosophy	3,719	8.8
4. War and the control of war	3,547	8.4
5. Personals	3,493	8.3
6. United States politics and government	3,462	8.2
7. Business, commerce, industry, and agriculture	2,985	7.1
8. Communication and transportation	2,268	5.4
9. Family and community social welfare, law and order	2,248	5.3
10. Health	1,761	4.2
11. Development and conservation of resources	1,641	3.9
12. Mechanics, invention, and engineering	1,202	2.8
13. Animal and plant life	1,090	2.6
14. The physical sciences	1,078	2.5
15. Intimate group glimpses of humanity	946	2.2
16. Capital and labor	854	2.0
17. Population migrations and racial relations	825	2.0
18. The science of man (not including health)	804	1.9
19. Sports, travel, and exploration	803	1.9
20. Physical safety	781	1.8
21. Education	681	1.6
Total	42,308	100.00

"A major reason for analyzing this single periodical for an entire generation was to eliminate the element of transiency of interests. We sought to discover the things that are of relatively permanent interest. A matter that stands out through an entire period of this length, especially during an era of such profound social changes, is practically certain to be one of the things of mankind's permanent concern."[5]

TABLE XLV

SAMPLE OF PARTICULARIZED ITEMS OF ONE MAJOR CLASS OF ACTIVITIES AND PERSISTENCY INDEX OF EACH ITEM (PALMER)

Topic	Frequency	Per Cent	Persistency Index
United States politics and government:			
1. The presidency and national-party politics	651	18.8	1.000
2. Regulation of trusts and monopolies	440	12.7	1.000
3. Tariff and free trade	227	6.5	.972
4. Corruption in public office	215	6.2	.944
5. Government currency, banking, budget reform, and business efficiency	200	5.8	.944
6. State politics and government	193	5.5	.889
7. Public taxation	186	5.4	.861
8. Monroe Doctrine, League of Nations, and foreign alliances	155	4.5	.917
9. Island administration in the West Indies and the Caribbean Sea	155	3.3	.944
10. The judiciary and justice	106	3.1	.917
11. Woman suffrage	106	3.1	.972
12. Congressional activity and efficiency	106	3.1	1.000
13. Philippine Island administration	80	2.3	.667
14. Ship subsidies and merchant marine	76	2.2	.750
15. City politics and government	69	2.0	.861
16. The President's cabinet	68	2.0	.917
17. The postal service	61	1.7	.667
18. Political radicalism, anarchy, and freedom of speech	60	1.7	.639
19. Diplomatic and consular service	57	1.6	.778
20. Socialism	51	1.5	.778
21. Campaign expenditures	38	1.1	.444
22. Suffrage exercise and regulation	37	1.1	.444
23. Labor in politics	36	1.0	.472
24. Civil service and political patronage	35	1.0	.722
25. City finance	22	0.6	.750
26. Miscellaneous	72	2.1	----
Total	3,462	100.0	----

[5]Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, p. 40.

Table 44 (p. 75) shows the major classes of topics found in a sampling of this chief "mirror" of men's activities for 36 years, and Table 45, p. 76 presents evidence of particularized activities and persistency on one major topic (see Bobbit, *Op. cit.*, pp. 45-53, for complete tables on both these points.)

While the particularized items presented in detail in Bobbitt are numerous, the persistency indices show that very few of them are sporadic; 89 per cent of 316 different topics were discussed at some time during each of at least one-half of the 36 years analyzed. Only 1 per cent of the topics were discussed so infrequently as to appear in only one-fifth of the years or less. When these few topics are examined, however, it is found that many of them appear to be not matters of sporadic character but rather new things which have risen on the horizon and which are practically certain to persist. It is probable that at least 97 per cent of the 316 topics should find places in the modern curriculum.[6]

CRITERION 2—DUTIES AND DIFFICULTIES OF CITIZENSHIP

Study 25

Mahan[7] attempted to discover the duties and difficulties of citizenship by interviewing 80 "lay" citizens in one community—Greeley, Colorado. No new duties or difficulties were obtained after 80 citizens were interviewed; the "saturation" point was thus evident. A total of 68 duties and 70 difficulties were mentioned. Space permits us to list but ten of each type. (See Table 46, p. 78.)

Study 26

Dulebohn[8] attempted to discover civic and social deficiencies by analyzing editorials in periodicals. To obtain

---

[6]Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, p. 44. (Apparently over half of the major categories and the detailed items pertain to the social sciences.)

[7]Mahan, T. J., *Duties, Difficulties and Qualities of Citizens*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colo., 1925, (Professor Mahan is investigating this problem in greater detail; the results will be published soon as a doctor's dissertation.)

[8]Dulebohn, I. H., *Civic and Social Deficiencies as Indications of Citizenship Objectives*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

TABLE XLVI

THE TEN MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED CIVIC DUTIES, DIFFICULTIES, AND QUALITIES CITED BY 80 PERSONS INTERVIEWED (MAHAN)

Duties	Frequency of Mention	Difficulties	Frequency of Mention	Qualities	Frequency of Mention
1. Civic service	33	1. Lack of reliable information	11	1. Honesty	22
2. To vote	1	2. Attitude of irresponsibility	7	2. Education	13
3. To obey laws	16	3. Corrupt politics	7	3. Unselfishness	12
4. To serve	13	4. Lack of proper education	7	4. Tolerance	10
5. To be social	13	5. Lack of time for citizenship duties	7	5. Law abiding	9
6. Participate in politics	12	6. Burden of petty laws	7	6. Industrious	8
7. Assume responsibility	11	7. Being misunderstood	6	7. Civic pride	7
8. Promote education	10	8. Dishonesty	6	8. Right attitude toward fellowmen	7
9. Earn honest living	10	9. Lack of proper training	6	9. Broadminded	7
10. Train children properly	10	10. Lack of interest in civic affairs	6	10. Service	6

a *national* sampling, odd issues of nine newspapers from different sections of the country were analyzed for three months, December 1, 1924, to March 1, 1925. To obtain a measure of persistency, four Chicago newspapers were analyzed for four years, January 1, 1921, to January 1, 1925. To obtain more "seasoned" editorials six magazines were analyzed for the years 1921 to 1924, inclusive.

TABLE XLVII

CLASSES OF CIVIC AND SOCIAL DEFICIENCIES (DULEBOHN)

Classes of civic and social deficiencies	Frequencies	
	Paragraphs	Articles
Deficiencies of the private citizen	5413	2529
Deficiencies of various governmental groups	2440	1263
Deficiencies of certain civic and social groups and organizations	1722	792
Deficiencies of officials	1662	769
Totals	11237	5353

Tables 47 and 48 show: (1) All classes of civic and social deficiencies; and (2) general classes of deficiencies of the private citizen. (See pp. 78-79.)

TABLE XLVIII

GENERAL CLASSIFICATION OF DEFICIENCIES OF THE PRIVATE CITIZEN (DULEBOHN)

General Classes of Deficiencies of Private Citizens	Frequencies	
	Paragraphs	Articles
Deficiencies involving the citizen's governmental duties	1798	905
Deficiencies pertaining to public morals and ethics	1433	648
Commonly recognized crimes against society	975	417
Deficiencies pertaining to personal habits	778	342
Deficiencies pertaining to public health and safety	429	217
Totals	5413	2529

Because tables giving in detail[9] the deficiencies of each class are published by Bobbitt, but one type—deficiencies in the performance of cooperative governmental functions is presented here for illustrative purposes. (See p. 80.)

Commenting on his findings, the investigator writes, "People apparently do not understand and appreciate the broader implications of citizenship. The most serious deficiencies, nearly one half, lie in the unspecialized duties of the lay citizen."

Study 27

Nietz[10] attempted to list the duties of good citizens by relying upon an analysis of public opinion as represented by leaders of current thought taken from: (1) The editorials of 168 issues of seven leading newspapers covering a period of four years; (2) a total of 55 special articles on citizenship published in 18 leading magazines and bulletins during a period of five years; and (3) interviews with 111 leaders of thought, mostly in Chicago, between April and June, 1925. An effort was made in all three sources to sample different shades of public opinion.

[9]See Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, pp. 71-85.
[10]Nietz, J. A., "Duties and Traits of a Good Citizen" (Interpretation by Bobbitt, Franklin), *Curriculum Investigations, Op. cit.*

TABLE XLIX

DEFICIENCIES IN THE PERFORMANCE OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNMENTAL FUNCTIONS (DULEBOHN)

Deficiencies	Frequencies	
	Paragraphs	Articles
Making unwarranted criticisms	256	112
Using political power to influence government officials	180	93
Allowing religious, political, or sectional prejudice to interfere with performance of duty	135	54
Failure to keep informed on civic and social problems	129	43
Pursuing or advocating radical policies	120	87
Failure to participate in movements for public welfare	101	49
Use of propaganda for selfish purposes	88	53
Making statements likely to incite war	78	38
Opposing necessary reforms because they affect one's private business detrimentally	72	34
Advocating pacifism	59	28
Failure to vote intelligently	59	28
Advocating militarism	54	20
Lobbying to secure legislative favors	51	29
Contempt for law	50	22
Making extravagant campaign promises	49	30
Failure to keep informed on governmental affairs	36	27
Disloyalty to government	32	10
Failure to vote	31	15
Evading payment of taxes	28	17
Tolerating crime	27	16
Buying and selling votes	24	10
Holding idea it is not wrong to steal from government	23	13
Excusing criminals through sentimentality	22	8
Failure to keep informed on European affairs	16	10
Failure to keep informed on public-health matters	19	15
Extravagance in campaign expenses	16	9
Wasting natural resources of nation	16	6
Failure to keep informed on economic problems	14	14
Refusing to serve on the jury	7	3
Tolerating corrupt officials	6	4
Total	1798	897

A total of 8541 statements were obtained. These have been classified into 12 main divisions, 39 subdivisions, and 1234 specific types of duties. Table 50 gives the main classes and frequencies, with the particularized items for class I-A.[11] (See pp. 81-82.)

[11]See Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, pp. 57-68, for detailed table.

TABLE L

CIVIC TRAITS AND ACTIVITIES (NIETZ)

		Frequency
I.	Political and civic duties and habits	1309
	A. Performance of civic duties	466
	1. Develop personal and civic responsibility and dependability	57
	2. Be willing to hold office for public good	52
	3. Be active in civic matters	36
	4. Develop everyday citizenship	27
	5. Help keep your town a good town in which to live	25
	6. Be interested in community affairs	21
	7. Get intelligent understanding on public questions	20
	8. Feel your power and duty as a citizen	19
	9. Love and serve your country	17
	10. Willingly and honestly pay taxes	16
	11. Help train voters for their responsibility	15
	12. Participate in good group action for public good	13
	13. Train experts for office-holding	12
	14. Help train intelligent leaders	11
	15. Respect and be responsible for public property	11
	16. Serve the public interest	11
	17. Develop a civic and public conscience	11
	18. Be willing to serve on the jury	11
	B. Performance of suffrage duties	444
	C. General helpfulness	262
	D. Corrective duties	137
II.	Basic personal traits and habits	1207
	A. Individual qualities and traits	594
	B. Personal habits and qualities in relation to others	396
	C. Domestic and vocational efficiency	217
III.	Appreciation of the worth of our social and political heritage	844
	A. Appreciation of our heritage	413
	B. Protection of our liberty	298
	C. Protection of our government and country	133
IV.	Recreation and health	644
	A. Cultivation of proper health habits	270
	B. Provisions for recreational facilities	216
	C. Creation of proper health conditions	178
V.	Disposition to depend on orderly methods in the attainment of our ends	594
	A. Obedience to, and respect for, existing laws and order	326
	B. Public opinion in relation to orderly methods	228
	C. Means of developing greater respect for law and order	40
VI.	Information about the more important present-day problems	571
	A. Economic problems	205
	B. General facts	144
	C. Governmental problems	131
	D. Social problems	91

TABLE L (Continued)

		Frequency
VII.	Attitudes and habits of good citizen holding a position of public trust	510
	A. Attitude of trust and efficiency	256
	B. Enforcement of the laws	106
	C. Welfare of the public	48
	D. Cooperation and coordination on the part of officials and departments of the government	44
VIII.	Industrial relations	488
	A. Means for the improvement of industrial relations	253
	B. Duties of capital	143
	C. Duties of labor	92
IX	Attitudes toward public and civic questions	441
	A. The support of public improvements and institutions	206
	B. Progressive laws and ordinances	144
	C. Progressive attitudes	91
X.	A large-group social consciousness	398
	A. Social consciousness in general	270
	B. International social consciousness	128
XI.	International relationships	391
	A. International agreement and cooperation	200
	B. International problems	155
	C. General international relations	36
XII.	Citizenship abilities. Methods, means, and agencies for the training of citizenship	1124
	A. Means of developing citizenship	556
	B. Leadership in citizenship training	259
	C. Development of citizenship through activities	254
	D. Provision for student self-government	55

"It is obvious that efficient citizenship is a matter of innumerable details and of great complexity. It is believed that even this preliminary analysis of public opinion, as represented by the leaders, can be of service to the curriculum-maker in setting up *tentative* objectives of civic education for use until later researches have achieved further steps toward scientific finality."[12]

CRITERION 3—INTROSPECTIVE ANALYSES OF CITIZENSHIP

Study 28

A chapter by Bobbitt[13] in his *How to Make a Curriculum* attempts to set forth the abilities involved in the things

[12]Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, p. 56.
[13]Bobbitt, Franklin, *How to Make a Curriculum*, Chapter VII, "The Social Studies," Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1924. See for his first philosophy of citizenship, Bobbitt, Franklin, *The Curriculum*, Chapters XI and XII, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1918.

that citizens do. Bobbitt says a good citizen "is one who can perform the fifty, the five hundred, or the five thousand things which the good citizen is called upon by his social position to perform." His problem was to discover what are the things that a citizen has to do in terms of the abilities that we should be conscious of for the efficient performance of these citizenship duties.

His method used in solving the problem of theoretical "abilities" has "grown up gradually through twelve years of cooperative effort on the part of some fifteen hundred members of graduate classes in 'The Curriculum' conducted by the writer at the University of Chicago." It has since been used, after critical examination of 1200 high school teachers, as a basis for determining the objectives in the Junior and Senior High School Departments in Los Angeles, California. It represents, then, the group judgment of nearly 3000 rather experienced people plus the judgment of one of our foremost students in the curriculum.

Professor Bobbitt lists many of the detailed abilities that are involved in the social studies—the pre-eminent studies having to do with the training of citizens. (See following table.)

TABLE LI

A Few Illustrations of Bobbitt's Citizenship "Abilities" (Bobbitt)

"Ability to think, feel, act, and react as an efficient, intelligent, sympathetic, and loyal member of the large social group—that group that is prior to differentiation and within which social differentiation occurs. Large-group or citizenship consciousness. Sense of membership in the total social group, rather than in some special class. Large-group local consciousness when dealing with local problems; large-group state consciousness when dealing with state responsibilities; large-group national consciousness when dealing with national matters; large-group world-consciousness when dealing with mankind's responsibilities for world cooperation and management.

"The ability of the citizen to do his individual share in performing those social functions for which all citizens are equally responsible in the establishment, organization, maintenance, protection, oversight, and control of the specialized groups and agencies into which society is differentiated for effectiveness of action. The young citizen-in-training is to acquire those abilities which, when adulthood is reached,

will enable him to perform the following things in connection with the specialized social agencies:

"(a) Sharing fully in an informed and impelling public opinion, which looks to the general welfare in its control of each service agency.

"(b) Setting up in public opinion and maintaining the standards of results to be achieved by each service agency.

"(c) Seeing that each service agency aims at the standards of results that are sanctioned by public opinion.

"(d) Seeing that the service agency employs procedures which are effective in producing the desired results and which are economical in social costs.

"(e) Seeing that the material working conditions necessary for the most effective and economical procedures are supplied.

"(f) Seeing that each service agency is provided with personnel and organization of the kind required by the procedures to be employed; and properly rewarded.

"(g) Directly or indirectly selecting or approving the selection of the personnel of the agency.

"(h) Supplying the funds necessary for the efficient and in all ways proper conduct of the agency.

"(i) Currently or periodically examining, directly or through publicity reports, or both, into the results achieved by the agency, and the degree of economy employed.

"(j) Where results achieved and degree of economy employed comply with standards of expectation, approving and properly rewarding the labors of those who have thus given good service.

"(k) Where results do not reach the standards of expectation, or where there has been waste, finding the causes of deficiency, and removing them as expeditiously as practicable.

"Ability to organize and use social facts effectively in arriving at conclusions.

"The ability to use general principles in analyzing and considering economic, political, and other social problems.

"Ability to discern one's individual rights in the quantity of one's services to the general group. Ability to read one's rights as things earned."

Besides these "abilities" Bobbitt lists in detail the general principles and assumptions of the activities involved in the training of citizenship.[14]

Study 29

Snedden[15] likewise attempts to particularize the abilities and activities of citizens by introspective analyses but with the significant difference that he attempts to list deficiencies for particular *case groups* such as: (1) "Owning-farmers"; (2) girls of a poor environment; (3) children

[14]See Chapter VII, *Op. cit.*, for his detailed discussion.

[15]Snedden, David, *Civic Education*, World Book Company, Yonkers-on-Hudson, N. Y., 1922.

of Russian-Jewish immigrants, especially ages 12-14; and (4) boys from high grade environment, and the like.

Space permits of but a very condensed illustration of the suggested analyses of one case group.[16]

CASE GROUP—"OWNING-FARMERS" (SNEDDEN)

1. *Group*: Sons (12-14 years of age) of farmers owning and operating their own farms in the North Central States.

2. *Diagnosis*: (1) Social and economic background—average substantial farming class; (2) above average in native qualities—physical, intellectual, and moral; (3) schooling not rated as of high importance; (4) social experiences largely restricted to immediate neighborhood; and (5) social and recreational experiences meager.

3. *Dominant characteristics*: (1) Physically healthy; (2) interested in farming and expect to be farmers; and (3) little interest in school.

4. *Prognosis, general*: (1) Major interests will be vocational (farming); (2) thrifty; and (3) little time for politics and recreation.

5. *Prognosis, civic*: Given no civic education greatly differing from conventional civics now taught, most of these boys will become "good, conforming" citizens ("respectability" almost a religious virtue). Limited in general education and specific civic education adapted to their needs, they will, in general, have but vague feelings of political and social needs—will tend "to give vent to their feelings through grumbling rather than through study and action."

6. *Civic deficiencies, at ages 30-60*: (1) Lack of adequate scientific knowledge of the social sciences to guide in right civic policies; (2) lack of effective sympathetic appreciation of conditions and aspirations of other economic classes; (3) lack of understanding of effective methods for achiev-

[16]Adapted from Snedden, David, *Op. cit.*, pp. 279-284. The entire book should be studied.

ing desired political changes or reforms through present civic organizations; and (4) lack of training in simpler processes for group expression of needs and desires.

7. *Proposed specific objectives*: (1) "To furnish sufficient knowledge of purposes, forms, and functions of government and closely related factors which will enlarge certain social appreciations and aid in establishing ideals"; (2) "To furnish training in analyzing economic and social factors that relate directly and indirectly to the welfare of rural life"; and (3) "To furnish available means for producing political or economic changes and to furnish so far as possible both vicarious and direct training therein."[17]

Both of these studies illustrate the contribution that keen students of education can make even subjectively by their suggestions concerning educational theory and practice, deficiencies to be encountered and proposed civic needs based upon a critical evaluation of the problem of contemporary citizenship.

CRITERION 4—SPECIAL TYPES OF CIVIC TRAINING DEMANDED OF LAY CITIZENS

Study 30

Alderman[18] sought to determine the legal activities with which a citizen should be familiar. A study was made of causes of litigation as filed in petitions of the office of the County Clerk, Johnson County, Iowa, for the years 1907, 1908, and 1909. This was done on the hypothesis that if one could examine the causes which bring the layman in contact with the courts and the law, one could determine what knowledge a layman should have about the courts and law.

Table 52 shows the number of types of action involving 758 cases which were brought into the District Court within this period of three years. (See p. 87.)

[17]The analysis further points out the factors conditioning the problem of civic education for this group: (1) Poorly trained teachers; (2) inadequate school facilities; (3) courses of study poorly adapted to rural life; and (4) problems of methods.

[18]Alderman, G. H., "What the Iowa Layman Should Know About Courts and Law," *The School Review*, Vol. 30, pp. 360-364 (May, 1922).

These court cases were classified, and 50.3 per cent of all cases had to do with contracts, particularly such as promissory notes, implied contracts, oral contracts, mortgages, leases, wills, etc.; 44.8 per cent with court writs involving such topics as quieting titles, writ of attachment, decree of divorce, writ of injunction, and estates; and 4.8 per cent had to do with damage claims such as slander, assault and battery, trespass, etc. We find that laymen should understand the general principles involving written contracts, quieting titles, divorce, damage cases, implied contracts, oral contracts, settling estates, and court writs.

TABLE LII

TYPES OF LITIGATION IN JOHNSON COUNTY, IOWA, FOR 1907-1909 (ALDERMAN)

Types of Court Cases	Number
Written contracts	199
Quieting titles	190
Divorce cases	79
Damage cases	65
Implied contracts	50
Oral contracts	46
Suing for an undivided interest in an estate	34
Injunction	30
Writs not otherwise mentioned	11
Garnishments	10
Cases asking for writs of replevin	8
Attempt to break or set aside wills	8
Slander	7
Writs of attachment	3
Appeal from boards of review or council on assessment	3
Habeas corpus	3
Naturalization	2
Partnership cases	2
Bastardy	1
Tax case	1
Appeal bond	1
Alimony	1
Contempt of court	1
Deeds	1
Assault and battery	1
To incorporate a town	1
Total	758

Study 31

Goss[19] attempted to determine what civic knowledge is most needed by the child in his life outside of the school, or to discover the types of transactions in life outside the school which require civic knowledge.

Problems involving civics with which the average individual in life is actually confronted were obtained by asking several classes in certain public schools to collect and bring to school a record of any such transactions that any members of the family had had during the day. An outline of instructions for collecting such data was prepared for the pupils. A list of some twenty typical ways in which civic knowledge might be required was suggested in the instructions, such as recording a deed, taking out naturalization papers, taking up a matter with a Congressman, etc. Eighteen classes in civics in nine different schools in Jackson County, Indiana, cooperated.

The answers received were analyzed and classified under the major heads of conventional civics material, that is, material having to do with the following divisions: national, state, municipal, county, and township government.

The type and frequency of civic transactions in life outside of school classified under national, state, municipal, county, and township government were as follows:

TYPE OF CIVIC TRANSACTIONS

National		State	
War Savings Stamps	100	Insurance	74
Income Tax	40	Auto License	34
Pension	34	Organization of Corporation	30
Civil Service Examination	30	Wrote to State Representative	26
Naturalization Papers	30	Election	12
Election	20	Transaction with Governor	6
Recorded Copyright	8	Business with State Supt.	6
Liberty Loans	6	Matter with State Officer	4
Army	6	Administratorship	4
Crop Report	2	Wrote to State Senator	2
Timber Report	2	Fire Marshal	2
Census Report	2	Examined Tax Law	2
Red Cross	2		
Total	282	Total	204

[19]Goss, R. R., *What Civic Knowledge is Needed by an Indiana Layman*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Indiana, Bloomington, Ind., 1923.

TYPE OF CIVIC TRANSACTIONS (Continued)

Municipal	
Health	118
Bank	78
Election	72
Charity	68
Beautifying City	66
Notary Work	60
Police Protection	58
Improvement of Property	54
Transaction with Council	42
Taxes	32
Fire Department	15
Property Sale	8
Court	6
Lawyer	4
Will	3
Building and Loan	2
Dog License	2
Moving Permit	2
Total	690

Township	
Transactions with Trustees	100
Bank	68
Notary Work	24
Justice of Peace	10
Farmers Federation	10
Taxes as Related to Assessor	8
Assessment of Property	6
Made a Note	6
Bought Bonds	4
School Enumeration	2
Election	2
Will	2
Total	242

County	
Deed Recorded	100
Business with County Supt.	60
Matter with Court	34
Mortgage	32
Taxes	26
Matter with Clerk	24
Matter with County Officer	22
Business with Truant Officer	8
County Surveyor	8
Election	6
County Treasurer	4
Assessed by Assessor	4
Examine Deed	4
Business with Road Supt.	4
Estate Settled	2
Insured Property	2
County Coroner	2
County Judges	2
Lien Notes	2
Contracts	2
Total	348

Transactions of a local nature are apparently the ones with which the average layman should be most familiar. For example, nearly three-fourths of the transactions reported by citizens have to do with local matters such as the aspects of city, county, or township affairs.

While this study is limited to some 300 pupils in a few schools in one county, it does give one some evidence of specific situations of civic knowledge needed by the layman. It is but another means of finding out how the layman uses social science.

Obviously, these methods should be employed over a large territory. With such results, writers of school courses in

social science could well consider revision of their materials in terms of the obvious need of training and knowledge having to do with local government.

Study 32

The problem studied by Harap[20] was to canvass activities of an economic nature in which the American people engage and ought to engage—the essential habits, skills, knowledge, and attitudes involved in certain economic aspects of life, particularly having to do with the citizen's needs at home.

Information was gathered concerning important household needs. An effort was made to discover what is wrong with the habits of selection and purchase of household articles. Census reports, and various reports summarized in trade journals, were used as well as an analysis undertaken by the United States Department of Labor of the selection and purchases involved in a nation-wide survey of 10,000 families of the most important household articles. Other research concerning home activities was utilized. Thus, the scientific data concerning standards for home activities and the ascertained deficiencies were collected and studied.

Harap found a great discrepancy between the economic habits and information that citizens ought to possess about household matters and that citizens possess.

Illustrations of the quantitative data follow.

TABLE LIII

THE KINDS OF TOPICS CONCERNING WHICH HARAP COLLECTED QUANTITATIVE DATA (HARAP)

FOOD CONSUMPTION
The chief foods of the nation
Food selection based upon quantity consumed
Food selection based upon the amount of money spent for chief food commodities
Food selection to meet the daily energy requirement
Selection of food to furnish the requirements of proteins, fats, and mineral salts

[20]Harap, Henry, *Education of the Consumer*, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1924.

TABLE LIII (Continued)

The buying of food:
- In large quantities
- In packages
- For cash or on credit

Waste in the use of food

Housing

The housing conditions of the nation as revealed by surveys
Housing standards
Home ownership
Tenements and education
Overcrowding
Rent and education:
- Rent and income
- What is fair rental
- Rent and taxes
- Rent and the budget

Ventilation

Household Materials

The chief household commodities
Building materials
Furniture
Paint and varnish
Metal products, tools, and hardware
Paper products
Leather goods
Floor coverings
Cleansing and polishing preparations
Brushes and brooms
Phonographs
Automobiles

Household Skills

How household skills were determined
Household skills discovered in surveys
Skills suggested by the chief commodities consumed in the home
Skills having to do with:
- Carpentry
- Painting
- Plastering
- Glazing
- Plumbing
- Housecleaning
- Decoration
- Gardening

Fuel Consumption

The chief household fuels and their comparative importance
Relative cost of fuels
Relative heating values
Fuel measurement and calculation

Clothing

Comparison of the actual with standard consumption of clothing by people of the United States.
Clothing in the budget

These topics illustrate the types of economic data that Harap gathered. In the main there were two main classes of material that he utilized: first, standards of what we ought to know and do about consumer's needs; and second, scientific studies of what we actually do know and do concerning these same needs. In brief, he implies that the curriculum will consider specifically in each instance the economic habits and information that will permit the school to move pupils from ascertained deficiencies up to ascertained standards, in so far as the abilities of pupils will permit.

Tables 54 and 55 (pp. 92-93) are illustrations of the discrepancy between what people eat and what people should eat.

It should be noted that the cheapest vegetable having the greatest food value—spinach—ranks next to last in the actual consumption and that peas and beans, that rank second and third in food value, rank eleventh and twelfth in consumption. On the other hand, potatoes rank first

TABLE LIV

THE RELATION OF THE QUANTITY OF VEGETABLES CONSUMED TO THE FOOD VALUE AND THE PRICE (HARAP)

	Value of Products Thousand Dollars	Rank	Composite Food Value	Rank	Price per Pound (cents)	Rank
Potatoes	639,441	1	414	4	4.0	2
Sweet potatoes	124,844	2	374	5	8.0	6
Tomatoes	38,675	3	192	11		
Cabbage	21,848	4	367	7	5.0	3
Onions (dry)	21,387	5	295		6.0	4
Cantaloupes	10,767	6				
Watermelons	10,466	7				
Celery	9,462	8	350	7	15.0	10
Cucumbers	8,579	9	153	12		
Lettuce	8,535	10	299	10	7.0	5
Beans (green)	8,031	11	472	3	10.0	8
Peas (green)	7,165	12	475	2	10.0	9
Asparagus	5,102	13	368	6		
Peppers (green)	3,079	14				
Spinach	1,716	15	810	1	3.3	1
Carrots	1,563	16	338	9	8.0	7

Value of products taken from the United States Census Reports, food value from *Adequacy and Economy of Some City Dietaries*, page 25, by Sherman, H. C. and Gillett, L. H.

in consumption, fourth in food value, and second in cheapness.

It should be noted that apples rank first in consumption but twelfth in food value, and that figs which rank first in food value, and dates which rank second, are respectively twelfth and thirteenth in consumption: i.e., the most worthwhile fruits from the point of view of food value are very much *under-consumed.*

In a similar way Harap shows other violations of what scientific dietary studies indicate that we should eat. For example, there is a marked under-consumption of vegetables and a marked over-consumption of meat.

One of the most valuable things about this study is that out of it arises definite, specific objectives in terms of scientific evidence that Harap has collected.

Space will not permit the reproduction of further tables. However, the reader is referred to the detailed tables and particularly to the detailed lists of objectives based upon the studies and tables found from pages 287 to 334 in his book.

TABLE LV

THE RELATION OF QUANTITY OF FRUITS CONSUMED TO FOOD VALUE (HARAP)

	Value of Products Consumed in 1920 (dollars)	Rank	Composite Food Value	Rank
Apples	241,911,000	1	156	12
Grapes	102,344,000	2	266	5
Peaches	96,000,000	3	177	11
Oranges	58,039,000	4	228	9
Strawberries	38,000,000	5	355	3
Pears	24,798,000	6	228	10
Plums and prunes	20,962,000	7	337	4
Bananas	19,088,000	8	236	7
Apricots	9,700,000	9		
Currants	6,076,000	10		
Cranberries	5,700,000	11		
Figs	4,883,000	12	1782	1
Dates	2,088,000	13	1240	2
Lemons	1,717,000	14	228	8
Pineapples	1,423,000	15	253	6

Sources for this table, same citations as given in Table 54.

The most important thing to be said about this study is that it gives one detailed, semi-scientific information by which one can determine specifically the particularized bits of information, habits, skills, and attitudes that might be taught citizens about household matters. It is an important theory of curriculum making that a careful study of known standards of habits and information should be made, and the degree to which persons possess or do not possess these basic skills and information should be also discovered. The curriculum consists, according to this point of view, of that body of knowledge and those skills, attitudes, and appreciations by which pupils can be made ready to engage efficiently in socially desirable activities.

TABLE LVI

THE OBJECTIVES DRAWN UP BY HARAP FROM HIS STUDY THAT ARE CONCERNED WITH THE CONSUMPTION OF VEGETABLES AND FRUITS AS ILLUSTRATED BY TABLES 54 AND 55 (HARAP)

"To give the vegetables their proper place in the thinking and habits of the food plan of the people of our nation
"To use and to think of potatoes primarily as starch foods
"To use and to think of green vegetables primarily as foods rich in calcium, phosphorus, and iron salts
"To use and to think of the legumes as rich in protein foods, with an abundance of calcium and iron
"To cultivate the habit of using spinach as a rich and cheap food
"To use tomatoes less in bulk and more for flavoring
"To use more dried beans and peas
"To know roughly the relative cost and food value of:
potatoes, sweet potatoes, tomatoes, cabbage, onions, cantaloupes, watermelons, celery, cucumbers, lettuce, beans, peas, asparagus, green peppers, spinach, and carrots
"To know the effect of home and commercial canning on beans, peas, and tomatoes

---

"To know exactly what place the fruits occupy in the food plan
"To use and think of bananas as a starch food
"To use and think of the dried fruits as starch foods
"To use and think of raisins and prunes as foods rich in iron
"To consume more figs, dates, raisins, and prunes
"To know the relation between fresh and dried fruits as well as their comparative quality and economy
"To know the relation between fresh and canned fruits as well as their comparative quality and economy
"To know roughly the relative food value and cost of apples, grapes, peaches, oranges, strawberries, pears, plums, prunes, bananas, apricots, currants, cranberries, figs, dates, lemons, and pineapples."

CRITERION 5—TRAITS DEMANDED BY "LAY" CITIZENS

Study 33

The problem studied by Breeze[21] was to determine those traits or qualities that are supposedly essential to being an efficient citizen. A class in education in Will Mayfield College (Missouri) wrote to 400 of the leading men and women of the United States whose names appeared in the latest edition of *Who's Who in America.* These persons represented fifteen occupations and professions in which the majority of the American people are engaged. They also included people from every state in the union. These people were asked to give five or more traits that they considered the most essential to efficient citizenship. There were 148 people who replied. Different traits to the number of 212 were found in a total of 819 that were submitted. (See Table 57, p. 96.)

The writer of this article says, therefore, "that the efficient citizen must be honest and industrious, he must be intelligently interested in the affairs of the nation, the state, and the community, and actively participate in them, he must respect and obey the law and advocate its enforcement. Loyalty, patriotism, and public spirit must rank high in characterizing him. He must have religious ideals developed within him. To these traits must be added courage, tolerance, intelligence, integrity, open-mindedness, good health, willingness to serve, liberal education, cooperation, unselfishness, and character."

Such a list, while in all likelihood incomplete, is of value for determining specific traits to be promoted in any program of citizenship training. A much more exhaustive study should be made.

Study 34

Mahan,[22] in addition to determining the duties and dif-

[21]Breeze, Retha E., "What Constitutes Good Citizenship?" *The School Review,* Vol. 32, pp. 534-536 (September, 1924).

[22]Mahan, T. J., *Op. cit.*

TABLE LVII

THE FIVE MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED TRAITS AND THE FIVE LESS FREQUENTLY MENTIONED CITIZENSHIP TRAITS (BREEZE)

Highest Five	Frequency	Lowest Five	Frequency
Honesty	58	Fairness	5
Knowledge of and an interest and participation in national, state, and local affairs	56	Initiative	5
Industry	47	Energy	5
Religious traits, such as reverence for God, Christianity, etc.	28	Faithfulness	5
Loyalty	25	Love for others	5

ficulties of citizenship obtained a list of qualities of citizens by means of interviews.

TABLE LVIII

THE TEN MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED CIVIC QUALITIES CITED BY 80 PERSONS INTERVIEWED (MAHAN)

Qualities	Frequency of Mention
1. Honesty	22
2. Education	13
3. Unselfishness	12
4. Tolerance	10
5. Law abiding	9
6. Industrious	8
7. Civic pride	7
8. Right attitude toward fellowmen	7
9. Broadminded	7
10. Service	6

Study 35

Bobbitt[23] attempted to determine the qualities that citizens should possess by analysis of eighteen books of essays. The plan was to note on a card each clearly approved quality, without reference to any unit, such as paragraph, chapter, or volume.

[23]Bobbitt, Franklin, with cooperation of Bixler, G., Mott, H. M., and Postil, H. H., *Curriculum Investigations*, pp. 98-102.

"If the writer dwelt on one of the characteristics continuously and at length it was recorded only once. If, after intermediate discussion of other topics, he came back to it, it was again recorded, even if it were presented the second time in but a single sentence.

"Naturally, such a count—or any other method of count—is not a measure of the value or of the frequency or place of the thing in human life, and yet the figures are of some assistance in an evaluation of activities and characteristics. A quality praised one hundred times in the eighteen selections is likely to be a more prominent ingredient in a high type of living than is a thing praised but once. Thus the figures may, in a rough way, indicate more and less, but obviously they do not indicate how much more or how much less."[24] (See Table 59, p. 98.)

Study 36

Lorenzen[25] likewise gathered data to discover what forms of conduct will result in agreeable and effective relations between the individual and the group. Six books of etiquette, eleven books[26] which discuss making a living and 123 articles appearing in the *American Magazine* between January, 1919, and June, 1925, were analyzed with a view to discovering what forms of conduct society has approved.

The investigator concludes that the individual who would live agreeably and helpfully with his fellows must conduct himself as society approves. The following abilities should be sought as a result of this analysis, says the author: (1) The ability to express certain fundamental social attitudes, such as honesty, consideration for others, and self-control; (2) the ability to entertain friends; (3) the ability to meet individuals graciously; and (4) the ability to promote pleasant home relationships. (See Table 60, p. 99.)

---

[24]Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, p. 99

[25]Lorenzen, C. H., *Approved Social Behavior as Revealed in Recent Literature*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

[26]See Bobbitt, Franklin, *Op. cit.*, p. 104 for lists of these books.

TABLE LIX

FREQUENCY OF MENTION OF 51 APPROVED QUALITIES OF ACTION AND ASPECTS OF CHARACTER IN EIGHTEEN BOOKS OF ESSAYS (BOBBITT)

Quality of Action or Aspect of Character	Frequency
Obedience to the standards of virtue	140
Acceptance of the world's highest valuations	132
Friendly attitudes, feelings, and reactions	128
Courtesy, graciousness, magnanimity	126
Vision, intelligence, alertness, wisdom	125
Original, not second-hand, vision	100
Subordination of self	88
Courage	85
Honesty	80
Strength, vigor	77
Work, industry	74
Steadfastness	70
Initiative	68
Truth-telling	55
Religious	54
Sense of justice	48
Helping others	46
Balance in one's vision	46
Equability, geniality, good humor	46
Active, not passive	42
Serving one's fellow-man	42
Good health	40
Family affection	38
Sense of duty	37
Prudence	35
Earnestness, sincerity	34
Simplicity, naturalness	32
Responsive to social expectations	28
System, order	28
Appreciation of, and attention to, things of beauty	24
Fighting with vigor when necessary	24
Play	22
Joy	22
Promulgating vision	20
Patience, long-suffering	20
Use of good language	20
Composure, ease	19
Leadership	18
A good bearing and general appearance	17
Cleanliness	15
Good fellowship	15
Material well-being	15
Contentment	14
Self-confidence	12
Keeping good associations	12
Enthusiasm, optimism	12
Patriotism	9
Emotionally vigorous	5
Gratitude	5
Good sportsmanship	4
Adaptability	3

TABLE LX

COMPARISON OF DISTRIBUTIONS OF EMPHASIS TO FUNDAMENTAL SOCIAL ATTITUDES AND ACTIVITIES IN BOOKS OF CONDUCT AND THE AMERICAN MAGAZINE (LORENZEN)

Items	Per cent of Space in Books of Conduct	Per cent of Frequency in the *American Magazine*
Controlling one's self	6.5	3.8
Serving others, being unselfish	5.5	1.4
Being thrifty with money	5.4	1.6
Relying on one's self	5.3	2.7
Being honest, honorable	4.8	6.6
Being courageous	3.9	2.7
Considerate of others	3.8	5.3
Cultivating habits of enjoyment	3.5	2.7
Developing one's talents	3.5	0.2
Not over-sensitive	3.4	
Being dependable and responsible	3.3	2.3
Not self-centered, conceited, not showing off, etc	3.3	6.0
Not worrying, having faith	2.4	3.7
Having initiative	2.3	1.3
Interested in one's work	2.3	1.4
Being resolute, determined	2.3	
Being patient and persistent	2.2	1.6
Being courteous	2.1	3.0
Being ambitious	2.1	1.6
Concentrating on one's task	2.1	1.3
Being friendly	1.8	3.3
Having vision	1.8	2.9
Understanding people	1.7	2.1
Being enthusiastic	1.7	1.3
Being cheerful	1.6	1.4
Living up to one's standards	1.6	0.9
Being loyal	1.6	0.6
Being industrious	1.5	3.0
Being appreciative	1.4	1.2
Knowing one's job thoroughly	1.3	1.4
Choosing one's friends wisely	1.3	0.1
Doing one's best	1.2	0.5
Using time to good advantage	1.2	0.2
Being kind and gracious	0.9	0.9
Being observant	0.7	2.3
Cooperating with others	0.6	1.2
Clean, having sound moral habits	0.6	0.8
Being agreeable	0.5	0.9
Being fair, just	0.3	3.3
Being adaptable	0.3	2.0
Being generous	0.2	1.3
Being decisive	0.1	1.4
Tolerant, open-minded		2.0
Being sympathetic		1.6
Miscellaneous	4.7	11.4

CRITERION 6—HOW MUCH VOLUNTARY READING OF "LAY" CITIZENS PERTAINS TO THE SOCIAL SCIENCES?

Studies 37 and 38

A study of books withdrawn from libraries, and of books of various classes published was undertaken by Horn[27] and further explored by Earle Rugg[28] to check if possible the theory that the "layman" reads non-fiction as a means of voluntary recreation. The proportion of books published was sought on the theory that publishers tend to restrict the number of books of a given class, such as history or science or fine arts, etc., to the "buying" demands of the public. An analysis of books withdrawn in various classes was made to see in what proportion people voluntarily read books in the various fields of knowledge.

To ascertain what books were withdrawn, Dr. Horn made an examination of the records of the central and branch libraries of New York City for 1913, a year which he asserts to be free "from unusual influences which might increase or decrease the amount of history normally read."[29] He also analyzed the proportion of books published of various classes (1913) as summarized in *The World Almanac* for 1915.

Jordan in his investigation—*Children's Interests in Reading*—lends evidence to the theory that there is an interest in reading history voluntarily, for he shows that in the reading of such books, aside from fiction, the number is comparatively great when compared to other types of non-fiction.

The writer (Earle Rugg) investigated another aspect of this question of voluntary reading as follows: A question blank was sent to 50 representative public libraries

---

[27]Horn, Ernest, "A Study of Literary Withdrawals and Books Published," found in "The Application of Methods of Research to Making the Course of Study in History," *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, *Op. cit.*, pages 235-239.

[28]Rugg, Earle, "A Further Study of Library Withdrawals and Books Published," Found in unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation on file in the Library, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1923.

[29]He refers to undue warping of the reading habits of the layman, due to the late World War.

throughout the country asking for their circulation statistics for one year in each of the three groups:

1. A year before the World War, such as 1911, 1912, or 1913.

2. A year during the World War, such as 1915, 1916, or 1917.

3. A year after the World War, such as 1920, 1921, or 1922.

It so happens that most public libraries are classifying their books according to the Dewey Decimal System. According to this system the books numbered in the 100's pertain to philosophy, in the 200's to religion, in the 500's to natural sciences; 600's to applied science, 700's to fine arts, 800's to literature, and it also happens that the books on phases of social science—history, government, economics, sociology—are classified for the most part within either the 300's or the 900's. Hence, librarians filling in the number of books under each of the Dewey Decimal classes were asked to present the evidence from which one could determine the percentage of books in the various classes read.

In order to exclude as much as possible the reading of such books *required* by schools of high school and college pupils, two other questions were asked.

"1. In your opinion, is any considerable proportion of the social science books in the 300's and 900's withdrawn by school pupils for *required* reading or by persons gathering information for programs in civic organizations? If so, estimate the percentage of such withdrawals.

"2. In your opinion, would your circulation statistics for books in the 300's and 900's compared with the other classes such as the 100's, 200's, 500's, etc., warrant the conclusion that the "lay" public in your community *voluntarily* reads history, geography, economics, government, and sociology?"

Table 61 compares the number of books published and withdrawn for reading for the years 1913 and 1921. It should be noted that Dr. Horn was interested to find the

percentage of books published in the field of *history*. The writer re-grouped Horn's figures to include *all* social science material and found that in the Horn list of 1913, 30.9 per cent of the books dealt with social sciences; in the Rugg study of the 1921 list, 27.5 per cent dealt with social sciences.

In the study of books withdrawn from public libraries fiction was excluded, so the table below indictes only *non-fiction*. About 60 per cent of the books withdrawn from public libraries are fiction. Thus, one is discussing in this study only about 40 per cent of the entire number of books withdrawn from public libraries.

Table 61 shows that about four out of the every ten non-fiction books withdrawn are books dealing with the social sciences, and that half of these, in the opinion of the librarians, represent what might be termed *voluntary* reading. All librarians except one tend to support the claim that there is a *leisure* value or objective to be sought in the teaching of the social sciences. One should also note the marked similarity between the proportion of books withdrawn in each class of the Dewey Decimal System and the proportion of books *published* in these classes. (See II, Table 61. It might be said that publishing houses are close students of what the public want to read.

CRITERION 7—THE JUDGMENT OF "LAY CITIZENS" CONCERNING THE VALUES OF SCHOOL SUBJECTS AND ACTIVITIES IN LIFE

Study 39

Mort and Devricks[31] made a study to discover the judgment of citizens concerning the value of school subjects and activities in later life. The purpose of this study was to ascertain the values of school subjects and school activities in so far as they may affect the following five major classes of life activities for adults: economic habits, leisure,

[31]Mort, P. R., and Devricks, R. K., "An Accounting of General Values in a Small High School, Curriculum," *The School Review*, Vol. 29, pages 113-131 (February, 1921).

citizenship, home making, and good will (conventions of life).

A rating card involving these five classes of activities was given to 874 graduates of ten township high schools in Indiana. These graduates included teachers, farmers, doctors, clergymen, clerks, and home makers.

Each adult was asked to rate each of the subjects indicated in the table below on a scale of 1 to 10 for each of the five activities cited above.

A study of this table reveals how former high school graduates tend to evaluate various school subjects and school activities. It should be noted, for example, that

TABLE LXI

THE OPINIONS OF THE LIBRARIANS OF SEVENTEEN[30] PUBLIC LIBRARIES WHO REPLIED CONCERNING THE ABOVE THREE QUESTIONS (EARLE RUGG)

Name of City	Population of City	100s Philosophy	200s Religion	400s Philology	500s Natural Science	600s Applied Science	700s Fine Arts	800s Literature	900s Social Science	Questions 1	Questions 2	Questions 3
										Do Withdrawals Represent Required Reading of Pupils	Per cent Estimated by Libs. in Question II	Does the "Lay Public" Voluntarily Read Social Science
I — Summary % in each class — Dewey Decimal System.		4.3	3.9	1.7	5.6	11.5	9.8	22.0	40.2	14 Yes 2 No	51%	16 Yes 1 No
II—% books published—average 1913 & 1921		3.0	7.4	2.8	7.0	17.2	4.0	11.5	29.2			

(Fiction and juvenile books are excluded.)

[30]These seventeen libraries give one a fair picture of the character of adult reading. Four of the replies represent public libraries of cities of over 100,000 population; five represent public libraries of cities of a population between 100,000 and 50,000; five cities with a population between 50,000 and 25,000; and three cities with a population of less than 25,000. The libraries are located in twelve different states, principally in the east, south, and central west. They vary in types of communities; some are located in industrial centers, some in the midst of rich farming regions, some are in subrban communities; a few are in metropolitan industrial or business centers.

TABLE LXII

THE MEDIAN VALUE GIVEN EACH SCHOOL SUBJECT OR ACTIVITY AS THOSE GRADUATES ASSERT THAT IT CONTRIBUTES TO THE SUM TOTAL OF THESE FIVE MAJOR ACTIVITIES IN ADULT LIFE (MORT AND DEVRICKS)

1. Association with students 57.0	11. Music 37.5	21. Scholarship 26.0
2. Association with teacher 54.0	12. Commercial Arithmetic 36.5	22. Opening Exercises. 26.0
3. Civics 53.5	13. Art 35.0	23. Debating 23.5
4. U. S. History 52.0	14. History of Literature 34.5	24. Physical Geog. 22.0
5. Social Affairs 51.0	15. Botany 34.0	25. Physics 21.5
6. Manual Train. 49.0	16. English Gram. 34.0	26. Geometry 20.5
7. Domestic Scien. 48.0	17. School Gov't 29.5	27. Algebra 20.0
8. Literature 47.5	18. Composition 28.0	28. Recitation System 19.5
9. Athletics 45.0	19. Physiology 27.0	29. Latin 18.5
10. General History (Ancient, Medieval and Modern) 43.0	20. Geography 26.5	30. Grading System 18.0

group contacts (association with students and teachers) and social affairs rank among the highest in so far as they are judged to contribute to these five values in the period of life after children leave school. These estimates should give curriculum makers in the social science-citizenship field food for thought. It is rather interesting to note also that United States history and civics are rated as almost as valuable; whereas, algebra and Latin are two subjects that are near the bottom of the list in their value to adult citizens, when estimated by this group of graduates. Curriculum makers should also carefully consider the fact that these persons rate the recitation system and the grading system at the bottom of the list. This study is helpful in giving one an idea of what high school graduates grown to manhood and womanhood deem to be of *value* or use to them in their major life activities. The content implied in the social sciences and citizenship education ranks high.

INTERPRETATION

Until recently the chief implication of the social science curriculum was to be found in the theory that "reading courses" in history, geography, civics, economics, and sociology would make pupils good citizens. The assump-

tion still holds that knowledge of the social heritage will produce properly trained citizens.

But in recent years, we find this assumption gaining ground: that formal education is necessary to teach pupils to do better the things they are going to do anyway and to help them do well more desirable things. "The curriculum represents the experiences in which people are expected to engage in school, and the general order of sequence in which these experiences are to come.[32] But it is not enough to aim at "good citizenship" in a vague general way. As well aim at "medicine" in a large vague way in the training of a physician.[33] Hence, Bobbitt demands that analyses of the activities essential to good citizenship be made. He asserts that the good citizen is one who can perform the 50, 500, or 5000 things that a good citizen has to perform.[34] He further says, "Education cannot take the first step in training for citizenship until it has particularized the characteristics of a good citizen. The training task is to develop those characteristics.[35] This chapter illustrates an attempt by the use of several criteria to particularize the characteristics of the good citizen.

Once the specific activities are ascertained in a relatively objective way then the problem of how to teach them arises. This activity-analysis technic implies that the school subjects dealing with the social sciences represent "service" materials. "In all of these activities in which people engage, the race has had age-long experience. Through this experience it has found means of meeting needs which are highly effective. In carrying on the various activities many useful tools have been developed. One of the problems of the school is to make clear the value of these tools and to develop a mastery of these tools in actually meeting needs."[36] Bonser later in his discussion

---

[32]Bonser, F. G., *The Elementary School Curriculum*, p. 1, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1920.

[33]Bobbitt, Franklin, *The Curriculum*, p. 117, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1918.

[34]Adapted from Bobbitt, Franklin, *How to Make a Curriculum*, Chapter VII, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1924.

[35]Bobbitt, Franklin, *The Curriculum*, p. 117.

[36]Bonser, F. G., *Op. cit.*, p. 75.

of the emergence of the curriculum from life activities says, "The activities of the curriculum represent present needs, the subjects of study, the social inheritance.[37] The duties that citizens must perform, the difficulties that confront them and the traits that make for good citizens are to be discovered in the analysis of actual citizenship activities. The knowledge, skills, and appreciations that have evolved through age-long experience will be found helpful in teaching pupils to perform efficiently the activities of citizens.

Several criteria for determining the particular items (duties, difficulties, and abilities implied) to be taught are evident. Studies 22, 23, 24, 26, 27, and 35 rely upon language—chiefly periodical literature—as evidence of "what man is thinking about, what he is dealing with, and what activities he is performing." Study 25 applies the interview technic to the solution of particularizing the activities of citizens. Studies 28 and 29 represent the introspective suggestions of keen students of the civic needs of America. Studies 30, 31, and 32 involve rather specialized needs of citizens. Study 30 assumes that citizens need certain unspecialized legal information; study 31 itemizes types of contacts citizens have with governmental agencies; and study 32 contributes significant data concerning a special field of economics—consumer needs of citizens. Traits are likewise particularized by various technics—judgment of citizens, study 33; interviews, study 34; language (books and magazines), studies 35 and 36. The recreational use of the social sciences is explored in studies 37 and 38. Finally, study 39 used the judgment technic for the general contribution of school subjects and activities to meeting life situations efficiently.

SUMMARY

The studies represented in this chapter are significant in their recognition of a broader implication of citizenship needs. They reveal in some degree of particularization what might be termed the *unspecialized* needs of citizens

[37]Topic sentence, Bonser, *Op. cit.*, p. 80.

in contra-distinction to the specialized needs of government officers found commonly in textbooks dealing with national, state, and local government. As a whole they should tend to make the curriculum maker conscious of scores of specific activities of apparent social value for "lay" citizens. Only one study, however, assures the curriculum maker in any degree of the persistent character of these activities. Further research is necessary to assure us that every item to be taught is of permanent value in so far as we can predict the permanence of activities.

The problems of organizing these materials for formal teaching are contingent upon: (1) Investigations of the *need* of teaching each of them; (2) utility; and (3) whether certain items will be learned incidentally in the general social life of the community or whether children will master such items by the provision of other educative agencies, the home, the church, and general community life. The items found by objective study to be of permanent use that cannot otherwise be taught tend to represent the curriculum materials for formal school courses and citizenship training.

MAJOR CONCLUSIONS TO BE DRAWN FROM THE OBJECTIVE STUDIES CITED IN CHAPTERS III-V

1. Those facts, topics, and problems that are seemingly required frequently or universally, or are crucial to life needs, are, relatively speaking, only a small fraction of the sum total of possible facts, topics, and problems.

2. There is a better basis for including specific facts, topics, or problems in the school curriculum when they are discovered to be socially valuable by two or more investigations than when such facts, topics, or problems are included principally on the judgment of the author of a textbook.

3. While these investigations deal principally with evidence concerning useful facts, topics, activities, and prob-

lems, one should bear in mind that certain materials may be valuable for other reasons. But anyone who wishes to justify the inclusion of content besides that selected upon standards of social needs herein illustrated should be obligated to report objective evidence to show why such content should be taught. This specifically applies to the justification of material for disciplinary, for cultural, or for conventional values.

4. The rather marked similarity of the evidence of independent investigations, made upon differing criteria, gives one relatively impersonal evidence to state what content should be included in the social science curriculum.

5. The studies in Chapter III give examples of how one may discover problems of contemporary society. While the school is obligated to train citizens to meet problems and activities of today, it is further obligated to equip individuals to adjust themselves to a dynamic society. It is probable that the school should endeavor to predict not only the training that citizens need now but also that training which they will require to meet the problems, issues, and modes of living some 20 or 30 years hence. In the opinion of the present writer, the best source for statements of the persistent and insistent problems and issues in a dynamic society is to be found in the published works of specialists in the study of society; in the investigations and conclusions of the men and women who have both detailed, theoretical acquaintance and practical knowledge of their field.

6. The relative probability with which one meets references to facts, topics, and problems is probably best evidenced in an analysis of the chief and almost the exclusive reading of the layman—the periodical press. Although there are limitations in the use of this method, such as the fact that widely read periodicals tend to contain few allusions to these facts, is it not the obligation of the school to give young citizens detailed analyses and practice in generalization about facts, topics, and problems, so that they can interpret them more wisely and form better judg-

ments? These citizens make up the mysterious something that we call public opinion. Their analyses and opinions tend to determine what is done to promote or hinder the progress of civilization.

7. Not only must curriculum makers provide for practice in problem solving about socially valuable content but also they must provide opportunities for the development of sufficient skill in the performance of the duties and the activities of a citizen. There is available some evidence concerning what citizens should do that should be included in the curriculum.

8. The investigations which tell in some detail what is now taught should be carefully canvassed so that one will have sound bases for the rejection or the continued inclusion of the content of the social sciences. The curriculum consists of that information, those skills, attitudes, and ideals that should be taught in order to move pupils from known deficiencies to scientifically determined standards, in so far as their abilities, interests, and capacities permit.

CHAPTER VI

THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP TRAINING IN SECONDARY SCHOOLS TODAY

ORIGIN OF THE PRESENT SOCIAL STUDIES PROGRAM

A century of teaching[1] the subject matter of history, geography and civics enables one to set in sharp relief present trends and to emphasize needed changes in the program of secondary social studies. The following conclusions were emphasized in the historical review cited above: (1) That history, geography, and civics were firmly entrenched as separate systematic subjects of study prior to the Civil War; (2) that national committees, composed largely of subject matter specialists, have dominated the character of the social studies curriculum since 1892 by means of their reports, published syllabi (elaborated by some members), and textbooks; and (3) that in the past fifteen years a widened concept of the program is apparent. (See Table 63, pp, 112-113, for influence of these committees.)

In Chapters III-V the movement for objective study of what should be taught in history, geography, and civics was reviewed through summaries and interpretations of investigations of subject matter apparently used considerably in the life activities of laymen. Two groups have been concerned to make curricula, particularly in the past decade and a half: first, the subject matter specialists, dominated by a philosophy of systematic, comprehensive knowledge of the social studies and by an implied mental discipline; and second, educational specialists (students of the curriculum, research workers, administrators, and educational sociologists) whose philosophy is in large degree utility in the broad sense. At present the outstanding need is to develop a plan whereby the services of both

[1]Rugg, Earle, "How the Current Courses in History, Geography, and Civics Came to be What They Are," *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, Chapter IV.

groups can be coordinated in order to develop a reorganized social studies-citizenship curriculum.

The American secondary school is largely traditional and has been less influenced by dynamic changes in American contemporary life than has the elementary school. Yet the consequences of the recent enormous expansion of public education on the secondary and college level must be faced.[2] What should be the program of studies in the secondary school to fit for contemporary life? This is an outstanding issue before the profession interested in the more advanced and mature educative experience of the children of America of today. The secondary school is being reorganized. Administratively, it is tending to embrace six instead of four years—to include grades 7 to 12 instead of 9 to 12.[3] In theory it demands opportunities for acquiring rich, vital (and perhaps continued common) experiences in all of the major classes of activities.[4] But the particularized content, apparently needed, that might tend to realize in detail the socially valuable knowledges, skills, appreciations, and ideals of greatest relative value in the major classes of activities set up by the Commission on Reorganization of Secondary Education,[5] has not been collected and utilized sufficiently in an actual program of curriculum making in secondary schools.

PRESENT STATUS OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL STUDIES

a. *Time allotment*: The social studies rank third in the amount of required hours in Counts' study[6] of senior high schools in fifteen representative public school systems, with about 15 per cent of the total time given to the study of history, civics, economics, sociology, and the like.

---

[2]See Counts, G. S., *The Senior High School Curriculum*, Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 31, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1926. See also Judd, C. H., "Some Effects of the Expansion of American Education," *The Teachers Journal and Abstract*, Vol. I, pp. 388-396 (June, 1926).

[3]Perhaps it will embrace even grades 7-14; the junior college as a locally supported institution implies partly, prolonged secondary education.

[4]See *Cardinal Objectives of Secondary Education*, Bulletin 35, 1918, U. S. Bureau of Education, Washington, D. C., 1918.

[5]Command of the fundamental processes, health, vocational training, *citizenship*, wise use of leisure, worthy home membership, and ethical training. See Bulletin 35, 1918, *Op. cit.*

[6]Counts, G. S., *Op. cit.*, p. 22.

TABLE LXIII

SHOWS RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE VARIOUS COMMITEES, 1892-1921
(EARLE RUGG.)

Name of Committee	Date	Membership of Committee	Third Grade	Fourth Grade	Fifth Grade	Sixth Grade
Committee of Ten, N. E. A.[1] A. H. A.[2]	1892 1894	7 Professors 3 Principals			Biography and Mythology	Biography and Mythology
Committee of Seven, A. H. A.	1896 1899	6 Professors 1 Principal	Stories from the Iliad, etc.	Biography	Greek and Roman History	Medieval and Modern History
					Course suggested by one member	
Committee of Eight, A. H. A.	1905 1909	4 Professors 2 Supt's 2 Teachers	Heroes of Other Times	American History Exploration to the Revolution	American History, Revolution to the Civil War	European Background
					Chiefly Biography	Civics taught
Committee of Five, A. H. A.	1907 1912	4 Professors 1 Principal				
Social Studies Committee, N. E. A.	1914 1916	5 Professors 2 Supt's 10 Teachers 4 Unclassified				
Committee of Seven, A. P. A.[3]	1911 1916	6 Professors 1 Supt.	Civic Virtues	A study of simple community activities Little textbook work		
			The Making of the United States			
Committee on History and Education for Citizenship, A. H. A. N. E. A.	1918 1921	6 Professors of History 1 Professor of Education 1 Supt. 1 Teacher	Discovery and Exploration	How Englishmen became Americans	The United States, 1783-1877	The United States, 1877 to date (½ year) Civics (½ year)

[1]National Education Association
[2]American Historical Association
[3]American Political Science Association
Seven professors were on two different committees

TABLE LXIII (Continued)

SHOWS RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE VARIOUS COMMITEES, 1892-1921
(EARLE RUGG.)

Seventh Grade	Eighth Grade	Ninth Grade	Tenth Grade	Eleventh Grade	Twelfth Grade
American History and Civil Government	Greek and Roman History	French History	English History & Medieval & Modern History	American History	One special topic for intensive study
English History	American History	Ancient History	Medieval and Modern History	English History	American History and Civil Government
of the Committee Grades 3-8					
American History 1500-1789	American History 1789-1909 (Also some emphasis on Modern European History)				
throughout Grades 1-8					
		Ancient History	English History	Modern European History	American History and Government
Geography ½ year, European History ½ year	American History ½ year, Civics ½ year	Civics and Economic History	Ancient and Medieval History to 1700 (1 yr.) Modern European History (½ or 1 yr.) American History since the 17th Century (1 or ½ yr.) Problems of American Democracy (1 or ½ yr.).		
Community Civics (emphasis upon functions but some treatment of the machinery of government).			An advanced course in Civics (Report does not state in which year it is to be offered, nor whether it is a one year or ½ year course.)		
American History in Its World Setting				The Modern World	
The World before 1607	The World since 1607 in relation to World Influence of the United States	Community and Nat'l Activities (commercial geography) civics social and economic History	Modern European History since 1650	American History during the National Period	Problems of Democracy

Social science to the extent of one to two units of fifteen or sixteen secondary units is either taken or required for admission to college. Dawson in his recent study asserts[7] that the average high school pupil takes slightly over two years' work (2 units) in the social studies or about one-eighth of the total secondary work required.[8]

b. *Grade placement*:[9] American history appears to be taught (supposedly in a more advanced manner than in its first systematic outline in grades 7 or 8) in grade 12[10] but in more recent years there is a marked tendency to place it in grade 11.[11] Ancient history, medieval and modern history, or the recent proposal of world history (a combination of ancient and medieval and modern in a one-year course) appear to be taught chiefly in grades 10 or 11. Civics of the community type, begun in the elementary grades, is found again on the secondary level, predominantly in the eighth or ninth grade, either for a year or a semester. Advanced civics (somewhat comparable, in simpler language, to the college study of political science or government) is a senior high school subject, appearing chiefly in grade 12. Economics, sociology, "problems of democracy," and social problems—the "newer" social studies—find their place, and compared to history and civics, a relatively minor place as yet, also in the latter years of the senior high school, particularly in grade 12. Geography is apparently taught in few high schools; when

---

[7]Dawson, Edgar, *The History Inquiry*, p. 18, The McKinley Publishing Company, Philadelphia, Pa., 1924.

[8]This proportion (one-eighth) is also found in the elementary school, See Ayer, F. C., *Studies in Administrative Research*, Department of Research, Seattle, Wash.

[9]The generalizations concerning grade placement are based upon numerous question-blank investigations, See (1) Briggs, T. H., in *Report of the United States Commissioner of Education*, 1915, Vol. 2, p. 121 (based upon returns from 7917 secondary schools); (2) Dawson, Edgar, *The History Inquiry, Op. cit.*, (1924) (based upon returns from 2404 history departments in high school); (3) Davis C. O., "Training for Citizenship in the North Central Secondary Schools," *The School Review*, Vol. 28, pp. 263-282 (April, 1920) (based upon returns from 1180 North Central high schools); (4) Moore, H. H., *The Status of Certain Social Studies in High Schools*, Bulletin 45, 1922, U. S. Bureau of Education, Washington, D. C., 1923 (based upon returns from 6624 high schools); (5) Monroe, W. S. and Foster, I. O., *The Status of the Social Sciences in the High Schools of the North Central Association*, Bulletin 13, Bureau of Research, College of Education, University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill., 1923 (based upon returns from 475 high schools); and (6) Counts, G. S., *Op. cit.*, (1926) (based upon personal study of fifteen representative public school systems.)

[10]See Table 63 for influence of the recommendations of the Committees of Seven and Committee of Five, American Historical Association.

[11]See Table 63—influence of recommendations of the Committee on History and Education for Citizenship, 1921.

offered on the senior high school level, it is given as an elective or is required for the most part of students pursuing the commercial curriculum and is in reality commercial geography.

On the junior high school or upper grade level (grades 7-9 or 7 and 8) one notes the first sequential study of American history and civics, principally in grades 7 and 8. Tryon's study[12] made in 1912 and the National Society for the Study of Education study[13] made in 1922 show that United States history was both in 1912 and in 1922 the predominant social study offered in grades 7 and 8.[14] Civics is emphasized in grade 8 (usually in the latter part of this grade).[15] Geography is predominantly an elementary subject though it is continued and completed by the study of an "advanced" textbook in grade 7 and 8.[16] When taught on the senior high school level it is chiefly commercial geography and commonly elected or required of pupils in the commercial curriculum.

Such data describe in a summary way the secondary social science curriculum. A preponderant majority of pupils are apparently required to take two rather systematic, formal courses in American history—one in the upper grades and one in the senior high school. Most pupils also study two types of civics—community civics in the eighth or ninth grade and advanced civics in the senior high school. European history of some kind—ancient, medieval or modern, or world history—is receiving increased emphasis but one cannot generalize exactly what proportion of pupils study this field. The other social studies, while receiving increased attention since the World War, yet are probably studied by only a small fraction of secondary pupils, though perhaps a considerable fraction

---

[12]Tryon, R. M., *Materials, Methods, and Administration of History Study in the Elementary Schools of the United States*, Indiana University Studies, No. 17, Bloomington, Ind., 1922.

[13]*Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, *Op. cit.*

[14]Glass, J. M., *Curriculum Practices in the Junior High School and Grades 5 and 6*, Supplementary Educational Monograph, No. 25, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1924.

[15]The proportional emphasis is approximately 85 and 15 per cent to American history and civics respectively, See Glass, *Op. cit.*

[16]Based upon data collected by the National Society for the Study of Education in 1922, See *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II.

of the pupils may have studied in high school either economics, or sociology, or "problems of democracy."

c. *Objectives sought*: Several studies have been made of the aims and objectives of the social studies.[17] Both types of investigations of objectives [(1) theoretical aims stated in books and articles of the teaching of the social studies and courses of study—see studies of Gold, Koos, and Earle Rugg—and (2) aims implied in an analysis of 56,000 test or examination questions collected from 1125 teachers of the social studies] reflect clearly the dominance even to date of a philosophy of values implied in systematic, comprehensive knowledge and mental discipline. Osburn says[18] "The dominant emphasis is upon training the memory and upon organization of the essay type. . . . There is also evidence of the old faith in formal discipline. Whatever our present theory may be, there is no doubt but that our current practice consists to a very large measure in filling the child's mind with facts and trusting to luck that he will remember them and know when and how to use them in his thinking." *Objectives,* apparently emphasized by some writers in theoretical discussions of the values of the social studies, *such as*: (1) *To teach the nature of evidence* and *the habit of weighing it;* (2) *to afford practical knowledge for use in daily life;* (3) *to inculcate a taste for reading the social studies;* (4) *to bring about sympathy and understanding among peoples and nations;* (5) *to inculcate the love of truth;* (6) *to fit boys and girls for citizenship;* (7) *to promote scientific thinking;* (8) *to teach an appreciation of the past;* (9) *to interpret the present and judge the future in terms of the*

[17]See (1) *Fifth Yearbook,* Department of Superintendence, pp. 224-226, for summary of Osburn, W. J., *Are We Making Good at Teaching History?* Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926; (2) Gold, H. H., "Methods and Content of Courses in History in the High Schools of the United States," *School Review,* Vol. 25, pp. 80-100, 187-195, 274-282 (February, March, April, 1917); (3) Koos, L. V., *Administration of Secondary School Units,* Supplementary Educational Monographs, Vol. 3, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1917; (4) Rugg, Earle, "Evaluating the Aims and Outcomes of History," *The Historical Outlook,* Vol. 14, p. 325 (November, 1923), and (5) Hill, H. C. "History for History's Sake," *The Historical Outlook,* vol. 12, pp. 310-315 (December, 1921).

[18]Osburn, W. J., *Op. cit.,* p. 64.

past; and (10) *to afford moral training*[19] are either not evident at all or in but very slight degree in Osburn's analysis of examination papers.

d. *Trends and developments*: Dawson's study[20] of 1924 when compared with Briggs'[21] survey of practice (1914) enables us to note the influence of the widened concept of social studies. In this decade (1914 to 1924) American history gained slightly in emphasis, English, medieval and ancient history lost considerably in proportional enrollment, and world history took the place of the above three courses, each one year in length. The newer "social" studies—community civics, economics, sociology, and "problems of democracy" have increased both as electives and required subjects.[22] Today, then, the social studies imply pupil contacts with not only history and civics but also such subjects as economics, sociology, problems of democracy, and modern social problems.

A further observable trend but not as yet to be verified by a sufficiently representative sampling of nation-wide practice is noted in an increased provision for related activities such as student councils, assemblies, and clubs. Apparently in the so-called extra-curricular activities many secondary schools are attempting to supplement what are in reality but "reading" courses in citizenship with a variety of student activities of an extra-class type. In origin these activities were largely voluntary. Evils developed, and high school administrators have been forced to provide for extra-class activities in the administrative program of their respective schools. Their philosophy, functions, and values are as yet but vaguely defined or realized. However, a program of objective curriculum construction in the social studies must take into account their

---

[19]See Table 28, p. 226, *Fifth Yearbook, Op. cit.*, for table quoted from Osburn's study of relative emphasis to aims in history testing.

[20]*The History Inquiry, Op. cit.*

[21]See Report of the U. S. Commissioner of Education, 1915, *Op. cit.*

[22]Based upon: (1) The investigations cited earlier of present practice in the secondary school; and (2) evidence collected by Dawson concerning (a) sales of textbooks in the social studies and (b) correspondence to obtain opinions of school administrators.

place, function, and value in the education of high school pupils.[23]

e. *Influence of special groups—legislative prescription, and organized associations.* A trend deserving special attention in the study of the exact status of the present program of school studies is the influence of special organized groups. Two sources may be used to illustrate the significance of this influence. First, the proceedings of certain national non-educational organizations and societies abound with resolutions concerning what should be taught and what should not be taught.[24] Resolutions in one to four of the annual proceedings of such societies (Academy of Political and Social Science, American Bankers' Association, American Federation of Labor, etc.) may be found concerning the teaching of citizenship, civics, and the social studies in every year between 1914 and 1924. How influential such resolutions are cannot be determined except that the second source—the prescriptions of state legislatures concerning what should be taught—is apparently much more in evidence now than twenty years ago. Flanders[25] canvassed the situation as revealed in the laws of all 48 states in 1903, 1913, and 1923 for the elementary school subjects.[26] In brief he found United States history prescribed by 30 states as early as 1903 and in 35 states in 1923; civics in 13 states in 1903 and 24 states in 1923; citizenship in one state and "patriotism" in no state in 1903 but in 14 and 12 states respectively in 1923. Reorganization of the secondary social studies program may be partially controlled by "lay" organizations.[27]

---

[23]Based upon an analysis of a large number of magazine articles almost entirely written since 1914, eight systematic books (dealing with extra-curricular activities in the high school) published since 1924, and nearly a score of investigations. For a more detailed description of the trends in extra-curricular activities see Rugg, Earle, "A Proposed Evaluation of Extra-Curricular Activities," *The High School Teacher*, Vol. 3, pp. 6-8, and 19 (January, 1927).

[24]See Bagley, W. C., and Kyte, G. C., *The California Curriculum Study*, pp. 51-56, particularly Diagram 2, p. 54, Chapter XV, Diagram 13 and Table 123, University of California Printing Office, Berkeley, Calif., 1926.

[25]Flanders, J. K., *Legislative Control of the Elementary Curriculum*, Contributions to Education, No. 195, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

[26]This study, while restricted to the elementary school, is cited because it illustrates the tendency of legislatures to prescribe what should be taught, It is probable that a similar study on the high school level would reveal similar prescription, The recent anti-evolution law of Tennessee involved the teaching of science in the *secondary* school.

[27]See Pierce, B. L., *Public Opinion and the Teaching of History*, Alfred A. Knopf, New York, 1926.

f. *Courses of study, Texts, etc.* On the elementary level hundreds of manuals called courses of study are available; it is probable that a preponderant proportion of local school systems have either typed or printed outlines (courses of study) for guidance of the teacher. On the high school level few such detailed, printed course of study outlines are available. "In the majority of American schools it (the textbook) determines the facts to be taught and the manner of teaching them. A teacher called upon to instruct any grade above the third is almost certain to demand a textbook. . . . . From this point on to the end of the high school course the study of history . . . . means at bottom the preparation of textbook lessons and the teaching of history means at bottom the discussion of textbook lessons."[28]

CONTENT AND CHARACTER OF THE SO-CALLED SOCIAL STUDIES

We have thus far attempted to describe what the so-called social studies are, their grade placement, proportionate emphasis in the school program, and relative emphasis given each. We now turn to an attempt to describe briefly, yet as accurately as the data available permit, what these courses are in detail. This description, which the writer maintains is, on the whole, a fair picture of the content of these courses, is possible because of one predominant practice in American public education; namely, that we teach almost solely from textbooks. Once we know what texts are commonly used, it is possible by analysis of these texts to describe the content of these courses. Pupils read, study, and even yet in some classes attempt to *memorize* these texts. Almost their sole acquaintance with the materials of history, geography, civics, economics, and sociology is gained from their reading of these *textbooks*. The study of textbooks in these subjects is assumed to be the medium by which citizenship training is to be promoted.

[28]Johnson, Henry, *The Teaching of History in Elementary and Secondary Schools*, p. 269, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1916.

ILLUSTRATIVE ANALYSES OF THE SECONDARY READING COURSES IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

1. ANALYSES OF HISTORY TEXTS

Study 40

The pioneer analysis[29] of history textbooks as well as of the life values of history was made by W. C. Bagley in collaboration with Harold Rugg. It aimed to show the trends and relative emphasis given to the basic history materials in United States history as taught in the seventh and eighth grades by means of analyzing commonly used textbooks published in four periods; viz., 1865-1874, 1881-1888, 1890-1904, and 1906-1912.

The authors point out the significance of the study in the following words: "Under the assumption that the minimal content of geography and history as taught in the elementary school should include the geographical and historical data with which everyone should be familiar,—the facts and principles which might be assumed as part of the culture *common to all of the people*—the need for knowledge are now, and have been in the immediate past, knowing what elements of historical and geographical actually part of the common pabulum of elementary instruction assumed prime importance."

The study represented a careful count of the proportion of space devoted to the major periods and to the subordinate topics within each period as well as a careful count of the frequency of mention of important persons in each period. Out of the latter, the so-called *Hall of Fame* of important persons in American history was developed.

The study reports the larger topics of the textbooks which represent somewhat chronological units or epochs. It also gives general descriptions of the main characteristics of the book such as references and bibliographies, questions and outlines, pictures, anecdotal material, and maps.

---

[29]Bagley, W. C., and Rugg, H. O., *The Content of American History as Taught in Seventh and Eighth Grades—An Analysis of Typical School Textbooks*, Bulletin 16, School of Education, University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill., 1915, (Out of print and unavailable).

Using a classification of periods in United States history by which the amount of space devoted to wars could be isolated, Bagley and Harold Rugg carefully computed the proportion of space devoted to each period in American history. Space does not permit the reproduction of this table as a whole.[30] (See Table 64, following.)

TABLE LXIV

THE AVERAGE PERCENTAGE OF SPACE DEVOTED TO EACH PERIOD BY THE FOLLOWING CLASSES OF BOOKS: I. PUBLISHED 1865-1874; II. 1881-1888; III. 1890-1904; IV. 1906-1812 (BAGLEY AND HAROLD RUGG)

Average	Discov. & Explora.	Colonial Develop.	Colonial Wars	Prerevolution	Revolution	1783-1812	1812-1861	Civil War	1865 to date of Pub.	*Check*
Class I	5.7	21.3	5.6	3.1	17.6	6.4	16.9	18.8	8.95	101.4
Class II	7.93	20.0	4.83	1.86	17.3	8.2	15.6	14.2	11.3	101.3
Class III	11.15	17.46	3.42	3.35	11.87	8.78	19.12	11.88	14.87	99.9
Class IV	8.27	15.95	3.67	4.11	9.58	14.17	21.01	10.22	14.45	101.43

TABLE LXV

THE TOPICS FOR THE PLYMOUTH AND MASSACHUSETTS BAY COLONIES AS ILLUSTRATIVE, AND THE AVERAGE PER CENT OF THE BOOK SPACE GIVEN TO THE TOPIC (BAGLEY AND HAROLD RUGG)

Topics Common To At Least 75 Per Cent of the Books	Average Per Cent of Space Devoted To Each Topic In Each Publication Period			
	I	II	III	IV
Mayflower compact	0.24	0.15	0.15	0.19
Massachusetts Bay settlement	0.32	0.17	0.23	0.36
Charter difficulties	0.24	0.20	0.36	0.24
Witchcraft	0.51	0.25	0.17	0.11
European background				
Pilgrims and Puritans	0.35	0.51	0.39	0.38
People of the colonies	0.10	0.18	0.14	0.18
Topics common to 50 per cent of the books				
Development of Plymouth	0.46	0.15	0.19	0.17
Indian relations	0.13	0.26	0.17	0.33
Anne Hutchinson and Roger Williams	0.23	0.23	0.26	0.11
Founding of Harvard University	0.12	0.20	0.19	0.13

[30]Compare with Table 69 for similar analyses on American history books in current use today.

The report then goes into great detail as to the percentage of space devoted by books in the four classes to topics within each period common to all the books, common to 75 per cent of the books, and common to 50 per cent of the books. Space will not permit reproduction of these tables. One can, however, obtain from such tables an idea of the types of topics and the relative emphases to the same. But one detailed table is presented to illustrate the emphasis to many topics; the small percentage of the total space given the topics in Table 65 is indicative of the fact that the books treat briefly of many, many topics. (See p. 121.)

TABLE LXVI

THE PERSONS MOST PROMINENT IN CIVIL AND MILITARY AFFAIRS DURING THE CENTURY, 1765 AND 1865 (BAGLEY AND HAROLD RUGG)

(a) Civil list (Lincoln as the character having the highest frequency of reference is given the value of 100).

Lincoln	100	Jefferson	82
Washington	84	Jackson	49
John Adams	46	Webster	20
Madison	40	Samuel Adams	18
Hamilton	37	Stephen A. Douglas	18
Henry Clay	33	Buchanan	16
J. Q. Adams	29	John Tyler	16
Monroe	23	Jefferson Davis	15
Franklin	23	J. K. Polk	15
Patrick Henry	21	Taylor	14
Van Buren	20	Aaron Burr	14
Calhoun	20	John Jay	12
		W. H. Harrison	12

(b) Military list (Washington in this list is given the arbitrary value of 100).

Washington	100	Nathaniel Greene	20
R. E. Lee	83	Zachary Taylor	19
Grant	76	Winfield Scott	19
W. T. Sherman	48	G. H. Thomas	18
Cornwallis	42	Sheridan	17
McClellan	41	J. Hooker	16
J. E. Johnston	32	Philip Schuyler	15
Howe (General)	30	J. Early	14
Arnold	28	Gage	14
Clinton	26	Farragut	13
Burgoyne	24	W. H. Harrison	13
"Stonewall" Jackson	20	Andrew Jackson	13
		G. H. Meade	13

Concerning the so-called *Hall of Fame,* the writers set forth the point of view that not only is elementary history as taught in the seventh and eighth grades the initial study of that subject, but elementary history also has a value for supplying a common core of information at a time when ideals are readily formed and especially when they tend to cluster about personalities. "There is no other *Hall of Fame* that can compare with elementary textbooks in national history in keeping alive the memories of those who have gone before." The writers also assert that "it is well to know to what characters it is insuring a relatively high measure of immortality."

The more important facts set forth in this study may be summarized as follows:

"1. In so far as can be determined from the materials presented in the textbooks, elementary American history as taught in the seventh and eighth grades has been and still is predominantly political and military history.

"2. Within the past fifty years, the emphasis upon military affairs as measured by the proportion of space devoted to wars has declined. In general, battles and campaigns are treated less in detail than was formerly the rule, while proportionately more space is devoted to the causes and the results of wars. The lessening emphasis upon the details of the wars is first noticed in some of the textbooks published between 1881 and 1888, and the tendency has been general and decided since that time.

"3. The later books give a perceptibly heavier emphasis to the facts of economic and industrial development than do the earlier books, although political development still constitutes the essential core of elementary historical instruction.

"4. As regards the treatment of specific eras or epochs, the principal increases in emphasis are to be noted in connection with: (a) the period 1783-1812 (especially in the treatment of the so-called 'critical period' between the close of the Revolution and the adoption of the Constitution); (b) the non-military affairs of the period 1812-1861; and (c) European events preceding and during the periods of discovery, exploration, and settlement.

"5. The persons whose names are most frequently mentioned in the elementary textbooks are very predominantly

those who have been most intimately associated with political development and with military and naval affairs.

"6. Variations among the several textbooks in respect of persons mentioned are numerous and wide. Most of the books mention a very much larger number of names than the average pupil will be likely to remember. Certain names, however, are made to stand out through repetition. Whether these are the names that should in justice be perpetuated through the powerful agency represented by universal education is a question which it is not the province of this paper to consider.

"7. Variations in the topics and events which constitute the chief content of elementary historical instruction are probably less numerous and less wide than variations in names of persons mentioned. In any case there is a rather distinct 'core' of topics common to most of the books, and these topics may be looked upon as constituting the present 'standardized' content of elementary American history. Again it is not the province of this paper to consider the right of these common topics to the important place that they now occupy as basic elements in the culture of the next generation.

"8. Numerous changes have taken place in the construction of elementary textbooks in history during the past fifty years. The more important of these are: (a) a movement toward a simpler 'style' with larger emphasis upon clear statements of causal relationships; (b) the introduction and development of the 'problem' as a method of teaching history, and a consequent encouragement of 'judgment' as contrasted with rote memory,—of rational as contrasted with verbatim mastery; (c) a marked decline in the employment of imaginative pictures as illustrations and an increase in the use of pictures that represent sincere attempts to portray actual conditions; (d) a marked decline in the use of anecdotal materials; (e) a larger and wider use of maps."

Study 41

The present writer[31] in his original analyses of the textbooks as noted in the foreword sought to determine the relative emphasis to persons, dates, topics, place location facts, and the like. As one phase of the analysis he an-

[31]Rugg, Earle, See original unpublished dissertation on file in Library, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1923.

alyzed the content of early American history textbooks (published between 1821 and 1860) and recent textbooks (published between 1912 and 1918—the last date of publication of commonly used textbooks when this analysis was completed in 1922). The periods and relative emphases were governed by the organization of study 40 just summarized. Thus, with the Bagley-Harold Rugg data from 1865-1912, comparative evidence on trends in American history is available for approximately a century. Tables 67, 68, and 69 show comparative emphases to periods and phases of American history for 100 years.[32]

TABLE LXVII

THE PERCENTAGE OF SPACE ALLOTTED TO THE PERIODS OF AMERICAN HISTORY AS GIVEN BY THE COMMITTEE OF EIGHT REPORT, THE STUDY OF W. C. BAGLEY AND H. O. RUGG, AND THE STUDIES OF EARLE RUGG OF THE EARLY AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS PUBLISHED BEFORE 1860 AND RECENT AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS PUBLISHED SINCE 1912[33] (EARLE RUGG)

	Committee of Eight	Report Study of W. C. Bagley & H. O. Rugg	Studies of Earle Rugg	
			Study of Current Histories	Early Histories Published Before 1860
Discovery and Exploration, 1000-1607	12.90	8.27	5.81	8.09
Colonization, 1607-1690	21.20	15.95	8.91	28.73
Colonial Wars, 1690-1763	3.10	3.67	6.50	6.48
Pre-Revolutionary War Period, 1763-1775	2.06	4.11	3.50	4.32
Revolutionary War, 1775-1783	14.40	9.58	5.22	20.36
Period, 1783-1812	8.70	14.17	11.12	9.60
Period, 1812-1861	22.70	21.01	23.21	22.76
Civil War, 1861-1865	6.10	10.22	7.72	
Period, 1865-1912	9.30	14.45	20.49	
Period, 1912 to date			5.67	

The generalizations of the Bagley-Harold Rugg study (No. 40) are strikingly confirmed by Tables 67-69. The subject matter of both elementary and high school American history is at present decidedly less militaristic and more political and social in character. In the recent his-

[32]Emphases from the most influential national committee report of subject matter specialists in the subjects for grades 1 to 8—the Committee of Eight of the American Historical Association—are also included.

[33]From this table one may therefore ascertain the relative proportions of space allotted in textbooks in American history for 100 years.

tories the main distinction between the seventh and eighth grade course and the senior high school course is to be found in the fact that the former level stresses *economic and social* content more (an average of 42.1 per cent as against 38.93 per cent for high school texts) and the latter level stresses *political* content more (an average of 58.3 per cent for the senior high school courses and but

TABLE LXVIII

THE PERCENTAGE OF SPACE THAT VARIOUS TEXTBOOKS GIVE TO POLITICAL, MILITARY, AND SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC HISTORY WITH PROPORTION OF SPACE TO THESE THREE CLASSES OF SUBJECT MATTER (EARLE RUGG)

	Political	Military	Social and Economic
1. Committee of Eight	33.0	30.0	37
2. Early histories, published before 1860	38.4	44.3	17.2
3. Current histories since 1912 (four elementary and four advanced)	49.9	14.59	35.5

TABLE LXIX

THE RELATIVE EMPHASIS IN PER CENT GIVEN TO VARIOUS PERIODS IN RECENT AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS[34] (EARLE RUGG)

	I Discovery & Exploration	II Colonization to 1690	III Colonial Wars & Further Settlement 1690-1763	IV Pre-Revolutionary Period 1763-1775.	V Revolutionary War 1775-1783	VI Period 1783-1812 Critical Period	VII Period 1812-1861	VIII Period 1861-1865	IX Period 1865-1912	X Period Since 1913
ELEMENTARY TEXTS										
Book A	7.863	6.495	5.811	2.905	4.786	13.846	26.666	5.299	21.020	5.299
Book B	3.736	14.768	10.498	2.491	8.362	10.854	19.928	6.583	16.903	5.871
Book C	8.500	8.550	6.386	3.245	6.955	10.046	21.772	7.757	13.340	13.340
Book D	6.250	6.250	8.789	6.054	4.687	9.765	24.609	7.421	23.632	2.539
HIGH SCHOOL TEXTS										
Book A	6.801	9.191	5.330	1.838	7.169	10.477	21.507	7.904	25.367	4.411
Book B	5.674	5.214	5.368	4.141	5.124	13.190	25.460	9.815	21.165	4.754
Book C	3.350	11.055	7.705	3.517	4.355	11.055	23.283	8.046	20.100	7.537
Book D	4.160	9.920	2.240	4.000	4.320	9.760	32.480	8.960	22.400	1.760
Average	5.816	8.917	6.509	3.523	5.729	11.121	23.213	7.723	20.490	5.676

[34]Periods are classified in this study for comparison with the periods of the study of American history textbooks published between 1860 and 1912 by W. C. Bagley and H. O. Rugg.

TABLE LXX

THE NUMBER OF PAGES DEVOTED TO CERTAIN SELECTED SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC TOPICS IN AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS AS REPORTED BY BOBBITT AND EARLE RUGG

Topic	EARLE RUGG		BOBBITT	
	Av. No. of Pages 8 Current Texts	Av. No. of Pages 8 Early Texts	Av. No. of Pages 12 Elem. Texts	Av. No. of Pages Texts 8 High School
Agriculture	5.0	0.5	1.4	1.6
Banking and money, chiefly history	12.0	1.0	2.6	5.0
Canals and roads	5.0	1.0	3.7	3.4
Commerce and trade — foreign and domestic	9.0	1.0	3.3	4.0
Cost of living	x	x	.0	0.2
Education	7.0	2.0	x	x
Fisheries	0.5	0.5	0.4	0.4
Inventions and patents	4.0	0.2	5.3	3.3
Labor	9.0	1.0	2.6	7.8
Manufacturing and business	11.0	1.0	2.5	2.0
Mining	1.0	0.3	2.3	.5
Natural resources	10.0	2.0	x	x[36]
Newspapers and literature	2.0	0.3	x	x
Population (immigration included)	16.2	2.0	x	x
Postal service	0.3	0.1	0.5	1.6
Railroads	6.0	0.1	2.7	5.2
Religion and the church	6.0	5.0	x	x
Slavery	25.0	1.0	x	x
Tariff and trade restraint	8.0	1.0	3.7	8.9
Taxation and debt	4.0	6.0	x	x
Telephone and telegraph	.5	.0	x	x
Miscellaneous: includes general-social and economical matter and life of people	20.0	21.0	x	x

41.45 per cent for the upper grade courses). Furthermore, it is evident that the more recent history (since the Civil War) is being stressed. The Committee of Eight in 1909 allotted 10 per cent to this period, the Bagley-Rugg study (1912) shows nearly one-sixth of the space given to this recent period, and my analysis of current histories reveal that we now devote over one-fourth of the space to recent history.

It is impossible in this monograph to print detailed tables of the many specific topics, persons, and dates referred to.

[36]Not in Bobbitt's study.

In summary fashion one can but note three types of analyses that tend to confirm the generalization that the textbooks are literally encyclopedias in their attempt to treat comprehensively of the given field.

Type 1 of Analysis—Relative emphasis to social and economic topics. Again for comparative purposes the present writer attempted to verify a tabulation of Bobbitt's concerning treatment of social and economic topics[35] by a similar analysis in the current histories he analyzed. The totals to such topics in either study are small. In tabulating the space allotments it was found as a rule that there were but a few lines or a paragraph on a page given to a topic. The adequacy of such treatment will be commented upon in Chapter VII. (See Table 70, p. 127.)

The explanation of scattered references to a given topic is to be found chiefly in the principle of organization. It is assumed that facts of a given year should also be treated altogether at once, whether political, social, economic, or military in character. The organization is solely chronological rather than topical and chronological.

Type 2 of Analysis—Relative emphasis to dates. We just noted that the textbooks are dominated by the chronological organization. The use of many dates is strikingly evident in the analysis made of the actual frequencies of mention of every date in the eight current textbooks. The writer tabulated the number of times each date was mentioned. He found several interesting facts. In the first place, there is but slight emphasis to dates prior to 1775; perhaps due to the fact that but one-fourth of relative space is given to American history prior to 1775. In the second place, however, he found that each author referred to *every* year from 1775 to 1917 with two exceptions: (1) fourteen different years in this span of 142 years are omitted by *one* author and one year is omitted by *two* different authors. In the third place, a total of 454 different dates are referred to by one or more of the eight current and widely used textbooks in American history, but only

[35]Bobbitt, Franklin, *The Curriculum*, pp. 110-111.

23 dates are mentioned by *each* author *five* or more times. Table 71 is reproduced to show the 20 most frequently mentioned dates on the above criterion—frequency of mention by each author.[37]

TABLE LXXI

RANK ORDER OF THE MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED DATES IN CURRENT AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS UPON THE CRITERIA OF TOTAL MENTION AND AT LEAST FIVE MENTIONS BY EACH AUTHOR WITH DETAILED MENTIONS OF EACH AUTHOR TO SHOW VARIETY OF USE OF DATES (EARLE RUGG)

Rank Order	Date	ELEMENTARY TEXTS				HIGH SCHOOL TEXTS				Totals
		Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	
1	1860	42	19	30	44	42	42	25	58	302
2	1850	26	14	25	24	37	42	22	78	268
3	1861	22	13	18	18	34	41	38	59	243
4	1812	19	25	46	32	19	30	17	41	229
5	1865	19	17	18	25	28	31	34	47	219
6	1862	26	16	20	27	14	39	26	36	204
7	1890	11	6	8	31	17	29	13	33	148
8	1863	11	5	9	22	23	30	16	28	144
9	1864	12	13	12	14	15	34	22	21	143
10	1775	8	13	18	32	10	16	18	22	137
11.5	1776	15	12	16	17	13	26	15	20	134
11.5	1840	9	8	17	15	19	23	13	30	134
13	1917	25	11	18	14	18	14	8	20	128
14	1913	16	6	7	16	22	15	24	18	124
15	1848	11	11	12	15	12	19	7	30	117
16	1846	7	9	12	16	15	24	6	24	113
17	1820	6	6	12	12	28	9	7	26	106
18	1789	6	6	8	15	19	21	22	14	111
19	1898	6	5	8	19	19	26	7	16	106
20	1763	14	6	8	13	14	23	10	12	100

Table 71 is made on the assumption that dates most referred to tend to stress events and persons of a given period. In other words, authors tend to use more space where there are many events and persons to treat than where there are fewer. Furthermore, the writer *arbitrarily* assumed that at least five mentions of a given date by each author should be made for individual dates.[38]

[37]The other three dates in rank order are 1787 and 1837—98 mentions; and 1912—88 mentions.

[38]Raising the frequency standard to ten mentions would cut down materially the list and lowering it to two would raise doubts as to the significance of the year and also to sufficient repetition to permit pupils to fix the year in question, Inclusion of dates mentioned twice or more times would not materially change the significance of this table as far as emphasis to history prior to the Revolutionary War; it would add 1619 (but not 1492 or 1607) and also 1765 and 1774, Furthermore, it would add most every year from 1800 to 1917, which all the more confirms the generalization that the writers are disposed to treat the events in practically every year of our national history.

TABLE LXXII

RANK ORDER OF 20 MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED PERSONS IN CURRENT AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS UPON THE CRITERIA OF TOTAL MENTION AND AT LEAST 5 MENTIONS BY EACH AUTHOR WITH DETAILED MENTIONS OF EACH AUTHOR TO SHOW VARIETY OF USE OF PERSONS (EARLE RUGG)

		ELEMENTARY TEXTS				HIGH SCHOOL TEXTS				
Rank Order	Person	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Totals
1	Washington	85	104	159	44	111	70	83	94	750
2	Lincoln	52	58	113	53	84	86	49	140	635
3	Jackson	36	45	70	53	96	75	74	134	583
4	Jefferson	55	49	66	61	78	75	66	77	527
5	Grant	23	31	53	32	48	53	59	82	381
6	Clay	14	21	47	24	47	36	49	82	320
7	Cleveland	14	6	13	19	47	27	24	110	260
8	Wilson	53	8	33	22	30	23	23	63	255
9	Lee	27	33	29	21	19	45	32	47	253
10	Roosevelt	30	7	19	26	38	35	24	60	239
11	Hamilton	26	24	34	13	24	29	39	36	235
12	Columbus	29	27	49	14	56	14	12	30	229
13	J. Q. Adams	13	17	19	11	34	31	33	60	218
14	Douglas	11	16	35	18	28	27	10	54	197
15	Calhoun	13	14	16	15	31	21	38	44	192
16	Webster	8	16	41	19	29	18	17	42	190
17	J. Adams	13	13	22	12	29	31	25	37	183
18	Johnson	43	12	19	8	17	18	22	35	174
19	Madison	15	10	23	18	27	22	26	26	167
20	Napoleon	17	32	24	23	6	17	12	32	163

Other interesting features of this table are: (1) The variations of individual authors in frequency of mention to dates, particularly the greater relative emphasis by the authors of high school texts; and (2) the fact that fourteen of the twenty most frequently mentioned dates are definitely associated with war,[39] and that the other six are significant for their political importance.

Type 3 of Analysis—Relative emphasis to persons. Not only do textbooks refer to too many dates; they also mention a tremendous range of historical personages. The writer by a similar method to the above date analysis examined the frequency of mention to every person in the eight widely-used, current history textbooks. He found a total of 1309 different persons mentioned. But only 113 were common to the eight textbooks. One text refers to 400 different historical personages; another connects 335 persons with events or dates treated.

[39]Even though military history relatively secures but about 15 per cent of the total space.

TABLE LXXIII

RELATIVE EMPHASIS IN PERCENT TO VARIOUS PERIODS[40] IN ANCIENT HISTORY TEXTBOOKS (EARLE RUGG)

	I Preview, Primitive and Oriental Life	II Greece and Her Civilization	III Rome and the Roman World	IV Barbarian Invasions — Dissolution of the Empire
Book A	13.369	32.417	40.659	13.553
Book B	13.968	37.937	38.286	9.790
Book C	31.160	37.252	28.328	3.257
Average	19.505	35.868	35.757	8.866

TABLE LXXIV

RELATIVE EMPHASIS IN PER CENT TO VARIOUS PERIODS IN ANCIENT AND MEDIEVAL HISTORY TEXTBOOKS (EARLE RUGG)

	I Preview, Primitive and Oriental Life	II Greece and her Civilization	III Rome and the Roman World	IV Barbarian Invasion, Dissolution of the Empire
Book A	15.895	18.786	10.838	7.803
Book B	9.345	14.330	21.806	5.115
Book C	12.668	15.902	14.420	2.156
Book D	11.149	12.369	17.944	6.968
Average	12.514	15.346	16.252	5.510

	V Empire of Charlemagne Invasion of the North Men	VI Medieval Life and Institutions	VII The Renaissance	VIII Protestant Revolt and Wars of Religion	IX Absolutism and Rise of Democratic Spirit
Book A (Cont.)	5.202	15.895	8.670	11.560	5.346
Book B (Cont.)	8.722	18.660	4.361	8.722	10.903
Book C (Cont.)	1.617	34.097	5.525	5.256	8.355
Book D (Cont.)	9.756	28.979	5.052	7.839	Book Covers only to 1648
Average	6.324	24.405	5.902	8.344	6.151

[40]Periods in Tables 73-75 suggested by Professor R. M. Tryon of the University of Chicago.

TABLE LXXV

RELATIVE EMPHASIS IN PER CENT TO PERIODS IN MODERN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS (EARLE RUGG)

	I Pre-Revolution Period Before 1789	II The French Revolution and the Napoleonic Era, 1789-1815	III From the Restoration 1815-1848	IV Nationalistic Origins and Their Consequences 1848-1914	V The World War and Its Results Since 1914
Book A	8.528	12.153	15.778	41.791	21.748
Book B	17.094	9.401	11.452	50.598	11.452
Book C	20.618	20.274	16.494	42.611	Book published before 1916
Book D	14.473	6.478	15.625	45.230	18.092
Average	15.183	12.101	14.837	45.057	13.764

Table 72 is reproduced to show the twenty most frequently mentioned persons on the same criteria as used in Table 71.[41] Similar generalizations can be made for the historical persons as for the historical dates that historians emphasize. These are: (1) There is little disposition on the part of the authors to stress the accomplishments of American "heroes" before our struggle for independence; (2) all persons included in these authors' *Hall of Fame* are definitely connected with either war or politics, or both; and (3) decidedly more emphasis in frequency of mention to persons in high school textbooks than in elementary textbooks is found, but there is considerable variation in emphasis to various characters by individual authors.

Both for dates and persons there is evident a lack of clear-cut agreement upon significant persons or dates. In other words the books reflect an attempt to treat the subject matter of American history on both levels—junior and senior high school—comprehensively. Knowledge of scores of topics, persons, and dates is apparently expected!

[41]But 30 persons fulfill the criterion of common frequency of five mentions; lower this criterion to two and 39 more persons would be added or but 69 of 113 mentioned by each author two or more times. Recall that the total number of *different* persons is 1309.

TABLE LXXVI

THE GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF THESE HISTORY TEXTS (SNYDER)

Elementary Texts	Words per Line	Lines per Page	Total Number Pages	Number Chapters	Average Number Pages per Chapter	Number Illustrations	Number Maps
Book A	10.5	34	533	47	11.4	271	68
Book B	10.0	38	433	22	20.1	220	34
Book C	9.2	35	465	23	20.2	288	48
Book D	10.2	36	430	53	8.1	149	58
Book E	10.0	37	510	50	10.2	164	44
Range	9.2-10.5	34-38	430-533	22-53	8.1-20.2	149-288	34-88
Average	10.2	35	476	39	11.8	178	50.4
High School Texts							
Book A	11.5	42	531	29	18.3	110	43
Book B	10.0	35	630	37	17.5	171	62
Book C	10.9	37	525	31	16.9	123	62
Book D	10.7	37	562	27	20.8	115	76
Book E	10.5	35	627	20	31.3	129	49
Range	9-11-5	35-42	525-627	20-37	16.9-31.3	110-171	43-76
Average	10.6	37.2	579	28.8	18.9	129.6	38.4

Tables 73-75 are included to show relative emphasis in other fields of history. (See pp. 131-132.)

It is evident that authors vary in emphasis in the subject matter in ancient, medieval and modern history as they do in American history.

Study 42

Snyder[42] analyzed the content of ten representative elementary and high-school history textbooks to determine: (1) What is the relative emphasis placed upon the different topics or periods in American history by the elementary and high-school texts? (2) What is the relative importance of the topics and chronological divisions? and (3) What are the general facts concerning subject matter, illustrative material, footnotes, study questions? (Table 76.)

The textbooks were analyzed on the basis of 24 topics or periods in which the whole field of American history is divided by American historians who prepared the detailed

[42]Snyder, Raymond Hugo, *An Analysis of the Content of Elementary and High School History Texts*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1919.

series of history books known as *The American Nation Series*, published by Harper and Brothers. The number of lines devoted to each topic was counted on the basis of the dominant note of the paragraph.

TABLE LXXVII

THE AVERAGE PER CENT OF WORD SPACE DEVOTED TO SUBJECT MATTER BY PERIODS BY ELEMENTARY AND HIGH SCHOOL AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS (SNYDER)

	Elementary Texts	High School Texts
	Average	Average
I. European Background in American History	.818	.4
II. Basis of American History	1.132	.68
III. Spain in America	2.81	2.08
IV. England in America	8.42	5.48
V. Colonial Self-Government	4.98	4.62
VI. Provincial America	4.8	7.3
VII. France in America	4.54	3.08
VIII. Preliminaries to the American Revolution	5.26	2.9
IX. The American Revolution	7.22	4.86
X. Confederation and Constitution	2.6	4.68
XI. The Federalist System	4.74	4.5
XII. The Jefersonian System	2.94	3.02
XIII. The Rise of American Nationality	3.66	3.44
XIV. The New West	2.84	5.78
XV. Jacksonian Summary	3.36	3.98
XVI. Slavery and Abolition	1.48	1.02
XVII. Westward Extension	5.18	5.9
XVIII. Parties and Slavery	2.04	4.48
XIX. Causes of the Civil War	2.0	1.96
XX. The Civil War	8.7	8.56
XXI. Reconstruction, Political and Economic	4.72	6.2
XXII. National Development and National Problems	7.82	10.6
XXIII. America as a World Power	4.3	6.08
XXIV. National Progress	2.3	3.3

From table 79 it is evident that no one period received outstanding emphasis, though some get much more space allotment than others receive.[43] A study of this table shows

[43]Practically every analysis shows wide variations of space to periods, topics, etc., by each individual author. The writers of textbooks seemingly have but their own subjective opinions of relative emphasis to be given periods and topics, hence the reader in noting averages given in these analyses should recall that there is a wide range of space in individual books, Dawson, in a recent article, ("Textbooks in

relative emphasis to topics upon the basis of the opinion of the authors of textbooks. Furthermore, relative emphasis to the content prior to the American Revolution and after the Civil War is strikingly similar to the emphasis indicated in the writer's analyses, Table 69. The general conclusions drawn by Snyder are very similar to those drawn by Bagley and Harold Rugg in Study No. 40.

Study 43

Hubbell[44] made a study to determine "the type of material being presented to pupils studying history in the secondary schools in the southern states." Twenty-two high school history texts were chosen from the following fields: Ancient or early European history, medieval and modern history, and American history. The texts selected are used by at least 25 per cent of the accredited schools in thirteen states in 1921-22. Seven books were chosen in the first two fields and eight in the third field.

TABLE LXXVIII

THE AVERAGE DISTRIBUTION OF SUBJECT MATTER ACCORDING TO CLASSIFICATION BELOW (HUBBELL)

	Econ.	Mil.	Pol.	Soc.	Geo.	Mil.	Bio. Pol.	Other
Ancient	%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%
Average	8.6	15.3	46.1	26.2	3.8	22	46	32
Medieval								
Average	8.8	10.9	63.1	15.3	1.9	18	48	34
American								
Average	12.0	16.0	61.3	7.9	2.8	25	56	19
Average of All	9.8	14.1	56.8	16.5	2.8	22	50	28

the Social Studies," *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 17, pp. 334-341, November, 1926) likewise emphasizes variations in space allotment as follows (only a few of his examples can be given): (1) In American history, one author devoted 19 per cent to economics and another less than 1 per cent, one devoted 29 per cent to military history and another 1 per cent; (2) in European history, political emphasis ranged from 88 to 33 per cent, and military from 43 to 0; (3) in sociology, one author gave 66 per cent of historical space to the family and another disposed of this topic in 3 per cent of his total space; and (5) in "problems of democracy" emphasis on (a) political problems varied from 65 to 13 per cent, (b) economics from 81 to 9 per cent, (c) social questions from 83 to 10 per cent, and (d) international problems from 15 to 5 per cent.

[44]Hubbell, Julia B., *A Suggested Plan for the Reorganization of History Material In Secondary Schools*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, on file in the Library, George Peabody College for Teachers, Nashville, Tenn., 1922.

One conclusion of this study is that the farther away the content of history is from present-day affairs, the more attention is given to the life and customs of the people.

"In no text does one find more than 6% or less than 30 pages devoted to a discussion of the great geographic forces which have so vitally influenced the life of peoples and the building of their nations." Half of the references are to persons, to political characters, nearly one fourth to military, and the other fourth to people who contributed to social and economic advancement.

"The actual tabulations reveal the startling fact that some of the most vital concerns of a people received the least attention. For instance, out of the approximately 12,000 pages examined, but 110 pages are devoted to the three subjects: food, shelter, clothing. One-half of these were found in the ancient history texts.

"The discussion of home life and the place of the home in the community ranges from no pages to twenty-one in one text, averaging less than five pages to a text, however.

"Consideration of the great moral conceptions of the race around which our civilization is built, conceptions of justice, mercy, toleration, charity, honor, truth and others, averaged eleven pages per text."[45]

"The question of the development of systems of education is very lightly treated, omitted in many, averaging but a page or two, while the subject of religion, especially Mohammedanism and the Papacy, in their political relations was heavily emphasized." One-third of the space classed as social was in reality under the caption of "Extent and Control of Organized Religion."

"In more than two-thirds of the texts the economic and social aspects that are discussed are represented as outgrowths of the political story and are accorded political treatment."

2. ANALYSIS OF GEOGRAPHY TEXTS

Study 44

The problem studied by Wang[46] was to ascertain trends in the teaching of geography as indicated by an analysis

[45]It should be recalled that total pages may be misleading, The total as a rule represents a few lines or a paragraph in many parts of the texts (comment by the present writer).

[46]Wang, F. C., *An Analytical Study of Elementary Geography Textbooks in America*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1918.

TABLE LXXIX

THE TYPE OF CONTENT AND THE SEQUENCE OF TOPICS IN FIVE REPRESENTATIVE ADVANCED GEOGRAPHIES[47] (WANG)

Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Book E
1. Main ideas of geography	Principles of geography	Introduction	(Detailed parts of U. S.)	North America (Territories of U. S.)
2. North America	North America	The Earth	The earth as a whole	The earth as general geography
3. Dependencies of U. S.	Possessions of U. S.	Forms of land and water	North America	South America
4. South America	South America	Continents and oceans	South America	Europe
5. Oceans, polar regions and world winds	Europe	Climate of the earth	Europe	Asia
6. Europe	Africa	Race of men	Asia	Africa
7. Asia	Asia	Zones of plant life	Africa	Australia and island groups
8. Africa	Australia and islands of the Pacific	Zones of animal life	Australia and Pacific islands	Geography of the local state
9. Australia and Pacific islands	Geography of the local state	Minerals	Geography of the local state	
10. The earth as a whole		Commerce		
11. Geography of local state		The United States		
12.		North America		
13.		South America		
14.		Europe		
15.		Asia		
16.		Africa		
17.		Australia		
18.		Geography of the local state		

of the content of five elementary and five advanced geography textbooks. The content of each book was analyzed and alphabetically arranged into main topics and subtopics.

The books were then still further analyzed in order to calculate in terms of words and pages the amount of space devoted to each topic. When completed, the figures under each topic were added together, and percentages computed by taking the total space as a basis.

[47]Quoted from Wang, F. C., *Op. cit.*

Wang offers detailed tables for all types of content and method in these textbooks. For example, he presents the amount of space given to maps, pictures, diagrams, distribution of space among countries, aspects of physical geography such as animal and vegetable life, mineral deposits, climate, surface features, location, social-economic geography and animal resources, vegetable resources, mineral resources. Space will not permit us to reproduce many of these detailed tables. A few of the more important ones will be given for illustrative purposes. (See Tables 80-85, pp. 138-140.)

One notes from a study of Table 80 that about one-third of the space of these geography texts has to do with North American continent.

Because the size of pages varied many of Wang's tables are given in the number of words.

TABLE LXXX

THE AVERAGE PER CENT OF SPACE DEVOTED TO THE CONTINENTS IN FIVE ELEMENTARY AND FIVE ADVANCED GEOGRAPHY TEXTS (WANG)

	Elementary	Advanced
N. A. & C.	31.3	35.7
S. A. & C.	5.0	4.4
Eu. & C.	12.3	13.5
As. & C.	7.5	6.9
Af. & C.	5.0	3.6
Aus. & Is.	2.3	2.2

TABLE LXXXI

THE AVERAGE NUMBER OF WORDS DEVOTED TO CLIMATE, TEMPERATURE, WIND AND RAIN IN THE ELEMENTARY AND ADVANCED TEXTBOOKS[48] (WANG)

	Elementary	Advanced
Climate	3377	10664
Temperature	1601	2370
Wind	620	3307
Rain	945	2821

[48]Wang used words as the unit because of the variation in the size of pages. The elementary books averaged 88,821 words—1 per cent would therefore be 888 words. The advanced texts averaged 187,159 words—1 per cent would therefore be 1871 words.

TABLE LXXXII

THE AVERAGE NUMBER OF WORDS DEVOTED TO SURFACE FEATURES SUCH AS GENERAL SURFACE FEATURES, MOUNTAINS, LAKES, PLAINS, RIVERS, GLACIERS, DESERTS (WANG)

	Elementary	Advanced
Surface	5330	21551
Mountains	3724	7477
Lakes	646	1267
Plains	1481	4051
Rivers	3774	6435
Glaciers	237	1639
Deserts	531	779

Turning Table 81 into per cents, therefore, one finds that climate has, roughly speaking, 4 per cent of the space; temperature, a little less than 2 per cent; wind, about three-fourths of 1 per cent; and rain, a little more than 1 per cent in the elementary texts. In the advanced texts climate again has a little more than 5 per cent; temperature, slightly more than 1 per cent; wind, nearly 2 per cent; and rain, about 1.5 per cent of the space.

It should be noted that with two exceptions over half of the total amount of space has to do with physical geography, also that one of the advanced books has almost nine-tenths of its material treating of physical geography. When one turns to other aspects one finds similarly small proportions of the space given to political and social phases of the subjects.

From Table 84 it is obvious that most books are giving their chief emphasis to physical geography.

Social and economic phases of geography total about 40 per cent of the entire space of the book, and industrial geography is allotted about one-third of the total space of the book.

One point having to do with the exercises and questions should also be noted: Wang shows that five-sixths of the questions involve chiefly memory and one-sixth reasoning. In brief, they are almost exclusively questions such as what,

TABLE LXXXIV

THE PER CENT OF THE ENTIRE BOOK SPACE DEVOTED TO PHYSICAL GEOGRAPHY (WANG)

	Elementary	Advanced
Book A	53.4	60.8
Book B	39.9	64.5
Book C	66.5	88.1
Book D	59.1	58.1
Book E	48.1	51.7
Average	52.2	63.3

TABLE LXXXV

THE RELATIVE AMOUNT OF EMPHASIS IN PER CENT OF SPACE GIVEN TO POLITICAL, INDUSTRIAL, CIVILIZATION IN GENERAL IN AVERAGE PER CENT OF LINES IN ELEMENTARY AND ADVANCED TEXTBOOKS (WANG)

	Elementary	Advanced
Politics or government	3.7	2.9
Industries	19.9	22.8
Civilization in general	17.2	17.2
Total	40.8	42.9

how many, how great, name, etc., rather than questions involving why, show, and comparisons.[49]

The study shows the general conventional treatment of regional geography and gives certain trends and relative emphasis as to various types of geography—physical, social, and political.

Study 45

Ridgeley [50] analyzed five advanced geographies (written or completely revised since the World War). A total of 1200 place names was found on the criterion of use in three or more books, for "These are books most used by teachers and pupils in the study of geography. They contain the

[49]Osburn, W. J., *Op. cit.*, pp. 71-116 shows exactly the same thing for history.

[50]Ridgeley, D. C., "Twelve Hundred Selected Place Names," *Journal of Geography*, Vol. 25, pp. 201-221 (September, 1926). See this article for the 1200 names and frequencies.

TABLE LXXXVI

THE TOTAL NUMBER OF NAMES, INCLUDING REPETITIONS, AND NUMBER OF DIFFERENT NAMES IN EACH BOOK, WITHOUT REPETITIONS (RIDGELEY)

	No. of Names Including Repetitions	No. of Different Names without Repetitions
Book A	9028	1320
Book B	11577	1646
Book C	9004	1557
Book D	8302	1168
Book E	9524	1395

geographical names which confront teacher and pupil day by day."

The above data, particularly the number of different names without repetitions, confirm our earlier evidence on hundreds of dates and persons mentioned in history textbooks. Each of the books mentions at least once 613 different place names, and the majority mention a total of exactly 1200 different names.

TABLE LXXXVII

THE TWENTY MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED PLACE NAMES BY ALL TEXTS AND FREQUENCY OF MENTION BY ONE TEXTBOOK (RIDGELEY)

1. United States	459	11. Germany	130
2. Europe	311	12. South America	126
3. Asia	165	13. New York	122
4. England	160	14. China	115
5. North America	154	15. Mexico	104
6. France	145	16. India	103
7. New England	139	17. New York State	99
8. Australia	138	18. Japan	98
9. Africa	133	19. America	95
10. Great Britain	131	20. Russia	95

TABLE LXXXVIII

EMPHASIS IN PER CENTS TO VARIOUS FEATURES (RIDGELEY)

Cities	42.6
Political Units	20.4
Land Forms and Coastal Features	16.3
Rivers, Canals, and Falls	7.9
Islands and Archipelagoes	6.7
Lakes	2.2
General World Terms	1.6
Oceans	1.3
Continents	1.0

TABLE LXXXIX

RELATIVE EMPHASIS IN PER CENT TO TOPICS IN EIGHT CURRENT CIVICS TEXTBOOKS (EARLE RUGG)

A—To Show Variations Between Books.

	COMMUNITY CIVICS			ADVANCED CIVICS			PROBS. OF DEMOC.		
	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book A	Book B	Aver.
Charities	1.659	0.054	1.785	0	1.422	1.909	5.669	1.328	1.628
Citizenship—Who are citizens and what it is	0.414	0.656	1.523	1.069	0.618	1.598	0.511	0.830	0.902
General facts about cities and villages (growth, charters, types of government, reform movements)	4.979	4.978	1.628	3.322	3.365	3.779	1.858	1.744	3.206
City planning and beautification	5.912	4.704	7.668	0.675	0.412	0	1.115	0.830	2.664
Civic liberties, rights, and duties. How safe guarded	2.904	0	0.525	1.576	6.662	4.796	0.092	0.830	1.009
Civil and criminal procedure	0.207	0.437	0.840	3.603	1.098	0.145	1.208	0.539	1.768
Commerce and trade	0	1.750	0.840	0.112	3.228	3.197	2.788	2.034	2.173
General facts of community life	6.846	3.118	1.680	0	0	0	0	4.208	1.959
Congress	0.933	1.203	3.256	8.671	2.335	6.831	0.604	2.159	3.249
Conservation	3.215	2.680	2.626	0.281	1.098	0	3.810	0.872	1.822

B—To Show Average Space Allotment

Constitutions	1.346	Police protection and power	1.062
Business life (corporations)	1.866	Political parties	1.748
County government	1.320	Population and race questions	3.595
Defectives	0.981	Popular control of government, initiative, referendum, etc.	1.465
Delinquents (criminals)	1.965	The President of the U. S.	1.707
Distribution of the national income	0.480	Prohibition and the liquor traffic	0.475
Distribution of governmental powers	0.797	Public finance and taxation	3.712
Education	4.501	Recreation and leisure	1.018
The Family	3.198	Relation of U. S. and states	0.833
Fire Protection	0.977	Religion and the Church	1.209
Foreign Affairs	1.379	Representative government	0.823
Government control of business	1.618	Rural Life	0.849
Health	2.436	State constitutions	1.010
Housing	0.604	State courts	0.734
History of government	1.743	State executive (governor)	0.745
Importance of government	0.373	State legislature	0.864
Geography of the community	0.757	Social reform movements	2.144
Labor questions	6.161	Suffrage and elections	3.434
Libraries	0.209	Territories	1.252
Local public utilities	1.017	Town government	1.141
Money and banking	2.336	Transportation and communication	2.189
National administration	3.050	Wealth and resources	0.945
National commissions	0.875		
National system courts	1.303		
National defense	1.077		
Organization of society. Types, customs, institutions, etc.	4.025	Total	98.226

Places dealing with North America constitute 45.5 per cent of the total distribution of 1200 place names. Cities as noted in Table 88 constitute 42.6 per cent of all place locations and cities of North America 53.8 per cent of all

TABLE XC

RELATIVE EMPHASIS IN PER CENT TO TOPICS IN CURRENT TEXTBOOKS IN ECONOMICS AND SOCIOLOGY (EARLE RUGG)

A—To Show Variations Between Books

	Economics			*Sociology and Social Problems*			
	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book A	Book B	Book C	Aver.
Agriculture	2.979	1.032	0.735	0.064	0.406	4.043	1.543
Business organization	3.779	1.490	1.654	0.258	0	1.130	1.384
Capital	4.360	1.204	1.960	0.064	0	0	1.264
Capitalization and financing industry	0	0.401	0	0	0	0	0.066
Child labor	1.017	0	0	1.162	0.180	4.612	1.161
Banking	0.363	2.637	3.799	0	0	0	1.113
City Planning	0	0	0	0.452	0	0	0.075
Civic liberties and rights	0	2.006	0	0	0	0	0.334
Climate	0	0	0	0.310	0.090	0.566	0.161
Commerce and trade	1.598	2.465	2.818	0.064	0.135	0	1.180

B—To Show Average Space Allotment

Consumption problems	2.361
Cooperation	0.331
Credit	1.112
The Blind	0.631
The Deaf	0.392
Feeble minded and insane	1.129
Crippled	0.032
Delinquents, crime and punishment	3.171
Distribution social income	1.492
Economic endeavor, goals and how obtained	0.505
Economic history, early stage, English American	2.162
Economic ideals, efficiency	1.023
Education	2.391
Evolution	1.730
Factory system	0.238
Family history	2.487
Family, marriage and divorce, intermarriage	2.508
Exchange (general)	0.421
Family standards of living, saving	1.886
Family, general; home, size, function	0.521
Forests	0.637
General community life, cities—origin, growth, government	1.092
Exchange, marketing	0.428
Government regulations (part in economic life)	2.316
Health	1.665
Heredity vs. environment (biological influence)	3.141
History of industry	2.874
History of government	0.832
Housing	0.236
Immigration	2.822
Interest	0,893
Inventions and labor saving machinery	0.246
Labor and working conditions	2.287
Land (use in production)	0.458
Land reclamation	0.659
Large sale production	0.434
Local transportation	0.060
Money	1.896
Nature of economics	0.508
Manufactures and industries (characteristics)	0.236
Natural resources and wealth	0.822
Popular control of gov't	0.009
Population, people, race	4.512
Poverty and charities	3.296
Prices	1.791
Minerals	0.297
Primitive man	1.230
Profits	1.045
Profit sharing	0.247
Progress, social and economic	1.214
Prohibition	1.857
Production (general)	0.236
Public finance (taxation, expenditure, debt)	2.296
Recreation and leisure	2.139
Religion and the church	0.469
Rent	1.355
Single tax	0.332
Social forces group psychology tradition custom imitation crowds	1.156
Social ideals and standards	0.573
Social insurance	0.510
Social surplus	0.333
Society in general (nature)	1.175
State socialism, government ownership	1.943
Tariff	0.737
Topography "layout," geographic influences	0.643
Trade Unionism (guilds)	2.018
Transportation and communication	1.072
Trusts and monopolies vs. competition	1.365
Unemployment	0.865
Value (economic demand)	1.464
Wages	1.872
War	0.206
Water resources and their uses	0.754
Welfare—social and industrial	0.314
Women in industry	0.819
The worker	1.513
Total	99.901

cities throughout the world. The author says: "These summaries indicate the Twelve Hundred Selected Names are distributed among the continents and among the various regions in a proportion fairly commensurate with the importance of the various regions to the citizens of the United States."[51]

3. ANALYSIS OF SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS

Study 46

In addition to the analysis of history textbooks referred to in study 41 the present writer analyzed commonly used textbooks in the other social sciences—six in civics, both the community and advanced type, two in "problems of democracy" (then available), and six in economics and sociology. Similar evidence of the comprehensiveness is evident in the scores of topics covered and slight relative emphasis to each topic. It should also be noted that textbooks supposedly dealing with different content—government, economics, and sociology—tend to treat topics in all three fields. Space limitations permit us to reproduce but the first ten topics in alphabetical order to show variations in textbooks. (See Tables 89-90, pp. 142-143.)

Study 47

Another study[52] analyzed the content of social science textbooks in a similar way to the present writer's analysis in study 46 except his topics in summary are more condensed.[53]. His main table is included, however, to show the tendency of textbook writers[54] to treat the content of the social sciences in a comprehensive way and hence to give but slight attention to any topic. (See Table 91, p. 145.)

---

[51]Ridgeley, D. C., *Op. cit.*, p. 219, This generalization will be evaluated in Chapter VII.

[52]Dahl, E. J., *An Analysis of Senior High School Textbooks in the Social Sciences Other Than History*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minn., 1926.

[53]His subordinate topics of the 24 main classes total 205, however, and hence show similar attempts of the authors of textbooks to treat of many detailed phases of social life, See Dahl's Thesis, Appendix D, pp. 124-129.

[54]His sampling was much wider than the writer's. He analyzed 41 social science textbooks—15 in civics, 12 in economics, 4 in sociology, 7 in "problems of democracy," and 3 in general social science.

TABLE XCI

SUMMARY TABLE SHOWING THE AVERAGE PER CENT OF SPACE DEVOTED TO EACH MAIN TOPIC IN ALL TEXTS (DAHL)

Topic	Civics	Economics	Sociology	Problems
	Av. % of space	Av. % of space	Av. % of space	Av. % of space
Transporation and communication	2.0	1.4	0	3.0
The community	2.6	.08	3.2	2.4
Exchange	3.3	23.0	0	3.8
The family	.9	0	12.2	3.6
Foreign relations including the tariff	5.6	3.6	.08	8.3
Origins and beginnings of state and government	4.6	.4	4.5	7.7
Hist. development of U. S. gov't and general features	23.1	3.6	1.3	8.7
National government	22.7	0	0	2.8
State government	4.4	0	0	1.0
County government	3.3	0	0	.5
City government	3.9	0	0	1.0
The individual including consumption	4.6	3.1	9.8	11.3
Labor including wealth	2.8	25.9	12.8	11.2
Population	1.1	1.2	13.2	6.4
Protection; accidents	.4	0	1.0	.8
Protection: crime	3.5	0	6.0	8.3
Protection: fire	.3	0	0	0
Protection: handicapped	1.1	0	9.0	3.4
Protection: health	2.6	0	6.0	2.0
Religion and the Church	.1	0	3.8	1.4
Production	4.3	32.8	7.5	10.5
School and education	2.5	.2	4.3	3.1
The future	.3	1.3	0	1.4
Miscellaneous	.1	5.8	4.5	2.0

Study 48

Brooks[55] studied present practice in civics teaching as indicated by an analysis of widely used texts and other teaching material. He examined textbooks and studied the proportion of space to various types of topics in seven commonly used social science textbooks. Tables were drawn up which give the per cent of exercises of the following types: study questions, applicational illustrations, support for text statements, etc.

One notes from Table 92, p. 146, the distribution of space to various types of social science material. According to Brooks' classification, sociology runs rather high even in books not particularly devoted to this field. Economics also constitutes a considerable proportion of the space. Government is given most of the space as would be supposed in books principally in the field of civics.

[55]Brooks, Thomas Dudley, *A Study of Present Practice in the Teaching of Civics as Indicated by the Textbooks and Other Teaching Material*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1920.

TABLE XCII

THE PERCENTAGE OF SPACE DEVOTED TO CERTAIN TOPICS IN SEVEN WIDELY USED SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS (BROOKS)

Topic	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Book E	Book F	Book G
Sociology	16.9	15.2	23.0	35.0	0.0	62.1	3.4
Ethics	1.2	0.0	3.5	15.7	3.2	0.0	1.0
Economics	11.0	18.3	8.7	19.0	6.3	20.1	4.5
Vocational guidance	0.0	2.4	0.0	0.0	83.7	0.0	83.4
Government							
Theory, etc.	18.0	3.1	18.0	17.8	1.7	0.0	0.4
National	25.7	20.0	15.7	2.6	0.0	3.0	0.0
State and County	7.9	11.0	6.6	0.0	0.0	6.7	0.0
Urban	7.2	17.8	10.8	3.3	0.0	0.0	0.0
Citizenship	0.4	2.4	4.7	0.0	0.0	0.2	0.0
Politics	1.5	3.2	0.5	0.0	0.0	0.7	0.0
International relations	1.1	1.8	0.0	6.6	0.0	0.0	0.0
Exercises	7.5	4.8	8.5	0.0	5.1	7.2	7.3
Geography	1.6						

One limitation to be noted concerning this study is that the books chosen are not from one point of view comparable —that is, three of them in reality are civics books, two are in reality elementary sociologies, and two deal chiefly with vocational guidance.

Study 49

Bowman[56] in addition to comparing economic topics stressed in current periodicals (study 12) analyzed the amount of space given these topics in four commonly used high school texts in economics. The articles found in the *Readers' Guide* dealing with economics were used as the topics for analysis of the high school texts in economics and the per cent of space that the authors of the texts gave to these articles was computed.

From Table 93 one can see comparatively the amount of space that textbooks in high school give economics. This study also shows the tendency of authors of textbooks dealing with economics to treat comprehensively of many topics in this restricted social science.

[56]Bowman, Earl C., *A Study in the Objectives in the Teaching of High School Economics*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1922.

TABLE XCIII

THE PERCENTAGE OF SPACE DEVOTED TO THE SAME TOPICS BY FOUR CURRENT HIGH SCHOOL TEXTS IN ECONOMICS (BOWMAN)

Topics	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D
	%	%	%	%
Transportation	.82	.71	0	1.8
Labor	13.0	10.0	12.0	4.5
Finance	12.5	13.0	4.7	0
Investments	.35	2.6	3.0	1.9
Large-scale industry	3.0	7.0	7.0	22.0
Monetary system	7.8	8.6	19.5	7.8
Prices	1.6	2.8	4.0	1.0
Business, general	0	0	.45	1.5
Food supply	0	0	0	0
Immigration	0	0	0	0
Insurance	0	0	0	.61
Bolshevism	0	0	0	0
Commerce and trade	4.9	7.0	5	7.0
Socialism	6.0	2.6	4	0
Conservation of resources	0	0	0	5.9
Population	0	.96	0	0
Cooperation	4.0	.96	1.30	.10
Agriculture	0	0	0	0
Economic aspects	.47	1.9	.90	.51
Pensions	.00	.0	.00	.00
Advertising	.00	.0	.23	.21
Domestic economy	.00	.0	.00	0
Housing	.00	.0	.00	.10
Problems of charity	.00	.24	1.5	.41
Wealth	1.0	.48	2.7	.41
Waste	.00	.00	.11	10.0
Competition	.35	3.0	1.0	.51
Extravagance	.00	.00	.00	.00
The rich	.00	.00	.00	.00
Income	.35	.48	.00	.00
Manufactures	.00	.00	.00	.00
Rent	2.0	3.0	.90	.00
Statistics	.00	.00	.11	.00
Capitalists and financiers	.00	.00	.00	.00
Capital	.23	1.9	1.8	1.0
Communism	.00	.00	.23	.10
Social Revolution	.00	.00	.00	.00
Production	3.0	9.0	14.0	1.0
Profit	1.6	1.6	.90	.00
Capitalism	.00	.00	.00	.00
Factory system	.35	.00	.23	.31
Index number	.00	.00	.23	.00
Inheritance	.00	.00	.00	.00
Land	5.6	3.8	.23	.00
Natural resources	.00	.00	.00	.00
Miscellaneous	29.01	16.65	9.38	27.22

Note: The following topics omitted for lack of space—Valuation, Cost, Cost Accounting, Depreciation, Individualism, Paternalism, Property, and Supply and Demand.

Study 50

Evans'[57] investigation attempted: 1. To obtain definite information concerning the extent to which localities are mentioned in the newer social science textbooks on the senior high school level; 2. to ascertain the particular places mentioned and the nature of the material in which these places are mentioned; 3. to picture graphically the geographical features which are most frequently men-

TABLE XCIV

THE AVERAGE FREQUENCY OF REFERENCE TO THE VARIOUS GEOGRAPHICAL FEATURES IN FIVE SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS, AND FIVE SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL GENERAL SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS (EVANS)

American History Texts			Social Science Texts		
	Average	Rank		Average	Rank
States	641.2	1	Countries	142.	1
Cities	329.4	2	States	106.2	2
Countries	300	3	Cities	75.6	3
Rivers	103.8	4	Continents	38.4	4
Unclassified	82.4	5	Unclassified	15.8	5
Islands	67.8	6	Islands	11.6	6
Continents	48.	7	Rivers	9.6	7
Oceans	27.2	8	Oceans	7.8	8
Gulfs, Bays, and Seas	23.2	9	Lakes	4.8	9
Lakes	20.4	10	Mountains and Hills	4.	10
Mountains	17.6	11	Gulfs, Bays and Seas	3.2	11
Canals	6.6	12	Canals	2.	12

TABLE XCV

THE PER CENT OF THE REFERENCES TO EACH OF THE GEOGRAPHICAL FEATURES IN THESE TEN SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS (EVANS)

Features	Per Cent	Features	Per Cent
States	36.8	Islands	3.7
Countries	21.1	Oceans	1.6
Cities	19.3	Gulfs, Bays and Seas	1.2
Rivers	5.3	Lakes	1.1
Unclassified	4.6	Mountains and Hills	1.0
Continents	4.0	Canals	.3

[57]Evans, Glenn A., *The Place Element in Social Science Textbooks*, Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1923.

TABLE XCVI

THE AVERAGE DISTRIBUTION OF THE REFERENCES IN THESE TEN TEXTBOOKS ACCORDING TO THE NATURE OF THE MATERIAL—POLITICAL, ECONOMIC, AND SOCIAL (EVANS)

American History Texts		Social Science Texts	
Political		*Political*	
Government	406.6	Government	107.
International	222.4	International	34.8
Military	211.8	Military	9.4
Exploration	97.4	Exploration	5.8
Economic		*Economic*	
Commerce	161.4	Commerce	55.6
Products	52.0	Products	33.4
Industry	38.8	Industry	19.
Finance	11.6	Finance	12.8
Labor	10.2	Labor	13.2
Taxation	4.8	Taxation	3.4
Property	9.8	Property	3.8
Social		*Social*	
Migration	143.	Customs	58.4
Individuals	83.	Migration	44.8
Slavery	46.6	Education	13.
Customs	43.2	Individuals	3.6
Religion	29.6	Religion	1.8
Education	23.4	Slavery	1.2

tioned in the textbooks analyzed; and 4. to formulate a series of questions to be used in testing the student's knowledge of geographical features.

Ten of the most recent textbooks in the social sciences were selected for analysis. Certain rules were drawn up for the counting of place location facts in the textbooks. For example, titles were not counted nor were footnotes counted. Obsolete names were not tabulated. Adjectives which were derived from geographical names, such as "French people," were not counted. The material was classified under the following headings: continents, countries, states, cities, oceans, lakes, rivers, mountains, islands, bays, gulfs, and seas; canals were unclassified. Further detailed classifications as to whether the material was economic, social, or political were made.

The reader will note that references in social science books to states constitute more than one-third of all the

TABLE XCVII

THE RELATIVE RANK VALUE OF THE TWENTY MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED COUNTRIES IN THESE SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS, ENGLAND BEING GIVEN THE ARBITRARY VALUE OF 100 (EVANS)

Country	Total	Relative Value
England	643	100
France	269	42
Germany	166	26
Spain	162	25.3
Mexico	103	16.1
Russia	96	15.1
Canada	89	14.
Italy	76	12.
China	65	10.1
Holland	54	8.4
Japan	50	7.8
Austria	41	6.4
Ireland	35	5.4
Belgium	35	5.1
India	31	4.9
Brazil	21	3.2
Switzerland	18	2.8
Peru	18	2.8
Greece	17	2.6
Chile	14	2.2

TABLE XCVIII

THE DISTRIBUTION OF REFERENCES TO THE TWENTY MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED STATES IN THESE TEN SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS (EVANS)

States	Total	Per Cent of Total
Virginia	306	8.2
Massachusetts	258	6.8
New York	261	6.8
Pennsylvania	229	6.1
South Carolina	148	3.9
Georgia	132	3.5
Maryland	127	3.4
Connecticut	112	3.0
Kentucky	110	2.9
New Jersey	109	2.9
California	109	2.9
North Carolina	97	2.7
Ohio	103	2.7
Illinois	104	2.8
Tennessee	101	2.7
Rhode Island	100	2.7
Texas	80	2.1
Delaware	75	2.0
Indiana	69	1.8
Maine	68	1.8

references, and that references to states, countries, and cities constitute more than three-fourths of the total number of references.

TABLE XCIX

THE DISTRIBUTION OF REFERENCES TO THE TWENTY OUT OF NINETY-ONE MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED CITIES IN THESE SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS (EVANS)

City	Frequency	City	Frequency
New York City	250	Pittsburgh, Pa.	40
Philadelphia, Pa.	162	St. Louis, Mo.	33
Boston, Mass.	150	San Francisco, Calif.	32
Washington, D. C.	119	Richmond, Va.	32
Chicago, Ill.	115	Albany, N. Y.	29
New Orleans, La.	69	Buffalo, N. Y.	20
Charleston, S. C.	66	Cincinnati, Ohio	20
London, England	58	Quebec, Canada	20
Baltimore, Md.	54	Detroit, Mich.	19
Paris, France	50	Chattanooga, Tenn.	19

TABLE C

THE TEN MOST FREQUENTLY MENTIONED OUT OF FIFTY-NINE RIVERS (EVANS)

Rivers	Frequency	Rivers	Frequency
Mississippi	139	Delaware	23
Ohio	71	Rio Grande	18
Hudson	49	Missouri	13
Potomac	38	James	12
St. Lawrence	30	Cumberland	10

Space does not permit the reproduction of the tables dealing with other geographical features. It is sufficient to state that the Great Lakes are important; that the Appalachian and Rocky Mountains are mentioned most frequently for mountains; that the Panama and Erie Canals are the two important canals referred to; that the Gulf of Mexico, the Mediterranean Sea, and the Chesapeake Bay are the most frequently mentioned seas and bays; and that for islands, if a pupil knows about the West Indies, Cuba, the Philippines, Newfoundland, Porto Rico, Hawaii, San Domingo, and Haiti, he will tend to know the most frequently mentioned. Concerning the unclassified materials,

if a pupil knows about New England, Central America, Alaska, District of Columbia, Shenandoah Valley, Nova Scotia, and the Isthmus of Panama, he will tend to have some of the other important geographical concepts.

This study thus gives one a detailed tabulation of geographical place location facts used by children in reading social science textbooks.

SUMMARY

This chapter has attempted to describe how the earlier systematic courses in the subject matter of history, geography, and civics have evolved into a broader program of social science on the secondary level. The influence of a new educational democratic philosophy is apparent in a wider concept of citizenship training. As yet, however, those primarily interested in the content of the social sciences seemingly believe that citizenship training is an ideal outcome of systematic textbook study of the facts embraced in organized materials dealing with history, geography, and civics (even yet the primary subjects of the social sciences) and economics, sociology, and problems of democracy.[58]

The facts as to the grade placement, proportionate emphasis, content, and character of these various social studies have been summarized and interpreted. The major conclusions of the present program of secondary social science are: (1) That pupils devote a considerable proportion of their total time in high school to the study of textbook courses in the social sciences; (2) that such courses appear to be logical, systematic, descriptive, and comprehensive in character—literally hundreds of specific facts are discussed and apparently with insufficient attention to the relative worth of the countless facts included; and (3) insufficient attention is paid, by virtue of the organization

[58]As noted earlier, another movement—the so-called extra-curricular activities (student participation—clubs, assemblies, and allied pupil activities of an extra-class type)—also is based chiefly upon citizenship values. See "Extra-Curricular Activities," *Twenty-fifth Yearbook*, Part II, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926.

and outcomes expected, to the real social and learning values of the subject.

The next chapter will evaluate the present program of secondary social science, using the objective studies of social and learning needs of pupils summarized and interpreted in Chapters III to V as impersonal criteria or standards of evaluation.

CHAPTER VII

AN EVALUATION OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL SCIENCE-CITIZENSHIP CURRICULUM

THE PROBLEM OF EVALUATION

Thus far we have reviewed two main types of investigations: (1) Studies that tend to reveal the values of the social science-citizenship materials in life; and (2) studies that describe and analyze the actual curriculum in this field on the secondary level.

The second type of investigation—studies of the secondary social sciences—shows that secondary pupils devote a considerable proportion of their total school time to the content embraced in history, geography, civics, economics, and sociology, though with varying degrees of emphasis as between these subjects per school and per pupil. Few students study all of these subjects and fewer still study them in any sequential way. Furthermore, there is little disposition to provide for relative emphasis aside from the particular stress of the authors of the text used. In brief pupils, by virtue of the curriculum being a "comprehensive" textbook that they "cover" during the term of the course, tend to obtain but a birds-eye view of each of the social studies they are required or elect to study.

But the first type of investigation—studies of the values and uses of the social sciences in life outside the school—tends to reveal the materials most needed in terms of frequent and universal use. This type of investigation shows clearly—whether as yet it is sufficiently accurate or not, we do not know—that some facts, some skills, some concepts, and some attitudes are needed or are used much more frequently in citizenship activities than are others. In the second place, these studies tend to show that the materials of high utility are relatively but a small proportion of the sum total of the known content that we now attempt to "cover" on the secondary level. In the third

place, it is evident from these investigations that much that we now attempt to teach has little or no utility as commonly needed subject matter and that there is content of high utility not now included in the secondary social science curriculum.

It will be recalled that three main problems were stated in Chapter I: (1) To what extent do high school textbooks in the social sciences meet the social needs of pupils; (2) to what extent do these textbooks meet the learning needs of pupils; and (3) to what extent do the textbooks provide for relative values. This chapter will use the rather objective studies of social and learning needs cited in earlier chapters—III to V—as criteria for determining the extent to which the present secondary social science-citizenship curriculum meets the social and learning needs of pupils on that level. Limitations of space permit one to give but a few examples of evaluation for each criterion.

I. PROVISION OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL SCIENCES FOR SOCIAL NEEDS OF PUPILS

It is difficult to generalize on present evidence what are the exact social needs of pupils. But the objective studies reviewed in this monograph imply at least two main types of social needs. First, pupils need practice in learning to engage efficiently in the duties and difficulties of citizenship. Second, pupils are required to use certain specific facts, skills, appreciations, concepts, and the like in the performance of citizenship activities or in meeting citizenship difficulties. The former tend to embrace the actual activities of citizenship; the latter tend to represent the results of race experience found helpful or serviceable in performing efficiently the most frequent, universal, or crucial activities. The former are the actual things one tends to do or that one should do as a citizen; the latter tend to represent the subject matter of the social sciences.

The investigations, while as yet probably but a partial inventory of the exact values and uses of the citizenship material in life do, nevertheless, tend to reveal to the cur-

riculum maker particular items of greatest relative value and use. The investigations do therefore tend to offer some impersonal evidence concerning the things one does or should do in promoting effective social relationships in a democracy—in promoting citizenship.

TABLE CI

THE AMOUNT OF SPACE IN PAGES GIVEN BY THE AUTHORS OF SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTS TO CERTAIN ILLUSTRATIVE QUESTIONS AND PROBLEMS THAT EXPERTS OR "FRONTIER THINKERS" ON THOSE TOPICS AGREE ARE IMPORTANT[1]

	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Book E	Book F
Problem of organizing the best form of municipal government						
1. What is the legal basis of the city?	1	1	1	1	0	0
2. What are the main facts concerning the growth of cities?	2½	2	1¼	¼	2¼	4¼
3. What are the merits and demerits of the mayor-council, commission and city manager types of government?	1	4 lines	2¼	1	¾	0
Problem of wise city planning						
1. Why should cities plan their future development?	0	2	¼	¼	1	2 lines
2. What is the history of city planning?	0	½	0	½	5 lines	1¼
3. Are civic centers planned?	½	½	¼	¼	0	2 lines
Problem of providing and maintaining an efficient public-works system in the community						
1. Why is a municipal water supply crucial?	¼	3 lines	0	¼	0	4 lines
2. How is sewage collected and disposed of?	1½	1½	½	¼	0	3 lines
3. What tests should be applied to provision for streets?	¾	3¾	0	½	0	0
Problem of getting the community to organize and maintain efficient educational institutions for all citizens						
1. Why should there be free schools?	1	0	2	2½	11¾	1½
2. In what way does or should the community provide for adult education?	½	1¾	2 lines	1	2½	0
3. Why and how should we make wider use of the school plant?	½	¾	0	3	1	½
Problem of developing and maintaining adequate and efficient health agencies in the community						
1. What powers and duties are given health officials?	1	0	2	¾	1	0
2. How are contagious diseases handled?	½	1	6 lines	½	1	4 lines
3. Is the food supply properly protected from the point of health?	1½	¾	0	½	¼	6 lines
Problem of adequately providing for and improving the leisure and recreation of citizens.						
1. What provisions do cities make for parks?	¼	1	0	1	1¼	3 lines
2. Is municipal provision for play adequate?	2 lines	1	0	0	0	0
3. What is the general status of commercializing recreation?	0	0	0	0	2½	0

[1]Only questions on which five or more of the experts agree upon are included. Three questions under six of the major problems concerning community life are given in order to illustrate this method.

TABLE CII

Provision of Representative Textbooks for Social Concepts

	SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS											
	Community Civics			Advanced Civics			Problems of Democ.		Economics		Sociology	
	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book A	Book B	Book A	Book B	Book A	Book B
1. Americanism								o 1 p.				
2. Anarchist		o 1 line						o ½ p.				
3. Aristocracy						o 1 line		o 6 lines				
4. Balance of power												
5. Big business	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	
6. Capitalist		o 1 line	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x
7. Centralized gov't	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x				
8. Conservative					x							
9. Conservation of natural resources	o 4 p.	o 9 p.			o 4 p.		o 11 p.	o 7 p.	o 6 p.		o ½ p.	
10. Constitutional gov't	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x				o 1 p.
11. Democracy	x	o 5 lines	x		x	o 6 p.						
12. Division of labor	o ½ p.	x	x		o ½ p.		o 5½ p.		o 2 p.	o 6 p.	x	o
13. Foreign trade	o	x	x	x	o 5 p.	o 7 p.	x	o 10 p.	o 4 p.	½ p.		
14. Imperialism							x					
15. Industrial country	x	x	x		x	x	o 2 p.	x	x	x	x	
16. Industrial revolution			o 3 p.			o ½ p.	o 4 p.	o 2 p.		x	o 4 p.	
17. Interdependence	o 1½ p.	x	o 6 p.		x		x		x	x		
18. Large scale production	o 1 line		x	x	x		o 3 p.		x	o 2 p.		
19. Liberalism						o 10 lines						
20. Militarism					x			o 2½ p.				
21. Monopoly	x	o 5 p.	o 2 p.	o ¼ p.	o ½ p.	o 5 lines	o 4 p.	o 3½ p.	o 15 p.	o 3 p.	o ½ p.	
22. Open shop		o 6 lines	o 5 lines				o ½ p.			o 1 line		
23. Patriotism	o 1 p.	o 1 p.			o ⅔ p.							
24. Personal rights	x	o 2 p.	x	x	x	x	x	x				
25. Prime minister												1 p.
26. Public opinion	o ⅓ p.	x	o ½ p.		o ¼ p.	o 2½ p.	o 1 p.	o 4 p.				
27. Radicalism												
28. Socialism		o 1½ p.	o ½ p.	o 8 lines		o 1 p.	o 9 p.	o 1½ p.	o 5 p.		o 6½ p.	o 17 p.
29. Standard of living		o 1½ p.	o 2 p.		o 1 p.		o 9 p.	o 10 p.	o 6 p.		o 2½ p.	o 1½ p.
30. Trade union or labor union	o ⅓ p.	o 4 p.	x		x	o 4 p.	o 5 p.	o 8 p.	o 3½ p. o 3 p.	o 6 p.	o 1½ p.	
31. Wage earner	x	x	x		x	x	x	x		x	x	x

o—mentioned on criterion of appearance in index.
x—implied in content but not in index.

(1) *Provision of representative textbooks (the curriculum) for acquainting pupils with problems or difficulties of American community life.* The illustration selected to evaluate provision for problems of citizenship is taken from the analysis of the books of "frontier" thinkers, study 7. It will be recalled that study 7 describes an impersonal technic for determining the problems of contemporary life by analysis of the published works of competent students of society— scholars who have devoted themselves for years to both theoretical and practical study of the problems of society. Table 101, gives a sample of the provision of representative textbooks for acquainting pupils with problems and questions in one field.[2] (See p. 156.)

2. *Provision of textbooks for acquainting pupils with impersonally determined concepts of the social sciences.* The next illustration of impersonally determined social needs and the provision of textbooks for acquainting pupils with them deals with socially valuable concepts or meanings. Meltzer[3] in a recent investigation made an objective study of important social concepts by means of an analysis of critical periodicals and books. Table 102 shows the provision of representative textbooks for acquainting children with the socially valuable meanings. (See p. 157.)

3. *Provision of representative textbooks for acquainting pupils with topics of social value.* It will be recalled that Bowman (study 12) investigated economic topics of probable social value in reading periodicals. Table 103 shows provision of representative textbooks for acquainting pupils with a few of these economic topics referred to in considerable detail in periodicals. (See p. 159.)

4. *Provision of representative textbooks for acquainting pupils with facts of value in consumer economics.* But one illustration can be given of emphasis to economic facts shown by objective study to be of social value. It will be recalled that Harap (study 32) investigated consumer needs. One of the major phases of his study pertained to

[2]Most tables in this chapter were prepared by the present writer.
[3]Meltzer, H., *Op. cit.*

housing. Table 104 shows provision of representative textbooks for acquainting pupils with some socially valuable facts concerning housing.

5. *Comparison of provisions of representative textbooks and investigations concerning dates, persons, place location facts, and topics.* It will be recalled that studies were made

TABLE CIII

THE AMOUNT OF SPACE IN PER CENT IN MAGAZINES AND IN HIGH SCHOOL TEXTBOOKS IN ECONOMICS[4] (BOWMAN)

	PER CENT OF SPACE IN		
	Readers' Guide	Paragraph References In Magazines	High School Textbooks in Economics
	Per Cent	Per Cent	Per Cent
Transportation	21.53	11.45	.83
Labor	19.60	19.05	9.88
Finance	10.38	4.74	7.55
Investments	7.48	8.77	1.94
Large scale industry	6.45	6.75	9.75
Monetary system	5.20	7.74	10.92
Prices	4.61	6.47	2.35
Business	13.01	2.81	.49
Food supply	2.78	.12	.00
Immigration	2.25	.42	.00

TABLE CIV

THE AMOUNT OF SPACE IN PAGES (OR LINES WHERE LESS THAN ONE-FOURTH OF A PAGE IS GIVEN) THAT FIVE REPRESENTATIVE SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS GIVE TO THE DISCUSSION OF FOUR HOUSING STANDARDS PRESENTED IN HARAP'S STUDY

	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D	Book E
1. Facts one needs to know in buying a home	1	1¼	¼	0	½
2. Facts one needs to know in order to determine how much to pay when renting a home	2 lines	0	1 line	0	¼
3. Facts one needs to know about housing standards and the extent they are complied with	1½	1½	½	2	½
4. Regulative factors of housing	1	1¼	½	1	¾

[4]Bowman, Earl, *Op. cit.*, pp. 65-68, Only the ten most frequently mentioned are reproduced herewith because of lack of space.

of how one tends to use dates, persons, place location facts, and topics in life outside the school[5] Tables 105 to 108 compare in rank order the dates, persons, place location facts, and topics used in life on varying criteria with actual frequency of mention or proportionate emphasis to such content emphasized most in representative textbooks.

6. *Interpretations of social needs.* Some 40 objective studies are now available for determining impersonally the values and uses of the social sciences and citizenship activities in life. The investigations dealing with the uses of the subject matter of history, geography, economics, sociology, and civics in life outside the school show that the subject matter of these social sciences predominantly is of *service* value. On the other hand, the investigations of the subject matter of social sciences now included in rep-

TABLE CV

Comparison of 20 Dates Judged Most Important by Historians and Actual Rank (Frequency of Mention) in Representative Textbooks

Wooters' Study (Historians' Ranking)		Swisher's Study (Used By Writers On Modern Problems)	Textbooks (Frequency of Mention)
1.	1776	1910	1860
2.	1492	1900	1850
3.	1607	1908	1861
4.	1789	1912	1812
5.	1620	1890	1865
6.	1803	1907	1862
7.	1861	1894	1890
8.	1787	1897	1863
9.	1863	1909	1864
10.	1820	1896	1775
11.	1812	1898	1776
12.	1765	1901	1840
13.	1783	1904	1917
14.	1865	1903	1913
15.	1850	1899	1848
16.	1854	1911	1846
17.	1775	1882	1820
18.	1781	1887	1789
19.	1823	1893	1898
20.	1846	1906	1763

[5]See Davis, study 1; Bixler, study 3; Bassett, study 6; Washburne, study 11; Bowman, study 12; Horn, study 13; Swisher, study 14; Peters, study 15; Wooters, study 18; and analyses of representative textbooks.

TABLE CVI

COMPARISON OF 20 RANKING PERSONS REFERRED TO ON VARYING CRITERIA OF LIFE VALUES AND ACTUAL RANK (FREQUENCY OF MENTION) IN REPRESENTATIVE TEXTBOOKS

	Horn's List	Swisher's List	Peters' List	Washburne's List	Textbooks
1.	Roosevelt	Roosevelt	Shakespeare	Roosevelt	Washington
2.	Smith, Adam	Cleveland	Washington	Lincoln	Lincoln
3.	Mill	McKinley	H. Ford	Wilson	Jackson
4.	Malthus	Smith	Caesar	Taft	Jefferson
5.	Napoleon	Taft	Lincoln	Kipling	Grant
6.	Marx	Jackson	Mark Twain	Christ	Clay
7.	Owen	Grant	Moses	Napoleon I	Cleveland
8.	Gompers	Mill	Napoleon	Bryan	Wilson
9.	Ricardi	Wilson	Adam	Shakespeare	Lee
10.	Wilson	Garfield	Christ	Lloyd George	Roosevelt
11.	Washington	Malthus	Columbus	Kaiser Wilhelm	Hamilton
12.	Louis XIV	Montesquieu	Grant	Shaw, G. B.	Columbus
13.	Rousseau	Eliot	Homer	Caesar	J. Q. Adams
14.	George	Hamilton	Paul	Hughes	Douglas
15.	Jefferson	W. H. Harrison	Cleopatra	Emerson	Calhoun
16.	Grant	Walker	Dickens	Q. Victoria	Webster
17.	Pitt	Hughes	Lloyd George	Browning	J. Adams
18.	Wells	Lincoln	Peter	Carnegie	Johnson
19.	Gladstone	Bryce	Darwin	Grant	Madison
20.	Wagner	Clay	Joan of Arc	Dickens	Napoleon

TABLE CVII

COMPARISON OF 20 RANKING PLACE LOCATION FACTS REFERRED TO IN INVESTIGATION OF USE IN BOOKS AND PERIODICALS AND ACTUAL RANK (FREQUENCY OF MENTION) IN REPRESENTATIVE TEXTBOOKS

	Washburne's List	Peters' List	Textbooks
1.	America (U. S.)	New York City	United States
2.	England	Germany	Europe
3.	France	France	Asia
4.	New York City	England	England
5.	China	London	North America
6.	London	Paris	France
7.	Germany	Chicago	New England
8.	Boston	Europe	Australia
9.	New York State	Ireland	Africa
10.	Paris	China	Great Britain
11.	Italy	Boston	Germany
12.	Japan	Rome	South America
13.	Great Britain	New England	New York City
14.	Europe	Greece	China
15.	United States	Italy	Mexico
16.	Rome	Russia	India
17.	California	Scotland	New York State
18.	Russia	California	Japan
19.	Ireland	Sweden	America
20.	Spain	Australia	Russia

TABLE CVIII

COMPARISON OF 20 TOPICS JUDGED MOST IMPORTANT ON CRITERIA OF LIFE VALUES AND ACTUAL RANK (PROPORTIONATE EMPHASIS) IN REPRESENTATIVE TEXTBOOKS

	Bassett's List	Davis' List	Bixler's List	Bowman's List	Wells' List	Textbooks
1.	Finance	World state	Industrial relations	Railroads	Finance	Family
2.	Public office	Congress	Standards of living	Strikers	Defense	Labor
3.	Foreign relations	Immigration	Physical welfare	Trusts	Foreign affairs	Population
4.	Moral reform	Bolshevism	Politics	Taxation	Public office	Education
5.	Immigration	Costs	Trade Union	Canals	Legislation	Community life (general facts)
6.	Natural resources	Asiatic exclusion	Wages	Prices	Commerce	Taxation
7.	Labor	Imperialism	Race problems	Finance	Labor	Money and banking
8.	Monetary system	Employers' organizations	Education	Motor busses and trucks	Education	Social forces
9.	Defense	Unemployment	Women and children in industry	Banks and banking	Justice	Crime
10.	Public works	Taxation	Radicalism	Immigration	Industry	Health
11.	Legislation	Socialism	Religion	Investments	Political parties	Defectives
12.	Commerce	Prohibition	Cooperative association	Panama Canal	Social improvements	Suffrage
13.	Territory	Housing	Recreation	Insurance	Natural resources	Transportation
14.	Personal rights	Electoral systems	Giant power	Labor	Moral reform	Poverty
15.	Suffrage	Electoral repres.	Convict labor	Ships and shipping	Prices	Congress
16.	Constitution	Party control	"Big" business	Food supply	Civic participation	Recreation
17.	Pensions	Conservation of mines	Farming	Roads	Postal service	Heredity & environment
18.	Political parties	Freedom of speech	Prohibition	Bolshevism	Immigration	National administration
19.	State rights	Recreation	Transportation	Bonds	Public works	Commerce and trade
20.	Education	Negro problem	Great men	Tariff	Pensions	History of industry

resentative textbooks show clearly an attempt to treat in a systematic, logical, descriptive, and comprehensive manner the entire field implied in subject matter being treated —history, geography, civics, economics, or sociology. Textbooks in a given field are fairly uniform in this tendency except in proportional emphasis to given topics, persons,

place locations, etc. One may conclude that social needs are fairly well provided for in one respect, by virtue of this dominant comprehensive philosophy. That is, authors do discuss most of the dates, persons, topics, and place location facts found to be of use in the ways the average person uses such content in life. But *the main difficulty is that the authors of the textbooks fail* by virtue of this principle of organization *to distinguish the content of greatest relative value.* As noted earlier, this principle of organization really means an attempt to teach hundreds of specific dates, persons, place location facts, etc., and test results show that we achieve but partially the objective—mastery of the comprehensive content embraced in the textbook. We shall discuss this point in more detail in the next section because it directly involves the learning issues of the present secondary social science curriculum.

One of the main objectives claimed for the social sciences is training for citizenship. The present organization of subject matter in history, geography, civics, economics, and sociology seemingly implies that if pupils read, study, and presumably master the facts embraced in these subjects they will miraculously be made good citizens.

In the judgment of the writer, citizenship has far broader implications than mere knowledge of the subject matter now embraced in the "reading" courses in the social sciences. Formal school apparently exists to teach pupils to do better the things they are going to do anyway and might do if given consciously directed training. This definition of education is to the writer most helpful, for it implies analysis of the activities of life—the actual things one does in life outside the school which require for efficient performance formal school training. As noted earlier, analysis implies not only the determination of the major classes of activities (as for example, citizenship or social intercommunication), but analysis further implies the need for particularization or complete inventory of the detailed activities within each major class.[6] Analysis

[6]See Bobbitt's statement in *How to Make a Curriculum, Op. cit.*

means, in my opinion, that we itemize in terms of frequent and universal demands the duties and difficulties of each major class of activities. When we do this (as partially illustrated in the studies of citizenship activities in Chapter V), we note that citizenship training cannot be limited solely to the present courses in the social sciences. Such a limitation is not expedient because many of the activities demanded of the citizens are not provided for in the present secondary social science curriculum—in materials that are virtually but the summarized or generalized race experience found helpful in carrying on activities. The social sciences do, in all likelihood, contribute to citizenship training, but the materials now included in these social subjects are not the *sole* means; if anything, as we have pointed out earlier, this content has chiefly service or contributory values.

Furthermore, our investigations of the social values of this subject matter may well make us critical of this implication of transfer of training in the "reading" courses in the social sciences. In the first place, we do not meet or use the subject matter of the social sciences in the systematic, descriptive, and logical fashion we study it in textbooks. In the second place, such investigations as summarized in studies 25, 26, 27, 30, 31, 32, 34, 35, and 36 (studies illustrative of activities of citizens) show us a field of content apparently as yet not included to any degree in the formal curriculum of the secondary school. If included, it is being provided for incidentally, unsystematically, and even somewhat uncritically in the so-called extra-curricular activities of the school[7] This content does, I believe, have high utility in training for citizenship and apparently is not now sufficiently provided for in the present secondary social science curriculum. We have but one comparison available for evaluation. Mahan (study 25) investigated the space devoted in representative civics textbooks to the duties and difficulties he obtained from interviews with citizens. He found but 2 per cent of the

[7]See *Twenty-fifth Yearbook*, Part II, National Society for the Study of Education, Chapter II, and Rugg, E. U., "A Proposed Evaluation of Extra-Curricular Activities," *The High School Teacher*, Vol. 3, pp. 6-8, and 19 (January, 1927).

space devoted to these duties and difficulties in the textbooks he analyzed. He did not investigate provision for the duties and difficulties he discovered in the extra-curricular activities of the school.

The chief value of these objective studies of the use of the social sciences in life is that they tend to give the curriculum maker (and also the textbook writer) relatively impersonally evidence of social needs. In other words they reveal, in part at least, what facts, what skills, what concepts, and what appreciations are perhaps to be met most frequently and universally in life outside the school. While many more investigations are required to complete the inventory of the citizenship activities pupils need to be taught; nevertheless, it is my conviction that the present evidence should be utilized because it is seemingly a better means of determining what to teach in the social sciences and because it reveals clearly the fact that some content now included is of apparent low utility and some content not now included is of apparent high value.

Table 101 shows a sample of specific problems or difficulties about which pupils need to be informed. It further shows that some questions of crucial value in the judgment of the experts are omitted or are but slightly emphasized in the textbooks. In general when a textbook does treat a difficulty it merely describes it in a brief *descriptive* way. In fact, a main conclusion of the character of the textbook is that the content is literally the generalizations of the author but without details from which the pupil might generalize for himself. An even more fundamental criticism of the textbook is that there is little or no attempt to organize the material in a problem-solving way—to stimulate analysis and reasoning on the part of the pupil. The sample in Table 101, in the judgment of the writer, further shows that textbook writers tend to generalize about descriptions of theory and practice rather than emphasize situations that demand critical study and discussion. For example, the textbooks under review trace the growth of cities and review the kinds of municipal gov-

ernment but show little disposition to be critical of implications of education for adults or the adequacy of present recreational facilities in cities.

Table 102 (a list of socially valuable concepts) reflects also the conclusions drawn concerning social needs of problems before contemporary society. The books, being comprehensive descriptions of industrial, political, and social organizations, do treat in narrative form of certain general meanings such as "big" business, foreign trade, constitutional government, and the like but fail to raise critical questions concerning these concepts. For example, one book says concerning the "capitalist": "The present *capitalistic* stage that the advanced nations have attained grew out of the *development of expensive factory machines,* which makes *large scale production* profitable but requires the *concentration of capital.*" The terms underlined imply really five concepts: (1) Capitalistic; (2) the Industrial Revolution; (3) large scale production; (4) concentration of capital; and (5) possibly No. 4 implies "monopoly." Twelve more lines *describe* capitalistic but in the same abstract manner. Another book refers in the index to imperialism, but one looks in vain in a two page historical description of America's foreign policy for the direct use of the term, and a careful reading of the author's treatment causes one to conclude that "imperialism" as a concept is not adequately explained. Furthermore, there is scarcely a sentence which is critical of the wisdom of imperialistic policies.

Let us next compare emphases of authors of textbooks to economic topics with emphases given the same topics as material with apparent news value in periodicals. We note in the sample in Table 103 that transportation, labor, and business are topics that apparently "crowd" the periodical space, but high school textbooks dealing with economics decidedly undervalue them. Even investments, food supply, and immigration are issues, according to space devoted them by periodicals, but the textbooks almost neglect to discuss them. On the other hand, the textbooks,

on the criterion of reference to the topic in periodicals, are over-emphasizing large scale production and the monetary system.

Tables 105 to 108 were included to show discrepancies between certain life uses of dates, persons, place location facts, and topics and emphasis in terms of frequency or proportionate stress in textbooks. For example, there is but partial agreement between the dates or persons used by writers of books and articles on modern problems and the most frequently mentioned dates in history textbooks. The former in the date study (Table 105) sets up an objective criterion, however narrow and selective it may be; the latter (the textbook) employs apparently nothing but the subjective judgment of the authors of the textbooks. It is interesting to note further that only about half of the dates ranking highest in frequency of mention in textbooks are judged as most important by the historians used as judges in Wooters' study, and there is virtually no agreement in rank upon dates common to each list.

These conclusions also should be noted concerning historical personages (Table 106). Upon several criteria (persons referred to by writers on modern problems, in literature, and periodicals) we note personages of *service* value. Fourteen of twenty ranking persons in textbooks are referred to in the objective studies; Grant in all four studies; Lincoln and Roosevelt in three of the four. Six of the persons ranked most important in frequency of mention in the textbooks do not appear to be of service value in any of the studies. On the contrary, 46 persons not mentioned within the first twenty in the texts appear in one or more of the objective studies as persons one will likely meet in the laymen's principal reading activity—the periodical press.

Place location facts both in textbooks and in objective studies show considerable likeness as far as appearance within the first twenty on each criterion is concerned; only four (Asia, Africa, Mexico, and India) that rank in the first twenty in the former analysis fail to be included in the first twenty in the latter analysis.

The topics emphasized in several studies on different criteria of values offer apparently interesting data upon which to base at least the main core of the content of the social studies. With a possible 100 different topics in the ranking topics in the five studies under review in Table 108, we find but 57 different topics. Twenty-four of those 57 topics (implying major phases and difficulties of social life today) are found in two or more of the five lists. But only 9 of the 57 topics of apparent service value in life are found in the ranking 20 topics receiving most space in textbooks in the social studies.

The following topics might be considered for inclusion and greatest emphasis because they are found (direct mention or implied in other topics) in two or more studies on different criteria.

1. Bolshevism
2. Canals
3. Commerce
4. Defense
5. Education
6. Electoral systems
7. Finance
8. Foreign relations
9. Government politics
10. Investments
11. Immigration
12. Labor
13. Legislation
14. Moral reforms
15. Natural resources
16. Pensions
17. Personal rights
18. Prices
19. Prohibition
20. Public office
21. Public works
22. Race problems
23. Recreation
24. Taxation

The following nine topics of the 57 different topics listed in the rather objective studies of social needs are found or implied in the representative textbooks in the social sciences.

1. Congress
2. Commerce
3. Education
4. Finance
5. Labor
6. Recreation
7. Suffrage
8. Taxation
9. Transportation

In summary, social needs are from one point of view provided for by virtue of the encyclopedic organization of the representative textbooks in the social sciences, which, as noted earlier, are virtually the curriculum in this field. But this comprehensive principle of organization fails to take into consideration an organization that provides for effective learning, principally because: (1) Subjective selection of subject matter does not in any high degree evaluate impersonally the worth of content in terms of relative values as does the objective study of the use of the social sciences in life outside the school; and (2) subjective selection of subject matter, emphasizing knowledge of the

entire field, fails to select the few socially valuable items and give sufficient treatment to provide for effective and permanent mastery of such items. Furthermore, the narrow restriction of subject matter to social content now organized as race experience found helpful in either the past or the present for meeting societal problems fails to consider the unorganized but apparently highly useful activities of citizens in life outside the school.

II. PROVISION OF THE SECONDARY SOCIAL SCIENCES FOR THE LEARNING NEEDS OF PUPILS

1. *Test results—Evidence from standard tests.* Learning can best be evaluated in the first place by test results. In recent years more objective tests have been made available in the social sciences. These tests deal chiefly with the measurement of *knowledge.* Some years ago Bell and McCullum[8] tested 550 pupils in the three upper grades of the elementary school on simple associational facts such as dates-events, events-persons, dates-persons, etc. They found that these elementary pupils average only 16 per cent (one-sixth mastery) correct association. They further tested 668 high school seniors with the same questions and found that this group, after two "exposures" to the content of American history, could answer with reasonable correctness only 33 per cent of the test questions—one third mastery. Some classes of college sophomores studying American history for the third time answered correctly only 49 per cent of the test questions—not even half learning after three years' study of the content tested in American history.

2. *Test results—Evidence from the college entrance examination.* In the report of the College Entrance Examination Board[9] for 1923 a table is presented showing the percentage of examination books rated between 60 and 100 per cent. In American history the average for the years 1919 through 1923 is 40.0 per cent; in ancient history the

[8]Bell, J. C., and McCullum, J. F., "A Study of Attainments of Pupils in United States History," *Journal of Educational Psychology,* Vol. 8, pp. 257-274 (April 1917).

[9]See *Report,* p. 33.

average is 46.4 per cent; in civil government, 50.1 per cent; and on the comprehensive examination it is 32.7 per cent. We do not know accurately the ability of high school seniors; yet it is probably above average. Terman[10] says, "High schools probably enroll a disproportionate number of pupils in the IQ range above 100. That is, the average intelligence among high school pupils is above the average for the population in general. It is probably not far from 110." Proctor,[11] in a study made in 1917-18, claims that the median IQ of 955 cases of high school pupils followed up for two years remaining in high school was 107, dropped out, 96, graduated 112. There is probably a selective element at work that tends to hold a rather high proportion of pupils above average in high school. Book[12] asserts that students who intend to go to college rank slightly higher on the intelligence tests than do those who do not; yet almost as many students below average in intelligence are going to college as those above average. But the test results on these college entrance examinations show that a large proportion of pupils, many of them apparently capable of good work, fail. The writer does not attempt to say whether it is the fault of the pupils or the questions asked, but does believe that the character of the questions should be investigated.

3. *Test results—Evidence of mastery of social concepts.* It will be recalled that Meltzer determined by investigation of critical books and magazines certain concepts of value in reading activity in life outside the school. Over 300 children in grades 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, and 12 were tested upon the 31 objectively determined concepts of his investigation. Again the test results show but very partial comprehension of the correct meanings of these terms.[13] The confused, erroneous, other misconceptions, and "don't know" answers constitute 51.39 per cent of the total. If one adds the

[10]Terman, L. M., *The Measurement of Intelligence*, p. 94, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1916.

[11]Proctor, W. M., *Educational and Vocational Guidance*, p. 33, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1925.

[12]Book, W. F., *Intelligence of High School Seniors*, Chapter IV, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1922.

[13]See Meltzer, H. *Op. cit.*, for the absurd answers given to many of the terms by many children.

element "correct facts but no general idea" this total becomes 74.1 per cent of the total possible answers unsatisfactory or, in contrast, *but 26 per cent of the answers were either reasonably correct or superior*—showing a realization of the implications of each concept. Only 5 per cent were found to be superior answers.

There is a steady gain, however, grade by grade. With a total possible score of 248, we find the mean score in the fifth grade to be 27.4; in the seventh grade, 67.6; in the ninth grade, 86.0; and in the twelfth grade 158.91. Meltzer found a correlation of .69±.019 between number of words and number of correct ideas, but only .31±.032 with the grasp of the concepts. And talkativeness measured by the number of words used to express knowledge of a concept correlates but .36±.049 with intelligence quotients.

4. *Test results—Evidence of ability to comprehend the reading materials in one social science—history.* Ayer[14] developed a comprehension test by taking passages from textbooks in history used in the fifth and seventh grades. Scores on the Thorndike-McCall Reading Scale were also obtained. "It was found that a child with normal fifth grade reading comprehension for the middle of the year could answer correctly only 12 per cent of the questions based on the original paragraphs taken from fifth grade histories, whereas, with the same reading ability, he could answer 26 per cent of the questions based on the simplified paragraphs. A pupil with a normal seventh grade reading ability in the middle of the year could answer correctly only 31 per cent of the questions on the original paragraphs, and 44 per cent of the questions on the simplified paragraphs."[15]

5. *Test results—Evidence of ability to comprehend graphic and pictorial materials in the social sciences.* Mathews[16] in an attempt to discover the grade placement

---

[14]Ayer, A. M., *Op. cit.*

[15]Ayer, A. M., *Op. cit.*, pages 47-48.

[16]Mathews, C. O., *The Grade Placement of Curriculum Materials in the Social Studies*, Contributions to Education, No. 241, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

of the social studies developed tests of reading, graphic, and pictorial material taken from the *Social Science Pamphlets.*[17] His tests were given to nearly 10,000 pupils in grades 4 to 12 who had *not* studied the *Pamphlets,* distributed in representative school systems throughout the country. His test results (see Table 109) confirm other types of evidence quoted thus far: (1) There is but partial mastery of the content of the social sciences with but few exceptions on the senior high school level (highest comprehension, 83 per cent); and (2) "Ability to comprehend the reading and graphic selections used here increases *gradually* from the *fourth to the twelfth grade. This is a general tendency.*"[18]

TABLE CIX

COMPARISON OF TYPES OF MATERIAL AS TO DEGREE OF COMPREHENSION (MEDIANS EXPRESSED IN PER CENTS)—MATHEWS' INVESTIGATION

Type of Material	GRADES								
	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
Reading materials	25.2	27.9	41.5	54.2	66.3	69.1	76.5	81.8	84.5
Maps	11.3	22.5	32.5	46.3	53.8	61.3	62.5	72.5	73.8
Graphs	10.0	14.0	19.0	31.3	38.3	42.5	45.0	57.5	65.0
Pictograms	16.3	21.3	31.3	42.3	57.3	62.5	62.5	72.5	73.8
Time lines	13.8	12.5	26.3	42.5	56.3	52.5	61.3	66.3	67.3

6. *General interpretations of test results.* Various types of evidence clearly confirm the conclusion that we achieve but partially the objective of knowledge—which is even today the predominant aim in the teaching of the social sciences. And there is little test evidence as to the achievement of other objectives such as ability to think, development of critical attitudes, stimulation of patriotism, and the like. Furthermore, the tests are based upon content as yet unproved for relative social utility. Undoubtedly we test pupils for many facts of low utility and fail to test pupils for facts of high utility because with the exception of Meltzer's test, the writer believes that the tests are not sufficiently based upon objective studies of the facts, topics,

[17]Experimental curriculum materials in the social sciences for grades 7, 8, and 9 prepared by Dr. Harold Rugg and his associates in the Lincoln School of Teachers College, Columbia University.

[18]Mathews, C. O., *Op. cit.*, page 41

or difficulties of greatest social value. Articles descriptive of how the tests were made indicate that selection of facts to be tested was based upon either the chance opinion of the author of the test or at most upon facts treated in comprehensive textbooks.[19]

WHY DO PUPILS DO SO POORLY IN THE MASTERY OF THE CONTENT OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES?

Several answers to this question may be given. It may be the pupil's fault. Yet, in high school the selective process may tend to eliminate many pupils below average ability if the work of high school requires as claimed an intelligence above average. Morever, unless the subject matter of the social sciences claimed to have high value in training for citizenship can be mastered by practically all pupils, then the philosophy of democratic education in American schools should be abandoned because we now assume that formal school training is needed to equip children for the duties and difficulties of citizenship. In a democracy *all* children must be taught the requisite activities of citizenship.

It may be the teacher's fault. It is true that many persons assigned to teach the social sciences are without adequate training. Yet we have emphasized earlier that the textbook is virtually the curriculum.[20] Teachers "follow" the textbook in the social sciences, at least upon the secondary level. Hence, it is probable that it is the reading materials—the subject matter—now embraced in the social science textbooks that must be held chiefly accountable for failure of pupils to achieve but partially of even the knowledge implied in the social sciences.

1. *Vocabulary difficulties*—To ascertain whether the vocabulary of school textbooks explains the difficulties of learning, the writer arbitrarily selected the nearest full page to pages 100, 200, 300, and 400 in four representative

[19]A test of facts of social value based upon the objective studies summarized and interpreted in this monograph is being developed at present by one of the graduate students in Colorado State Teachers College. He plans to test pupils in both junior and senior high school and also adults.

[20]See Chapter I.

textbooks in the social sciences. Two of these texts represent books used in grades 6 to 8 and two in grade 12. Each word on these pages, excluding proper names, was compared with the rankings of Dr. E. L. Thorndike in his *Word Book*.[21] This *Word Book* enables one to determine the difficulty of the vocabulary of school texts. It presents a list of 10,000 words from many types of reading matter and each word in the list is located with a credit ranking that indicates its probable frequency of occurrence. The method of analysis was to place the credit ranking of the *Word Book* over each word on the pages of texts studied. The percentage of words with credits indicating that they were within the first 4,000 most common words were computed as were in the group between 4,000 and 10,000. A special list of words not given in the *Word Book*[22] was made.

A SAMPLE OF THE METHOD OF COUNT.

208 65 0 142 65 211 208 205
"The party caucus. Each party in the House of Repre-
146 208 47 14 208 114 52 80
sentatives has a secret conference of its members known
204 208 65 0 201 208 54 205 41 6
as the party caucus for the purpose of securing unanimous
65 36 300 158 54 74
party action on any important question." (Book D).

TABLE CX

THE PER CENT OF WORDS UNDER 4,000, THE PER CENT BETWEEN 4,000 AND 10,000, AND THE PER CENT OF WORDS OVER 10,000 IN A SAMPLE OF FOUR PAGES OF EACH OF FOUR SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTS

Per Cent of Words	Grades 6-8		Grade 12	
	Book A	Book B	Book C	Book D
Between 0 and 4,000	95.7	96.5	90.2	90.6
4,000 and 10,000	2.6	2.1	6.2	6.6
Over 10,000	1.7	0.4	3.5	2.8

[21]Thorndike, E. L., *The Teacher's Word Book*, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1921.
[22]Credits above 14 indicate that the words are within the first 4,000; 13 to 1, that the words are found within 4,001 to 10,000; and a credit of 0, that they are not listed in the *Word Book*.

Over 90 per cent of the words used (95 per cent for grades 6-8) are within the first 4,000 words of Thorndike's list. Spelling investigations have indicated that nearly all of the words used in spelling activities in life are included in a 4,000 word list. It is probable that the first 4,000 words in this reading list of Thorndike's are within the comprehension of the pupils. It is also likely that most of the words between 4,001 and 10,000 are understood by pupils.

But the few words per page that make up the percentages "over 10,000" are the ones worth most serious attention. Even a few such words on a page may conceivably handicap the comprehension of the pupil. Experimental investigation is needed to confirm these statements.

The following italicized words illustrate from a widely used American history those that may cause difficulty. (Italics the present writer's.)

> "When the *hatches* were *battened* down in bad weather a dozen of the poor wretches often *suffocated,* and their bodies were *unceremoniously flung overboard.* The *brutal* ship captains even threw sick negroes *overboard deliberately* because they were *insured* against the loss of their *cargo* by drowning, but not by death from disease."

The use of such words is in part defended on the ground that they are essential in explaining the topic or on the ground that children should increase their vocabulary. Still it would seem that simpler synonyms for many such words could be used.

The use of technical words as found for example in civics textbooks raises another issue;[23] should these words be used? One would probably have to determine the social use of these terms before concluding concerning this issue. However, one can state that when used, these terms should be illustrated concretely instead of appearing in brief,

[23]Such terms as *excise, extradition, habeas corpus, impeachment, mandamus, quarantine,* and *quorum* are illustrative of "technical" terms found in civics textbooks.

abstract definitions such as the following: "Manslaughter is the unlawful killing of another without malice."

Curriculum makers in the future should be cognizant of possible difficulties of vocabulary. Many of the infrequently used words have synonyms that are simpler and convey equally well the desired meaning. Such words as *agile, chagrined, excruciatingly, imposter, pathos,* and *undeviatingly* can very likely be avoided or be first introduced with synonyms.

Much more detailed study of the difficulty of the vocabulary of school textbooks in the social sciences is necessary before one can state with any assurance that learning is handicapped in that way. It is probable, however, that a few technical words, or even non-technical words infrequently used, tend to confuse the pupil. These words may inhibit his comprehension of the paragraph or even an entire topic.

2. *Other reading difficulties*—Ayer[24] enumerates other reading difficulties in fifth and seventh grade textbooks (and in part at least to be expected in senior high school because they too have the same characteristics as the upper grade textbooks) as follows: (1) *Difficult technical words* (similar to those given in the preceding section), some essential, many unessential—for example, "Because Friends speak only the truth, they do not take an oath. In courts of law their simple word is as good as an oath"; (2) *long, involved sentences*—for example, "In the year that Louis XIV was crowned there was born at Rouen, an old town to the northwest of Paris, a boy who was to place the French flag in the Mississippi Valley"; and (3) *abstract thought*—"The makers of the Constitution knew that there would surely be disputes between states, which ordinary courts could not settle, so they further decided that there should be a third part to the government. This was to be the judiciary, or justice dealing part, composed of judges chosen by the president. . . . ."

[24]Ayer, A. M., *Op. cit.*, pp. 8-11.

Examples of children reactions to test passages. (a) From Ayer: We shall quote one passage to illustrate how children react to the questions of comprehension on apparently difficult reading materials.

Original paragraph: "Daniel Webster said of Hamilton, 'He smote the rock of national resources, and abundant streams of revenue burst forth. He touched the dead corpse of public credit and it sprang upon its feet.' "

Children's responses:

1. "Daniel Webster said of Hamilton, he smote the republic and streams of goodness came back."
2. "When he touched the dead they would spring to their feet."
3. "What Daniel Webster meant was that Hamilton hit the nail on the head."[25]

(b) From Meltzer:[26] Only a few illustrations of actual responses to Meltzer's test of meanings can be cited in Table 111. (See p. 178.)

It would appear that pupils in part fail to comprehend what they read. Textbook writers and teachers should scrutinize abstract and technical language. If unessential, omit it; if essential, use concrete explanatory material—episodes, charts, graphs, pictures, etc.

3. *Too many facts implied and unimportant facts not distinguished from socially valuable and most frequent and universal needed facts in life outside the school.* The evidence summarized in Chapter VI concerning the character of the textbooks in the social sciences justifies the above topical assertion. We noted earlier that hundreds of specific dates, persons, place location topics, and concepts are presented or implied. For example about 250 different dates are mentioned, but scarcely 30 of them are common to all books or are mentioned sufficiently often to assure either learning by repetition or content ample enough to fix the connections desired concerning the dates mentioned. A committee of the History Section of the Conference of

[25]Ayer, A. M., *Op. cit.*
[26]Meltzer, H., *Op. cit.*

TABLE CXI

NUMBER OF DIFFERENT AND MOST EMPHASIZED MEANINGS ATTACHED TO SOCIAL CONCEPTS BY PUPILS TESTED BY MELTZER

Concept	No. of Different Meanings	Most Emphasized	Per Cent
Democracy	82	1. Government by people	33
		2. "Don't know"	11.8
Socialism	87	1. Does lots of social duties	23.8
		2. Political party	14.8
Imperialism	51	1. "Don't know"	43.8
		2. Rule by high person	19.9
Radicalism	84	1. "Don't know"	56.3
		2. Tendency to go to extreme	26.6
		3. Extreme progressiveness	2.68
Conservat'n	55	1. "Don't know"	45.0
		2. Saves things	14.0
Open Shop	43	1."Don't know"	16.6
		2. Door open for business	15.65
		3. Shop open and working	11.40
Monopoly	58	1. "Don't know"	54.63
		2. No competition	8.56
Industrial Revolution	66	1. Strike	15.45
		2. Revolution between industries to see which can produce most	11.40
		3. "Don't know"	11.40

the Academies and High Schools in Relation to the University of Chicago has reported[27] a list of persons which junior and senior high school should be able to identify and another list about whom pupils ought to be able to write 200 to 400 words. The writer in checking these lists with his analysis of persons in textbooks found 26 of the committee's list of 74 names not common to the current texts. And scarcely one of these writers of textbooks could be said to have devoted sufficient space to the committee's list of persons to justify an assumption that pupils could write 200 to 400 words about each of the 74 persons.

Can we not expect persons and dates, even place-location facts, to be learned somewhat on the basis of frequency of

[27]See *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 9, p. 245 (October, 1918).

mention? It is to be noted that few persons are mentioned more than five times. Hence, one might doubt that these persons should be taught or that one should expect pupils to write 200—400 words on each of them. Their inclusion probably tends to confuse the pupils; their exclusion would give more space to effective explanation of those persons which quantitative studies show one needs to know about.

The degree of correct associations of dates and persons on the Bell and McCullum Tests is indicated in Tables 112 and 113.

4. *Textbooks chiefly restricted to generalizations of the author; insufficient details given to permit adequate comprehension.* The small amount of space given to a topic raises immediately the question of how much the pupil can really learn from the condensed treatment of the content of the social sciences. Several tables have been presented to give the space devoted to various topics (see particularly Tables 70, 91, and 92). One can find fairly detailed accounts (in total number of pages) of topics, but it must be recalled that these totals comprise many subordinate topics

TABLE CXII

THE PER CENT OF ELEMENTARY AND HIGH SCHOOL PUPILS WHO KNEW ONE EVENT CONNECTED WITH EACH DATE GIVEN HEREIN AND THE RANK OF THE DATES ACCORDING TO JUDGMENTS OF HISTORIANS AND THE FREQUENCY OF MENTION IN CURRENT HISTORIES (BELL AND MCCULLUM)

Date	Ranked by Historians	Frequency Rating In Eight Current Histories	Per Cent of Pupils Correctly Associating Date and Event	
			High School Pupils	Elementary School Pupils
1492	2	126	93	78
1776	1	11	58	27
1861	7	3	44	17
1898	not mentioned	24	46	17
1620	5	141	22	8
1783	13	23	28	2
1846	20	20	20	14
1789	4	22	17	4
1619	not mentioned	139	12	3
1565	" "	224	10	6

TABLE CXIII

THE PER CENT OF ELEMENTARY AND HIGH SCHOOL PUPILS WHO KNEW AN EVENT CONNECTED WITH THE PERSONAGES GIVEN HEREIN AND THE RANK OF THESE PERSONAGES ACCORDING TO FREQUENCY OF MENTION IN CURRENT HISTORIES (BELL AND MCCULLUM)

Personage	Frequency Rank In Current Histories	Per Cent of Pupils Correctly Associating Personage With Proper Event	
		High School Pupils	Elementary School Pupils
Houston[28]	X[29]	76	62
Davis, Jefferson	22	49	16
Raleigh	X	57	47
Dewey	X[29]	51	17
Calhoun	12	41	16
Oglethorpe	X[29]	34	17
Williams, Roger	X[29]	24	13
Burgoyne	X[29]	24	13
Hamilton	9	28	12
McCormick	X[29]	11	4

(see Table 114) and are also obtained by adding all space treatment throughout the entire texts; as a rule only a few lines or a paragraph given to each topic in any one place in the texts. For example, one text devotes seven pages to a discussion of government agencies for the control of business life. Yet within this topic it gives four paragraphs (three-fourths of a page) to the Interstate

TABLE CXIV

THE NUMBER OF SUBORDINATE TOPICS DISCUSSED IN CHAPTERS V, X, AND AND XV OF FOUR REPRESENTATIVE SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS[30]

	BOOK A		BOOK B		BOOK C		BOOK D	
	No. Sub-topics	No. of Pages	No. Sub-topics	No. of Pages	No. Sub-topics	No. of Pages	No. Sub-topics	No. of Pages
Chapter V	11	14	13	9¼	24	13½	8	11½
Chapter X	12	14½	10	9½	7	9¾	19	20
Chapter XV	8	6½	10	6½	4	3	24	24

[28]High rank on test probably explained by the fact that pupils tested were in Texas schools.

[29]Not in the thirty ranking personages in my study.

[30]The writer arbitrarily selected chapters V, X, and XV and counted as sub-topics those marginal headings which the authors employ for purposes of logical organization. Even these sub-topics should be again sub-divided for explanations of detailed but socially important questions about the major topics or problems.

Commerce Commission; two paragraphs (one-half page) to national banks; six paragraphs (one and one-half pages) to Federal Reserve Banks; five paragraphs (one page) to Farm Loan Banks; four paragraphs (one page) to the Federal Trade Commission; five paragraphs (three-fourths of a page) to the United States Shipping Board; two paragraphs (one-half page) to the United States Tariff Commission; and in one final paragraph (one-fourth page) it mentions five other boards or commissions of the government.[31]

The writer would consider this treatment a fair sample of even the better practice. It is likely that a seven-page discussion will tend to acquaint pupils somewhat with the fact that the national government employs several distinct agencies to regulate and improve economic life. One may doubt, however, whether pupils will understand "Federal Farm Loan Banks" from reading a one-page discussion dealing with this topic, particularly when this page chiefly describes the provisions of the national law on this subject and yet fails to give the pupil any information about *why farmers need the aid of the "Farm Loan Banks,"* or *how these banks operate in practice.*

Contrast this treatment with the other extreme, the practice of disposing of the question "Why is a municipal water supply crucial?" in one-fourth of a page, or of giving four lines to an explanation of the advantages of the commission form of government after a twelve-line description of this type of city government. The former description, in spite of the limitations, is probably superior to the latter.

These social science textbooks do one thing—they attempt to discuss nearly all phases of political, social, and economic life.[32] They are, as noted before, comprehensive, logically organized "manuals." "Writers of some of them have consciously aimed to leave something for the teacher to do

[31]Confirmed also by similar analyses of Harold Rugg, See *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, National Society for the Study of Education, pp. 317-320.

[32]See studies summarized in Chapter VI.

in the way of expounding the book and of adding outside readings. But so many of them have been guided by the belief that brevity is synonymous with simplicity, and so many teachers share this belief, that our textbooks must in general be viewed primarily as instruments for lesson-getting and lesson-reciting."[33]

If one *could expect* teachers of the social sciences to realize that these comprehensive and logically organized texts were only manuals; could expect the teachers to use them only as "outline guides" to be supplemented by detailed, vivid "collateral" readings, by all kinds of activities on the part of the pupils—projects, debates, dramatizations, exhibits, pageants, excursions, and the like—then one could say that the social science textbooks more nearly approximated the learning needs of pupils, in so far as they attempt to deal adequately with topics of contemporary life.[34]

5. *Textbooks not designed to stimulate analysis and reasoning—to develop problem solving.* As noted earlier, the textbooks are descriptive in nature. They merely summarize as generalizations in narrative form the main facts of a movement, topic, or concept.[35] They attempt to tell students what is important rather than to present evidence or data in such a way that pupils themselves will be forced to analyze, interpret, and generalize or conclude for themselves. The textbooks are not disposed in any high degree to make the student critical of a topic under consideration. The dominant *knowledge* outcome set up as an objective[36] implies memorization far more than reasoning. The types of questions asked in the exercises at the end of chapters are predominantly factual rather than critical questions. Osburn[37] shows in an analysis of 2250 test papers collected

---

[33]Johnson, Henry, *Op. cit.*, p. 271.

[34]Evidence of why textbooks cannot be expected to be used as "outline guides" was presented in Chapter I. It included: (1) Lack of trained teachers; and (2) inadequate equipment. See Bobbitt, Franklin, *The Curriculum*, pp. 111-112, and Rugg, E. U. "Curriculum Construction in the Social Sciences," *Colorado School Journal*, June, 1924, for a discussion of the need for detailed reading materials to make meaningful the concepts and topics of social value to pupils.

[35]The dictionary definition of textbook is certainly descriptive of these social science manuals: textbook—"a standard book of instruction," Derived from text—"that on which a comment is written."

[36]See Osburn, W. J., *Op. cit.*, and Rugg, E. U. and Dearborn, N. H., *Op. cit.*

[37]Osburn, W. J., *Op. cit.*

from teachers of history throughout the country a total of 25,346 different questions[38] almost entirely of the factual sort. But 26 per cent of the questions could be classified as thought questions, and this is a liberal estimate, he says, because "some of these questions were probably answered explicitly in the textbook and should have been classed with the memorized thought variety. In addition to this, there are some teachers who use questions of the Explain, Discuss, and Write-of types in the sense of tell anything you can remember . . . . it follows that at least 74 per cent of our work in history consists in teaching the pupils to read and remember what the textbook records."[39]

6. *General interpretations of the learning provisions of social science textbooks.* Test results show but partial learning. Several explanations were suggested with supporting evidence; namely, (1) Vocabulary difficulties; (2) other language difficulties; (3) too many facts included without reference to socially valuable knowledge; (4) insufficient detail to support what are on the whole scholarly generalizations of the comprehensive content treated; and (5) failure to provide for analysis, reasoning, and problem solving—the emphasis is placed upon memorization, apparently for its own sake.

In summary, the social science textbooks analyzed (representative and widely-used "manuals") are seriously deficient in their provision for effective learning. In the first place, they are too condensed. In the second place, the material is not organized in ways that require criticial thinking and generalization of pupils. In the third place, the language is abstract, often unnecessarily technical, and largely above the comprehension levels of a large proportion of even senior high school pupils.

To interpret in another fashion the social and learning limitations of the present social science curriculum, we now turn to the third main question (and perhaps we may in

[38]The types of questions asked were: What, identify, explain, discuss, give, how, name, why, write, compare, state, outline, who, when, locate, describe, trace, define, draw map, and where.

[39]Osburn, W. J., *Op. cit.*, p. 58.

attempting to answer it suggest the solution in terms of the realities of school procedures with textbook): To what extent do the textbooks provide for relative values?

III. PROVISION FOR RELATIVE VALUES

The investigations of social values or needs give one some impersonal evidence for generalizing concerning relative values. They point to these fundamental conclusions: (1) The facts, skills, concepts, topics, and problems most used in life are relatively but a small proportion of the sum total of the particularized items of the race experience organized within the social sciences; and (2) one does not tend to meet the content of the social sciences in the systematic, logical organization found in summarized, condensed form in textbooks, but rather one tends to use this material in unsystematic and perhaps even illogical ways in performing the duties and solving or attempting to solve the problems of citizenship. Not all content is significant. Not all content now included in the secondary social science curriculum can be taught. Selection must be made. In terms of social needs the content of most worth should be based upon objective investigation of what specific materials one uses in life outside the school.[40] In terms of learning needs, this content being restricted in scope by use and even difficulty is relatively such a small proportion of the amount now taught that concentration upon the common essentials discovered by objective study should enable one to avoid present learning obstacles and provide an organization that can be effectively mastered in the time available for teaching secondary social science. *The relative value of content is the crux of the problem of what to teach or curriculum construction.*

EXAMPLES OF RELATIVE VALUES

Throughout the entire monograph we have, of course, implied the importance of relative values and have at times

[40]The value of use of material in school (to teach certain things for preparation for subsequent study in school) borders, in the judgment of the present writer, upon teaching required material for its own sake or without reference to fundamental societal values. This value for social science is apparently not analogous to the preparatory values for later school use in the teaching of reading, spelling, punctuation, etc.

commented upon discrepancies between the values of social science materials in life outside the school and this content in textbooks. In this section we can but reemphasize a few examples of these discrepancies.

(a) *History.* Textbooks in history are disposed, in a broad way at least, to provide for relative values. For example, more stress is being given to historical events since 1865 than to early American history and to explanations of historical backgrounds of social and economic activities than to militaristic history (see Tables 23, 25, 28, 67, and 68). But when one *particularizes* in detail the items to be selected, one notes certain discrepancies between life use of history and uses in textbooks.

Example 1—Table 106, though it shows 14 of 20 persons in the textbooks to rank high in the objective studies, shows a disposition to overemphasize even some of the persons referred to most of all in textbooks and to treat of persons identified with movements of apparent low utility.[41] Similarly, even though there is increased provision for treatment of social and economic content and of recent history yet there is seemingly insufficient attention paid to certain persons identified with economic movements such as Malthus, Marx, and Adam Smith. Futhermore, history is broader than the content now included in secondary textbooks in the field. The references to literary figures and to world heroes in the studies of persons met in reading activities indicate the need for a broader historical background than now to be apparently obtained from conventional organizations of school materials in history.

Example 2. The date evidence shows more apparent discrepancies than does the data concerning persons. It

[41]For lack of space one detailed study in this field will have to be condensed, L. R. Marston, H. C. McKown, and W. C. Bagley studied misplacements ("The Method of Determining Misplacements of Emphasis in Seventh and Eighth Grade History," *Seventeenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 90-96. National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Illinois, 1918) as follows. They compared the persons ranking highest in the Bagley-Harold Rugg "Hall of Fame" (study 40) with ratings of the same persons: (1) In encyclopedias; (2) by historians; and (3) by analysis of periodicals. According to this study textbooks overemphasize the importance of Patrick Henry, Madison, and John Adams and underestimate the importance of Franklin, Webster, and Jefferson Davis. The study further shows more of a tendency to vary from true measures of importance with respect to persons identified with military history.

must be admitted that the objective evidence concerning dates is perhaps decidedly insufficient.[42] But the peculiar situation is that there is decidedly insufficient agreement between the dates that competent historians assert to be most significant in life for a person to know and the dates that competent historians[43] who have written our textbooks, choose to stress by virtue of their emphasis in their "manuals" used in school as the basic materials of instruction. But ten dates are common to the two lists and there is scarcely any agreement as to relative rank of these dates. Moreover, about half of the dates in the former list and two-thirds in the latter list are definitely associated with war history, though the social demand is to stress militaristic history much less at present. The remaining dates are principally associated with political developments. Apparently the historians are not very ambitious to develop in the minds of pupils dates that mark significant social and economic events.

Example 3. Hubbell's study (No. 43) shows an average of less than 30 pages "to a discussion of the great geographic forces which have so vitally influenced the life of peoples and the building of their nations." Out of 12,000 pages examined, but 110 (less than 1 per cent) are devoted to the three subjects—food, shelter, and clothing (See Harap's evidence, study 32, upon the economic ignorance of citizens today). "The discussion of home life and the place of the home in the community ranges from no pages to twenty-one in one text, averaging less than five pages to a text, however." Great moral conceptions around which

---

[42]The present writer is convinced that the date evidence of Swisher (dates used by writers of books and articles upon modern problems) is too restricted, Obviously other criteria should be explored; for example, one might, as has been suggested by Professor Henry Johnson, investigate what dates seemed important in a given period to persons contemporary to that period. Furthermore, no one has checked in a detailed manner the dates referred to, say in such sources as legislative proceedings, speeches commemorative of national holidays, and the like.

[43]It will be recalled that in the main our textbooks in history have been written by competent scholars (Professors Muzzey, Hart, Van Tyne, McLaughlin, Fite, Beard, etc.). We take this opportunity to align ourselves with these scholars in their attempt to discover and to tell the pupils the *truth* about the past, notwithstanding the opposition of "100 per cent" mayors and other "patriots." It was further noted earlier that sixteen of twenty-six different members of national committees in the social sciences are authors of textbooks in current use in American schools.

our civilization is built such as conceptions of justice, mercy, tolerance, honor, and others averaged eleven pages per text.

b. *Geography.* Authors of geography textbooks likewise attempt to emphasize relative values, but the difficulty lies in the attempt to be comprehensive. Table 109 shows all but four of the place location facts ranking in the highest group in the objective studies to rank in the highest group in the textbook list, but the relative rank in the two types of evidence is not so marked.

c. *Other social science.* Example 1. Several studies of the highest ranking topics of presumed social value were summarized and compared with the highest ranking topics in textbooks in Table 107. Our interpretation of that table emphasized the fact that but nine of the twenty topics of highest rank in the textbooks were discussed or implied in the former lists. In other words, over half of the topics receiving greatest emphasis in textbooks were not among the most frequently mentioned topics or ranked in the objective studies.

Example 2. Bowman, it will be recalled, compared the amount of space given economic topics in periodicals and in high school textbooks in economics. He shows (see Table 103) an under-emphasis in terms of his criterion of use to economic content pertaining to transportation, labor, investments, and business (topics also shown to be of value in other similar studies, see Table 108) and an over-emphasis to large-scale industry and the monetary system.

Example 3. As noted earlier, Mahan (study 25), after obtaining a relatively impersonal list of duties and difficulties of "lay" citizens, analyzed representative textbooks to discover to what extent such items were treated. Upon two careful analyses (an original and a re-check) he found but 2 per cent of the space in these textbooks devoted to these duties. It may be concluded that if the books do not treat with any high degree of emphasis the duties and difficulties of value for the average citizen their content is descriptive of the value of specialized content of govern-

ment officers. This is exactly what characterizes civics textbooks—they emphasize the powers and activities of government officers which are principally of indirect concern to most citizens[44] and neglect the immediate duties of the average citizen.

Example 4. Disparities in relative emphases are likewise confirmed by Goss' study (No. 31). It will be recalled that Goss collected actual examples of civic contacts that adults had had. Table 115 shows these disparities. Nearly three-fourths of civic transactions of average citizens have

TABLE CXV

THE PER CENT OF SPACE DEVOTED TO CIVICS TEXTBOOKS TO CIVIC TRANSACTIONS DEALING WITH INTERNATIONAL, NATIONAL, STATE, AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT (GOSS)

	International	National	State	Municipal	County	Township
Textbooks	4.45	57.90	15.10	8.10	2.60	3.75
Civic transactions in life outside of school	0	15.80	11.10	38.90	19.40	14.80

to do with local government (contacts with municipal, township, or county government). One would expect that general civics books would emphasize local government. Yet Table 115 shows that local government receives less than 15 per cent of the total emphasis.

Example 5. A final comparison has to do with legal information needed by the layman (Alderman, study 30). Alderman finds from analysis of court records that the layman should understand[45] the general principles of contracts, damage cases, and settling estates. He checked this type of needed legal information against similar material

[44] I would not gainsay teaching pupils the principal facts concerning the machinery of our government. Such content is valuable as a part of one's general knowledge of government. My quarrel is that these books (almost the sole vehicle at present for teaching citizenship) neglect the duties and difficulties of the *average* citizen—many duties and difficulties which cannot probably effectively be mastered without conscious school training.

[45] This does not mean that the layman should be technically equipped as a lawyer but rather that he should know when to consult a technician. The writer was told some years ago that in one state legal knowledge was assumed as a prerogative of every citizen. The requirements for admission to the bar in that state being: (1) twenty-one years of age and (2) of good moral character. This condition apparently was based upon the democratic philosophy that any American citizen resident in that state should be able to plead his own case.

found in twenty textbooks in civics. He concluded that there is a wide disparity between the type of information that the analysis of the courts' records shows is most frequently needed by the layman and the type of material that textbooks present about the courts. Textbooks discuss such points as how laws are made, kinds of law, court procedure, etc. These facts are apparently of less direct value to the layman than the type of material uncovered by Alderman.

INTERPRETATIONS

These illustrations of relative values all imply that the authors of textbooks by virture of their present organization and principles of selecting content have failed sufficiently to emphasize the particular items of content that have objectively determined value. One is inclined to generalize that where authors do emphasize content proportionately with life usages of the material in question, it is largely by chance.

The most fundamental point is that the comprehensive, bird's-eye view of knowledge philosophy of organization should be abandoned. Relative values as a concept demands that curriculum makers select the *most important* material from the entire field. These analyses have shown in considerable detail that scholars, however competent they may be in attempting to tell the truth, must utilize more critical bases for selecting what they teach. This is crucial because much now included is of little value and there is much content underemphasized or even omitted that has far higher utility than the materials now included in the secondary social science curriculum. It is also important because a critical basis of selection means objective study of how we use these materials in life. This evidence, once obtained in a complete inventory of the values and uses of the social science-citizenship content in life outside the school, will tend to permit us to concentrate upon a small body of material. Hence learning can be better provided for.

SUMMARY

The writer has attempted in part to illustrate by use of relatively objective evidence and comparisons the extent to which the present social science and citizenship courses meet social and learning needs. Illustrations of certain weaknesses in both respects—social and learning organization—have been pointed out.

Curriculum-makers, particularly authors of textbooks, can well afford to study with great care the evidence concerning the proper content of the citizenship curriculum and also concerning proper organization for effective learning.

All curriculum-makers and authors of textbooks assert that the problem of *selection or rejection of content* is the *paramount problem.* Is it not expedient for them to select for inclusion that content found by use of relatively impersonal research to be of greatest social value?

If the writer of this report interprets correctly the one outstanding result of employing semi-scientific methods for determining what should be included in the curriculum, it is that the proportion of content socially valuable in *terms of frequent, universal, or crucial use* is relatively *small* compared to the *sum total of human knowledge in that field.* One might well employ this rather objective evidence in determining relative values. Then probably one will not have to teach too many items. And from then on one will be in a better position to give details about the items ascertained in objective ways to be of social value. It is the writer's conviction that pupils will then have opportunities, in terms of the laws of learning and the known facts of distributed practice in learning, to make such content a permanent part of their equipment in the great task of being *efficient, intelligent,* and *informed citizens.* Finally, when this is done, one can perhaps demand the *permanent* mastery of *every* activity involved in engaging efficiently in the duties of citizenship, and one can also demand that pupils exhibit skill in handling the problems, issues, and questions of contemporary society.

CHAPTER VIII

CONCLUSIONS

This monograph has attempted to present in summary form the theory and practice of the social science-citizenship curriculum in secondary schools. It has further attempted to evaluate this aspect of the school curriculum by utilizing the semi-scientific studies of the values of citizenship as the impersonal evidence upon which to measure the adequacy of this training in junior and senior high schools. In brief, the thesis of this monograph is that theoretical or hypothetical objectives and values concerning training for citizenship, particularly the province of the social sciences, should be verified by semi-scientific methods of investigation and measurement.

Up to the present time chief reliance for citizenship training has been placed upon the organization of rather comprehensive and logical "reading" courses in history, geography, and civics. Such courses were rather well organized prior to the Civil War. Textbooks determined rather definitely what was taught. The theoretical aims and objectives of these courses then were similar to these aims claimed as resultants of the study of these subjects today. Since about 1892 committee procedure has been the dominant method of curriculum making. Since that time several important committees, composed chiefly of specialists in subject matter, have outlined the content of the courses in the social sciences, both by means of syllabi and textbooks. Their activity has resulted in a marked standardization of the citizenship courses *offered* in grades 7 to 12. The past twenty years has brought about a change of emphasis from an exclusive stress upon history and geography to a broader emphasis upon many aspects of social studies and social activities. The concept of citizenship training has been expanded from one of memory of the facts of history, civics, and geography to one seeking to provide not only for a variety of reading courses in the

social sciences but also for opportunities for pupil participation in all school activities that contribute to training boy and girl citizens in secondary schools.[1]

What does one learn from a study of the history of the development of the social science-citizenship curriculum? It is evident that curriculum-makers and teachers see more clearly all aspects of the problem of citizenship training today. The provision for a much wider variety of reading materials and for training in social activities in the schools indicate that those interested to provide effectively for this general problem realize that citizenship training must include all aspects of the duties, difficulties, and qualities of citizens. And the experimental evidence concerning learning, acquired particularly since 1900, enables one to organize the program of citizenship training to approximate more nearly the needs, interests, and abilities of pupil citizens in secondary schools.

What is the theory and practice in the organization of the social science-citizenship curriculum? Until recently, as was noted above, the chief theory was that a study of "reading" courses in history, geography, and civics, would provide for effective citizenship training. It was also believed that such courses should be comprehensive, systematic, and logically organized and that all pupils should take these courses. Hence, a survey of the practice, based upon representative question-blank studies, and upon careful and detailed analyses of the chief index of what is taught in these courses—the textbooks in common use—reveals the fact that a reading of the facts of history, principally pertaining to the United States, of regional geography and of civics dealing chiefly with the machinery of government constituted until recent years at least almost the sole opportunity for boys and girls to gain the necessary training for citizenship. And to make this practice still more deficient it should be noted that relatively few pupils took *all* of the "reading" courses provided because not *all* divisions of the social studies were *required* of *all pupils*.

[1]For detailed evidence concerning this paragraph, see Chapter IV, *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II.

Moreover, certain considerations have handicapped the effectiveness of citizenship training. The inadequate preparation of teachers, the reliance upon the study of comprehensive and descriptive reading materials contrasted with the fact that social-civic materials used in life are not organized logically nor are they systematic and comprehensive, lack of proper equipment, vagueness of the purposes to be accomplished, and how to verify their accomplishment —all these points probably hindered very considerably the effectiveness of the school program of citizenship training.

On the other hand, the results of the research summarized in this monograph and a clearer understanding of the scope of the problem as evidenced in provision for a more varied citizenship training program can well make one optimistic that the application of the results of this research and what are probably theories more in accordance with the needs of present-day society will enable curriculum-makers to adapt better the content of social science-citizenship courses to the impersonally ascertained social and learning needs of boys and girls in secondary schools.

What criteria shall be used for selecting the content to be included in social science and citizenship courses? This question must be answered first in terms of the characteristics of community life today and in terms of the implications of democracy in a society such as ours. The major hypothesis accepted by the present writer is that the task of the school is to help boys and girls do well the socially desirable things that they will do anyway and to help them do well the more desirable things. It should be noted that pupils will engage in activities in a type of community life that is cooperative, interdependent, and predominantly *social*. Pupils will need facts, concepts, skills, and appreciations involved in moving them from the relatively low levels of incidental and undirected experience, that can be objectively determined, to similarly ascertained standards of relatively high levels of ideal conduct.

The old criterion of knowledge is insufficient because it largely assumes that knowledge is a virtue, or that knowl-

edge of what to do implies the performance of the needed act. Such is not necessarily the case; transfer cannot be justified as a primary criterion, according to the conclusions of experimental psychology. If transfer is a value it will be probably contingent to other more crucial values. Preparation in the sense of deferred values is equally deficient as a justification of subject matter.

It is the conviction of the author that the criterion of use in its widest sense, i.e., both instrumental use and intrinsic use, is the primary value upon which to select content for inclusion in the citizenship curriculum. Social utility or use in its wider connotation has several implications. It is broader than the ideal of giving essential skills to do well the things one does and should do. It may involve appreciations of the value so that a recognition of use is more apparent to the learner. Similarly facts or skills commonly justified for their preparatory value—as aids to the acquisition of subsequent facts and skills—possess a modicum of utilitarian value. The learner recognizes the worth of acquiring them. And even conventional matters taught because they "tag" one as educated or cultured are useful; they enable one to get along more effectively and to do better the things one does and should do. In this wide sense, then, one may well seek first of all the facts, concepts, problems, skills, attitudes, tastes, and ideals that one needs or that one will use. But second, this does not imply that other criteria should not be used for increasing the justification of the curriculum materials selected.

And it is equally obvious that in addition to the values of the content selected one must adapt the materials to the community and to the learner. This issue whether material shall be studied by *all* pupils or whether it shall be *required* of all, involves necessarily the known facts of the peculiar needs of each community and each child. The experiences and activities that can be shown to be valuable for efficient participation in a democracy should, of course, be permanently mastered by every boy and girl citizen.

A final issue of the criteria to be used in the selection of content involves: Should one select materials in terms of the needs of adults or in terms of children's needs? The writer gives herewith an approximation of this issue: that curriculum-makers should be concerned to equip pupils to engage efficiently in adult activities but they also should be cognizant of the fact that one, having determined the objectives of adult society, must recognize the proved facts of learning and start with the interests and capacities of pupils. As Bonser says, "Whatever contributes to child life is almost certain to be of value in adult life." The activities and experiences must be real to the pupil even though their greatest significance is their value to adults. Thus, needs have both a present and future reference.

What are the theoretical or tentative objectives or values claimed for the study of the social sciences? The outstanding objectives or aims as revealed from a study of the opinions of specialists in content and from courses of study were classed as follows: (1) Acquisition of knowledge; (2) the general objective-citizenship training; (3) methods of study and training in the use of books; (4) training certain "powers" such as memory, judgment, and imagination; (5) inculcation of patriotism; (6) broadening the pupil's point of view; (7) training in seeing and understanding causal relationships; and (8) a series of miscellaneous aims.

The compendium of knowledge value is evident in such statements as "to know the history of a people," or "to equip the student with a store of historical information." The disciplinary value appears when scholars justify material for the training of the memory, judgment, and imagination. And conventional and leisure values are implied by some writers as justifications of the material when they assert that these studies contribute to satisfy conventional demands or serve to develop one's tastes and interests in voluntary reading. Socializing elements, as well as sentiments of patriotism, are evident from assertions that these studies "promote a love of one's country," "foster a feeling of nationalism," or "enlarge the pupil's point of view."

The writer has called these values theoretical or tentative aims because until recently there has been little effort to discover if the study of the content embraced in the social science courses eventuates in the outcomes claimed. Until these tentative values are *verified*, they are probably little more than "faith" aims.

Thus far the major conclusions concerning the theory and practice of the traditional method of curriculum making have been given. We now turn to the conclusions to be drawn from the results of new methods of research as found in the relatively objective curriculum studies pertaining to citizenship.

How shall one determine the persistent and insistent problems and issues to be studied in the social science curriculum? Four impersonal methods for determining problems were illustrated: (1) The analysis of topics and problems discussed by newspapers and magazines; (2) the jugment of "lay" citizens; (3) the statements of problems found in political platforms; and (4) the judgment of "frontier" thinkers, specialists in the study of society.

The best method to use, in the opinion of the writer, is No. 4, the judgment of the specialists. It is the writer's opinion that the layman is not sufficiently qualified to determine problems because the problems of society are highly technical; they require detailed study and diagnosis by experts. The average citizen's training and background is not sufficient for this. Indeed it takes the collective judgment of many specialists, each predicting problems in his particular field of special study, to determine at all adequately the persistent and insistent issues of today. Results of the first three methods give further evidence of the inadequacy of such methods. The employment of these methods tends to give one the broad, general and obvious issues—things necessarily inherent in community life. But they fail to give the particularized issues within each major class of problems. These specialists or "frontier" thinkers have devoted their energy for years to the many subordinate problems, issues, and questions involved. Thus

analysis of the published writings of these specialists in the study of society probably constitutes the most convenient and the most reliable source for a statement of the permanent, insistent problems. These men are out on the "frontier"; from their research one can gain evidence of the needs of society today and suggested solutions of these problems. They are technicians to be used just as society uses technicians in medicine, engineering, and science. Thus, if one wishes to determine the problems that pupils should be made acquainted with and from which they should gain practice in critical thinking—a crucial activity of citizens in a democracy—one should probably use the published writings of these technicians who are, in reality, specialists in the study of society.

How shall one select the facts embraced in citizenship courses that are most important? Under the compendium of knowledge value the practice was to teach many facts; in fact, the results of this practice are exemplified in the low degree of permanent mastery of the citizenship facts taught.

This condition brought about a movement to discover the common essentials of greatest relative value. Necessarily curriculum makers were forced to set up hypotheses for determining which facts should constitute the *minimal* list. The major hypothesis presented is largely a utilitarian one. Curriculum makers raised the question: How does one *use* in life outside the school the facts commonly taught in social science courses? The main answer is that one uses these facts principally in reading and conversation. Because it is much more difficult to determine which facts are most used in conversation, research workers turned to analysis of the reading activities of citizens. And it is a known fact that periodicals—newspapers and magazines —constitute the main reading of "lay" citizens. Thus these workers assert as the major hypothesis for the determination of minimal essential facts that the allusions or references to facts in periodicals constitute to a large extent the best source of useful or socially valuable facts.

Turning to analysis of periodicals it is found that the facts referred to frequently are relatively speaking only a small part of the sum total of human knowledge in those fields. And hence research workers assert that facts frequently alluded to tend to constitute the common essential lists of facts that are socially valuable.

This does not imply that other facts should not be taught but the socially valuable facts are those ascertained to be of use to *everyone.* And because the useful facts are relatively few, it is probable that an emphasis on the mastery of the useful facts will result in an improvement in the interpretative ability of citizens concerning problems of citizenship. This last statement rests upon the fact that there seems to be some correlation between ability to remember and ability to think. Hence, when one determines impersonally the most crucial problems and facts, curriculum-makers and teachers have material at hand from which to provide needed citizenship training. The organization and teaching of these materials is not entirely a curriculum problem but also involves problems of learning.

The hypothesis that references to facts in periodicals is our chief means of determining the value of facts has been challenged upon the ground that some of the most widely-read periodicals possess few allusions, and hence one cannot predict *common* needs from analysis of these periodicals. This objection is answered in part at least by pointing to the fact that the curriculum-makers are necessarily concerned with standards or goals. In this case the probable standard is to discover what the reading of citizens *ought to be.* It is the writer's conviction that if we teach the impersonally ascertained facts that the more informed citizens now read in critical periodicals we will tend to set up better standards of informative materials. Then *all* children will tend to be equipped to read throughout life intelligently the materials calling for the interpretation of facts dealing with history, geography, civics, economics, and sociology.

What criteria are to be used in determining activities of citizens? The problem here is to discover the bases de-

termining the things that persons do and should do that pertain to citizenship. One may well ask: What are the duties of citizens? The studies summarized in Chapter V illustrated certain modes of living and activities of citizens. For example, it was shown that citizens have certain contacts with various divisions of their government. These deal predominantly with local affairs. The economic needs of citizens were stressed. The hypothetical abilities of citizens were suggested, the civic activities reflected in periodicals were canvassed, and certain other types of citizenship activities were also discussed. The chief criterion for determining what are the activities of citizens is found by analysis. Only by complete, detailed inventories, following this technique, will one probably obtain with any certainty and finality the *particularized* objectives that are crucial to a complete curriculum, fitted to the needs of the citizens of today and tomorrow. Also in the shortcomings and deficiencies of citizens as well as in impersonally determined goals will one tend to find the need for *directed* citizenship training. The curriculum apparently includes the facts, skills, and appreciations that will move people up the scale from objectively determined deficiencies in the performance of activities to the scientific standards of the ways that people should perform these activities, in so far as the pupils' capacities and interests permit them to be lifted.

Illustrations of relatively objective methods for determining what the social science-citizenship curriculum should be have been given. This summary is also concerned to draw the main conclusions from the use of these objective studies as the evidence upon which to evaluate these courses; to discover, in part at least, whether the present citizenship curriculum tends to meet the social and learning needs of boys and girls in secondary schools and whether the theoretical objectives are realized.

What evidence is there concerning the extent to which tentative aims and objectives are realized? Measurement thus far has confined itself principally to the amount of information retained. Tests dealing with information are easiest to organize and to give. The most obvious thing

to be noted is that the results of these tests show a relatively low degree of permanent mastery. We do not even realize the knowledge aim to any great extent. The reason probably is: we have taught *too many facts*. Until recently we have not been in a position to know which facts are of *greatest* value. Indeed, tests are not yet as a rule based upon these detailed investigations of socially valuable facts.

Tests involving thinking, inference, judgment, and problem solving are so few and the results of giving such tests are so slight that one cannot conclude definitely concerning these aims. If the theory that there is a marked relationship between ability to remember and ability to think is sound, then it would probably be expedient to emphasize first of all the mastery of information; of course having ascertained it to be the socially valuable information. The development of reasoning and problem solving ability would then be a subsequent task.

Tests for other values are few and crude as yet. But the hypothesis of Thorndike that whatever exists in amount can be measured should stimulate research workers to attempt to test other objectives. It is probable that various types of technic will have to be developed. For example, the studies of Upton and Chassell[2] show possibilities in the method of testing citizenship traits by rating cards. Also for certain objectives what might be termed performance tests will probably have to be used. Actual ability to use books and reference materials along lines indicated in the Finch[3] study and the tests of Voelker[4] are examples of *specific performance tests*. These methods are worthy of study. They should be adapted even more to the verification of the values claimed for the study of the social sciences and citizenship activities. Up to date one must conclude that but a beginning has been made in verifying the tentative aims or values of these courses.

---

[2]Upton, S. M., and Chassell, C. F., "A Scale for Measuring the Importance of Habits of Good Citizenship," *Teachers College Record*, Vol. 20, pp. 36-65 (January, 1919).

[3]Finch, C. E., "Junior High School Study Tests," *The School Review*, Vol. 20, pp. 220-236 (March, 1920).

[4]Voelker, P. F., *The Function of Ideals in Social Education*, Contributions to Education, No. 112, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1921.

To what extent do social science and citizenship courses meet social and learning needs of boys and girls in secondary schools? While there has been a marked improvement in recent years, following the widened concept of what is essential to proper citizenship training, yet one is forced to conclude that the present curriculum is seriously deficient in providing effectively for both social and learning needs.

Many of the problems, facts, and activities found by investigation to be probable social needs of citizens are not now included in the present curriculum. And, on the other hand, there is much in present courses that does not appear to be justified when one actually investigates social needs. The assumption that the courses should be comprehensive accounts in large measure for this deficiency. But the fact that until recently curriculum-makers have "leaped" from aims to the accumulated *specialized knowledge of each field*[5] *also explains this deficiency.* Our new hypotheses which demand that we particularize the things we do pertaining to citizenship and that we investigate the social needs of citizens seem likely to result in a reorganization of the social science curriculum more nearly approximating the social needs of citizens.

The learning aspect of the question is equally serious. The present curriculum, based principally upon the hypothesis of the value of systematic, comprehensive knowledge and of training or formal discipline, has necessarily included *too many facts.* The child cannot retain this vast mass of materials. When the content is encyclopedic, each important concept is necessarily condensed. Yet children in all probability learn best from details; the materials must be not only detailed but they must be organized in such a way that children will learn to generalize from the details. The main points—the conclusions—are crucial. Yet conclusions, as found in our present courses, tend to be abstract and without the experiences of the pupils.

The known facts of learning—how connections are formed, what problem solving is and how one can solve

[5]See Charters, W. W., *Op. cit.*, p. 7.

problems, as well as the value of reading as vicarious experience, and the principles of distributed practice in learning—are but a few of the crucial matters of learning that are largely violated in the organization of our present "reading" courses. Equally important is an understanding of how one makes permanent other things besides the information he reads about political, social, and industrial life today and in the past. The reading course is but one part of the citizenship curriculum and hence the curriculum must provide for the proper acquisition of all facts, habits, appreciations, and attitudes that are essential to citizenship.

The evaluation of the social aspects of citizenship training is a probable next step in curriculum research. The problems of the social science-citizenship curriculum are tremendous. We should not present a fair picture of the present status of the secondary social science-citizenship curriculum if we did not note the excellent practices in the training of citizenship within the "reading" courses in the social sciences. The present writer would be last to create the impression that "rote" memorization of textbooks is the prevailing practice in *all* or a *majority* of schools. Even those teachers handicapped by lack of training and equipment are sincerely trying to utilize other agencies besides a mere textbook as a means of giving pupils an adequate acquaintance with the social studies.[6]

The attempts of certain secondary teachers and research workers, both in experimental and public schools, to reorganize courses in the social sciences and citizenship and to adapt school life to the needs of boy and girl citizens are perhaps the most significant evidences of the more progressive theory and practice in citizenship training.[7]

The noteworthy curriculum revision program, now being promoted in a nation-wide cooperative way by the De-

[6]The files of educational periodicals, particularly *The Historical Outlook*, report many interesting "experiments" in organization and methods of teaching the social sciences and citizenship.

[7]The programs of L. C. Marshall and H. C. Hill, of the University of Chicago, Ernest Horn of the State University of Iowa, R. W. Hatch of the Horace Mann School, and the program of Harold Rugg and his associates in the Lincoln School are illustrative of this tendency.

partment of Superintendence of the National Education Association, constitutes further evidence that we are cognizant of a needed reorganization of the social science-citizenship curriculum.

The systematic research summarized in this monograph can well make one optimistic that the application of the result of this research to the curriculum will eventuate in a citizenship curriculum based upon studies of the social and learning needs of boy and girl citizens. And in the opportunities inhering in many further studies like those summarized in this monograph lies in large measure the hope of an improved American citizenship in the future.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENTS

1. Clark, E. M. "The History Curriculum Since 1850." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 11, pp. 58-68 (February, 1920).
2. Cubberley, E. P. *Public Education in the United States.* Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1918.
3. Dawson, Edgar. "The Beginnings of Political Education." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 9, p. 439 (November, 1918).
4. Johnson, Henry. *The Teaching of History in the Elementary and Secondary Schools.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1916.
5. Judd. C. H. "The Teaching of Civics." *The School Review*, Vol. 26, pp. 511-532 (September, 1918).
6. Rugg, Earle. "How the Current Courses in History, Geography, and Civics Came to be What They Are." Twenty-second Yearbook, Part II, Chapter IV. National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Illinois, 1923.
7. Russell, W. F. *The Early Teaching of History in the Secondary Schools of New York and Massachusetts.* The McKinley Publishing Company, Philadelphia, 1915.

B. AIMS, OBJECTIVES, AND VALUES OF THE SOCIAL STUDIES

1. Gold, H. H. "Methods and Content of Courses in History in the High Schools of the United States." *The School Review.* Vol. 25, pp. 88-100, 187-195, 274-282 (February, March, April, 1917).
2. Jones, W. C. *Professional Preparation of Teachers of the Social Sciences in the Secondary School.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colorado, 1925.
3. Koos, L. V. *Administration of Secondary School Units.* Supplementary Educational Monographs, Vol. 1, No. 3. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Illinois, 1917.
4. Osburn, W. J. *Are We Making Good at Teaching History?* Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Illinois, 1926.
5. Rugg, Earle. "Evaluating the Aims and Outcomes of History." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 14, p. 325 (November, 1923).

C. COMMITTEE REPORTS AND COMMITTEE PROCEDURE

1. American Historical Association. *Report of the Committee of Seven on the Study of History in the Secondary Schools.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1899.
2. American Historical Association. *Report of the Committee of Eight on the Study of History in the Elementary Schools.* Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1909.

3. American Historical Association. *Report of the Committee of Five on the Study of History in Secondary Schools.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1912.

4. American Historical Association and the National Education Association. "Reports of a Joint Committee on History and Education for Citizenship." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 10, pp. 273-281 (May, 1919); Vol. 11, pp. 73-83, 111-115 (February, March, 1920); and Vol. 12, pp. 87-98, 119-143, 165-184, and 208-218 (March, April, May, June, 1921).

5. American Political Science Association. *Report on the Teaching of Government.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1916.

6. American Sociological Society. "Tentative Report on the Teaching of Sociology in the Grade and High Schools of America. *The School Review*, Vol. 28, pp. 255-262 (April, 1920).

7. The Association of Collegiate Schools of Business. *Social Studies in Secondary Schools.* University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1922.

8. National Association of Secondary School Principals. "Report of the Committee on Social Studies." *The School Review*, Vol. 28, pp. 282-297 (April, 1920).

9. National Education Association. *Reports of the Committee of Ten on Secondary School Studies with the Reports of the Conferences Arranged by the Committee.* American Book Company, New York, 1894.

10. National Education Association, Committee on Social Studies of the Commission on the Reorganization of Secondary Education. *Report of the Social Studies in Secondary Education.* United States Bureau of Education, Bulletin 28, 1916, Washington, D. C.

11. Rugg, Harold. "Needed Changes in Committee Procedure in Reconstructing the Social Studies." *The Elementary School Journal*, Vol. 21, pp. 688-702 (May, 1921).

12. Rugg, Harold. "How Shall We Construct the Social Studies Curriculum?" *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 12, pp. 247-252 (October, 1921).

13. Schafer, Joseph, and Rugg, Harold. "An Open Letter and a Reply on Method and Aims of Committee Procedure." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 12, pp. 247-252 (October, 1921).

D. QUESTION BLANK AND SURVEY INVESTIGATIONS

1. Brown, M. V. *Analysis of the Social Science Offerings in the State Courses of Study.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, 1926.

2. Davis, C. O. "Training for Citizenship in the North Central Secondary Schools." *The School Review*, Vol. 28, pp. 263-282 (April, 1920).

3. Dawson, Edgar. *The History Inquiry.* The McKinley Publishing Company, Philadelphia, Pa., 1924.

4. Dawson, Edgar. *Preparation of Teachers of the Social Studies for the Secondary Schools.* United States Bureau of Education Bulletin, 1922, No. 3, Washington, D. C.

5. Gambrill, J. M. *Experimental Curriculum Making in the Social Studies.* The McKinley Publishing Company, Philadelphia, Pa., 1924.

6. Gold, H. H. "Methods and Content of Courses in History in the High Schools of the United States." *The School Review,* Vol. 25, pp. 88-100, 187-193, and 274-282 (February, March, April, 1917).

7. Koos, L. V. *Administration of Secondary Units.* Supplementary Educational Monographs, Vol. 1, No. 3. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1917.

8. Moore, H. H. *The Status of Certain Social Studies in the High Schools.* United States Bureau of Education Bulletin, 1922, No. 45, Washington, D. C., 1923.

9. Monroe, W. S. and Foster, I. O. *The Status of the Social Sciences in the High Schools of the North Central Association.* Bulletin 13, Bureau of Research, College of Education, University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill., 1923.

10. Tryon, R. M. *Materials, Methods, and Administration of History Study in the Elementary Schools of the United States.* Indiana University Studies, No. 17, Bloomington, Ind., 1912.

11. Mississippi Valley Historical Association. "Report of the Committee on Standardizing Library Work and Library Equipment for History in Secondary Schools." *The School Review,* Vol. 29, pp. 135-150 (February, 1921).

E. THEORY AND PRACTICE IN CURRICULUM CONSTRUCTION AND THE TEACHING OF SOCIAL SCIENCE-CITIZENSHIP COURSES

1. Bagley, W. C. *Educational Values.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1911.

2. Bagley, W. C. "Principles Underlying Common Elements in the School Program." *School and Home Education,* Vol. 30, pp. 119-131 (December, 1914).

3. Bagley, W. C. and Kyte, G. C. *The California Curriculum Study.* University of California Printing Office, Berkeley, Calif., 1926.

4. Bobbitt, Franklin. *How to Make a Curriculum.* Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1924.

5. Bobbitt, Franklin. *The Curriculum.* Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1918.

6. Bonser, F. G. *The Elementary School Curriculum.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1920.

7. Bourne, H. E. *The Teaching of History and Civics in Elementary and Secondary Schools.* Longmans, Green and Company, New York, 1907.

8. Briggs, T. H. *The Junior High School.* Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1920.

9. Charters, W. W. *Curriculum Construction.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1923.

10. Commission on the Reorganization of Secondary Education. *Cardinal Principles of Secondary Education.* United States Bureau of Education Bulletin, 1918, No. 35, Washington, D. C., 1916.

11. Commission on the Reorganization of Secondary Education. *The Social Studies.* United States Bureau of Education Bulletin, 1916, No. 28, Washington, D. C., 1916.

12. Counts, G. S. *The Senior High School Curriculum.* Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 29. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1926.

13. Department of Superintendence of the National Education Association. *Second Yearbook.* Washington, D. C., 1924; *Third Yearbook,* 1925; *Fifth Yearbook,* 1927; and *Sixth Yearbook,* 1928.

14. Dewey, John. *Democracy and Education.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1916.

15. Flanders, J. K. *Legislative Control of the Elementary Curriculum.* Contributions to Education, No. 195. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

16. Glass, J. M. *Curriculum Practices in the Junior High School and Grades 5 and 6.* Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 25. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1924.

17. Hatch, R. W. *Projects in Citizenship.* The Citizenship Company, 323 Beechwood Place, Leonia, N. J., 1923.

18. Hill, H. C. "Opportunities for Correlation Between Community Life and English." *The School Review,* Vol. 30, pp. 24-36, 118-130, and 175-186 (January, February, March, 1922).

19. Hill, Mabel. *The Teaching of Civics.* Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1914.

20. Holtz, F. L. *Principles and Methods of Teaching Geography.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1921.

21. Johnson, Henry. *The Teaching of History in Elementary and Secondary Schools.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1916.

22. Judd, C. H. "Some Effects of the Expansion of American Education." *The Teachers Journal and Abstract,* Vol. 1, pp. 388-396 (June, 1926).

23. National Society for the Study of Education. "The Social Studies in the Elementary and Secondary Schools." *Twenty-second Yearbook,* Part II, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923.

24. National Society for the Study of Education. "Foundations and Technique of Curriculum Making." *Twenty-sixth Yearbook,* Parts I and II, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926.

25. Parker, S. C. *Methods of Teaching in the High School.* Ginn and Company, Boston, 1915.

26. Rugg, Earle. "Curriculum Construction in the Social Sciences." *Colorado School Journal,* Vol. 39, pp. 5-9 (June, 1924).

27. Rugg, Harold. "A Preface to the Reconstruction of the American School Curriculum." *Teachers College Record,* Vol. 27, pp. 600-606 (March, 1926).

28. Snedden, David. "Teaching of History in Secondary Schools." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 5, p. 278 (November, 1914).

29. Spencer, Herbert. *Education.* A. L. Burt Company, New York (No date given).

30. Stratemeyer, F. B. and Bruner, H. B. *Rating Elementary School Courses of Study.* Studies of the Bureau of Curriculum Research, No. 1. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

31. Tryon, R. M. *The Teaching of History in Junior and Senior High Schools.* Ginn and Company, Boston, 1921.

F. ILLUSTRATIVE STUDIES OF THE DETERMINATION OF PROBLEMS OF CITIZENSHIP

1. Bassett, B. B. "The Content of the Course of Study in Civics." *Seventeenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 63-80, The National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1918.

2. Bixler, G. K. "Social Problems of the Labor Group." Summary and interpretation in Bobbitt, Franklin. *Curriculum Investigations.* Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 31. University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1926.

3. Cocking, W. D. *The Attitude of the Public to the Teaching of Citizenship.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Ia., 1923.

4. Davis, M. B. *Topics to be Included in Instruction in Civics as Indicated by Analysis of Current Periodicals.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1921.

5. Hockett, John. *A Determination of the Major Social Problems of American Life.* Contributions to Education, No. 281. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1927.

6. Nason, J. M. *International Relations as Revealed by Editorials, Cartoons, and Textbooks in American History.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

7. Rugg, Harold. "Problems of Contemporary Life as the Basis for Curriculum Making in the Social Studies." *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, pp. 260-273, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923.

8. Sharon, J. A. "An Analysis of Problems by the Newspaper-Magazine Method." (Title given by the writer of this monograph.) Summarized in Horn, Ernest. "The Application of Research to Making a Course of Study in History." *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, pp. 242-243, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923.

G. ILLUSTRATIVE STUDIES OF THE DETERMINATION OF SOCIALLY VALUABLE FACTS THAT PERTAIN TO CITIZENSHIP

1. Bagley, W. C. "The Determination of Minimum Essentials in Elementary Geography and History." *Fourteenth Yearbook*,

Part I, pp. 131-139, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1915.

2. Bowman, E. C. *A Study in the Objectives in the Teaching of High School Economics.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1922.

3. Branom, M. E. and Reavis, W. C. "The Determination of the Minimal Essentials of Elementary School Geography." *Seventeenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 27-39, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1918.

4. Charters, W. W. "A Short Cut in Tabulation." Summarized in Charters' *Curriculum Construction*, pp. 270-272.

5. Dodd, L. H. "History in Poetry." *Journal of Educational Research*, Vol. 4, pp. 294-300 (November, 1921).

6. Horn, Ernest. "Possible Defects in the Present Content of American History as Taught in the Schools." *Sixteenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 156-172, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1917.

7. Marston, L. R., McKown, H. C. and Bagley, W. C. "A Method of Determining Misplacements of Emphasis in Seventh and Eighth Grade History." *Seventeenth Yearbook*, Part I, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1918.

8. Peters, C. C.. "Detailed Analysis of One Objective of Cultural Education." Published in Peters' *Foundations of Educational Sociology*, pp. 419-424. The Macmillan Company, New York, 1924.

9. Rugg, Harold, and Hockett, John. *Objective Studies in Map Location.* Social Science Monographs, No. 1. The Lincoln School of Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1924.

10. Swisher, J. A. "The Historical Information Essential for the Intelligent Understanding of Civic Problems." *Seventeenth Yearbook*, Part I, pp. 81-89, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1918.

11. Thomas, J. B. *A Study in Minimal Essentials of Geography for the Elementary Schools.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Indiana, Bloomington, Ind., 1919.

12. Washburne, C. W. "Basic Facts Needed in History and Geography: A Statistical Investigation." *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, pp. 216-233, National Society for the Study of Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923.

13. Whitbeck, R. H. "Where Shall We Lay the Emphasis in Teaching Geography?" *Education*, Vol. 31, pp. 108-116 (October, 1910).

14. Williams, B. M. *A Critical Study of Possible Methods of Evaluating Biographies for the Purpose of Curriculums in the Social Studies.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Ia., 1926.

15. Wooters, J. E. "Elementary American History Standards—Results of an Investigation Carried on to Determine the Most Important Dates for Memorizing in the Elementary School." *School and Home Education*, Vol. 34, pp. 152-155 (December, 1914).

H. ILLUSTRATIVE STUDIES OF THE ACTIVITIES AND MODES OF LIVING OF CITIZENS

1. Alderman, G. H. "What the Iowa Layman Should Know about about Courts and Law." *The School Review*, Vol. 30, pp. 360-364 (May, 1922).

2. Bobbitt, Franklin. *Curriculum Investigations.* Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 31. University of Chicago Press, Chicago, Ill., 1926.

3. Bobbitt, Franklin. *How to Make a Curriculum*, Chapter VII, "The Social Studies." Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1924.

4. Bobbitt, Franklin and Others. "Qualities of Conduct." *Curriculum Investigations*, Chapter X.

5. Breeze, R. E. "What Constitutes Good Citizenship " *The School Review*, Vol. 32, pp. 534-536 (September, 1924).

6. Dulebohn, I. H. *Civic and Social Deficiencies as Indications of Citizenship Objectives.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

7. Goss, R. R. *What Civic Knowledge Is Needed by an Indiana Layman.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Indiana, Bloomington, Ind., 1923.

8. Harap, Henry. *Education of the Consumer.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1924.

9. Horn, Ernest. "A Study of Library Withdrawals and Books Published." (Title given by the writer.) Found in Horn's article. "The Application of Methods of Research to Making the Course of Study in History." *Twenty-second Yearbook*, Part II, pp. 235-239, National Society for the Study of Education, Public Schools Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1923.

10. Lorenzen, C. H. *Approved Social Behavior as Revealed by Recent Literature.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

11. Mahan, T. J. *Duties, Difficulties and Qualities of Citizens.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colo., 1925.

12. Mort, P. R. and Devricks, R. K. "An Accounting of General Values in a Small High School Curriculum." *The School Review*, Vol. 29, pp. 119-134 (February, 1921).

13. Nietz, J. A. "Duties and Traits of a Good Citizen." Found in Bobbitt, Franklin. *Curriculum Investigations.* Chapter VII.

14. Palmer, P. L. "The Evidence from the Literary Digest." Found in Bobbitt, Franklin. *Curriculum Investigations*, Chapter VI.

15. Rugg, Earle. "A Further Study of Library Withdrawals and Books Published." Found in author's unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1923.

16. Snedden, David. *Civic Education.* World Book Company, Yonkers, N. Y., 1922.

17. Wells, C. O. *The Political Science of Everyday Life as Revealed by Analyses of Newspapers and Periodicals.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1925.

I. ILLUSTRATIVE ANALYSES OF TYPICAL SOCIAL SCIENCE TEXTBOOKS

1. Bagley, W. C. and Rugg, Harold. *The Content of American History as Taught in the Seventh and Eighth Grades—an Analysis of Typical School Textbooks.* Bulletin 16, School of Education, University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill., 1916.

2. Bowman, E. C. *A Study in the Objectives in the Teaching of High School Economics.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1922.

3. Brooks, T. D. *A Study of Present Practice in the Teaching of Civics as Indicated by Textbooks and Other Teaching Materials.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1920.

4. Dahl, E. J. *An Analysis of Senior High School Textbooks in the Social Sciences.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minn., 1926.

5. Evans, G. A. *The Place Element in Social Science Textbooks.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1923.

6. Hubbell, J. B. *A Suggested Plan for the Reorganization of History Material in Secondary Schools.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, George Peabody College for Teachers, Nashville, Tenn., 1922.

7. National Council for the Social Studies. "Textbooks in the Social Studies." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 17, pp. 334-341 (November, 1926).

8. Ridgeley, D. C. "Twelve Hundred Selected Place Names." *Journal of Geography*, Vol. 25, pp. 201-221 (September, 1926).

9. Rugg, Earle. "An Analysis of Social Science Textbooks." Found in author's unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1923.

10. Snyder, R. H. *An Analysis of the Content of Elementary and High School History Texts.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1919.

11. Wang, F. C. *An Analytical Study of Elementary Geography Textbooks in America.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., 1918.

J. PSYCHOLOGICAL STUDIES RELATING TO THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

1. Ayer. A. M. *Some Difficulties in Elementary School History.* Contributions to Education, No. 212. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

2. Freeman, F. N. *How Children Learn.* Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1917.

3. Gates, A. I. "The Psychological Versus the Chronological in the Teaching of History." *The Historical Outlook,* Vol. 11, pp. 227-230 (May, 1920).

4. Judd, C. H. *Psychology of Secondary Education.* Ginn and Company, Boston, 1927.

5. Judd, C. H. *Psychology of Social Institutions.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1926.

6. Mathews, C. O. *The Grade Placement of Curriculum Materials in the Social Studies.* Contributions to Education, No. 241. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1926.

7. Meltzer, Hyman. *Children's Social Concepts.* Contributions to Education, No. 192. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1925.

K. STUDIES ILLUSTRATING THE MEASUREMENTS OF THEORETICAL OBJECTIVES OF CITIZENSHIP

1. Bell, J. C. and McCullom, J. F. "A Study of Attainments of Pupils in United States History." *Journal of Educational Psychology,* Vol. 8, pp. 257-274 (May, 1917).

2. Buckingham, B. R. "Correlation Between Ability to Think and Ability to Remember, with Special Reference to United States History." *School and Society,* Vol. 5, pp. 443-449 (April 14, 1917).

3. Chassell, C. F., Upton, S. M., and Chassell, L. M. "Short Scales for Measuring Habits of Good Citizenship." *Teachers College Record,* Vol. 23, pp. 57-79 (January, 1922).

4. Elston, Bertha. "Improving the Teaching of History in the High School Through the Use of Tests." *The Historical Outlook,* Vol. 14, pp. 300-305 (November, 1923).

5. Finch, C. E. "Junior High School Study Tests." *The School Review,* Vol. 28, pp. 220-226 (March, 1920).

6. Goodrich, L. P. *An Evaluation of Standard Tests in Geography.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wis., 1923.

7. Hand, Effie. *An Evaluation of Civic Habits.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colo., 1926.

8. Hirsch, E. C. *A Study to Determine the Causes Underlying Differences in Attainment in United States History.* Unpublished Master of Philosophy Thesis, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wis., 1920.

9. The History Inquiry. "Report of an Experiment with a Test Carried on by the History Inquiry Committee." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 15, pp. 260-268 (June, 1924).

10. Monroe, W. S. "Written Examinations and Their Improvement." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 14, pp. 306-318 (November, 1923).

11. Osburn, W. J. *Are We Making Good at Teaching History?* Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926.

12. Rugg, Earle. "Character and Value of Standardized Tests in History." *The School Review*, Vol. 27, pp. 757-771 (December, 1919).

13. Rugg, Earle. "Evaluating the Aims and Outcomes of History." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 14, pp. 325-326 (November, 1923).

14. Stevenson, P. R. "Minimum Essentials in Place Geography." *Journal of Educational Research*, Vol. 6, pp. 300-306 (November, 1922).

15. Thorndike, E. L. *The Teacher's Word Book.* Bureau of Publications, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1921.

16. Tryon, R. M. "Standard and New Type Tests in the Social Studies." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 18, pp. 172-178 (April, 1927).

17. Upton, S. M. and Chassell, C. F. "A Scale for Measuring the Importance of Habits of Good Citizenship." *Teachers College Record*, Vol. 20, pp. 36-65 (January, 1919).

18. Vincent, P. M. *A Comparative Study of Standard Tests in United States History.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wis., 1921.

19. Voelker, P. F. *The Function of Ideals in Social Education.* Contributions to Education, No. 112. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1921.

L. EXTRA-CURRICULAR ACTIVITIES

1. Foster, C. R. *Extra-Curricular Activities in the High School.* Johnson Publishing Company, Richmond, Va., 1925.

2. Fretwell, E. K. *Extra-Curricular Activities.* In preparation.

3. King, Irving. *Social Aspects of Education.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1910.

4. National Society for the Study of Education. "Extra-Curricular Activities." *Twenty-fifth Yearbook*, Part II, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1926.

5. McKown, Harry. *Extra-Curricular Activities.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1927.

6. Thomas-Tindel, E. V. and Myers, J. D. *Junior High School Life.* The Macmillan Company, New York, 1924.

7. Terry, P. W. *Extra-Curricular Activities.* Warwick and York, Inc., Baltimore, Md., 1926.

8. Wilds, E. H. *Extra-Curricular Activities.* The Century Company, New York, 1926.

M. PROFESSIONAL PREPARATION OF TEACHERS IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES AND CITIZENSHIP

1. Dawson, Edgar. *Preparation of Teachers of the Social Studies for the Secondary Schools.* Bulletin 3, 1922. United States Bureau of Education, Washington, D. C., 1922.

2. Jones, W. C. *Professional Preparation of Teachers of the Social Sciences in the Secondary Schools.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colo., 1925.

3. Mississippi Valley Historical Association. "Report of the Committee on Standardizing Library Work and Library Equipment." *The School Review*, Vol. 29, pp. 135-150 (March, 1921).

4. Mississippi Valley Historical Association. "Report of the Relation of Normal Schools and Teachers Colleges to High School Teaching." *The Historical Outlook*, Vol. 7, pp. 244-248 (September, 1916).

5. Rugg, E. U. and Dearborn, N. H. *The Social Studies in Teachers Colleges and Normal Schools.* Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colorado, 1928.

6. Wrinkle, W. L. *Social Values in the Professional Preparation of Teachers.* Unpublished Master of Arts Thesis, Colorado State Teachers College, Greeley, Colo., 1924.